Splice

Splice

The Journal of Undergraduate Scholarship at SDSU College of Arts and Letters

The 2025 issue of *Splice, The Journal of Undergraduate Scholarship* at SDSU College of Arts and Letters, is managed, edited, and produced by undergraduates in the College of Arts and Letters, SDSU. *Splice*, Spring 2025 issue, is Volume 8 in the series.

FIRST EDITION

A Letter from the 2024-2025 Editorial Board

Dear reader,

The College of Arts and Letters (CAL) is a diverse community encompassing various disciplines in the humanities and social sciences. Undergraduate research in these fields is often overlooked, and getting started in the creative writing industry is challenging too. *Splice: The Journal of Undergraduate Scholarship* is committed to uplifting the CAL community by publishing its students' work. In this way, *Splice* helps move undergraduates towards success in both academic and future professional settings.

Both undergraduate research and creative activity are an integral part of the overall San Diego State University experience. By shining a light on CAL's efforts, *Splice* is grateful for the opportunity to have contributed to SDSU's recent recognition as an "R1" or top-tier research university. Furthermore, SDSU is the first and only R1 institution in the California State University system.

Since receiving its Recognized Student Organization status in the 2023-2024 academic year, the Editorial Board has turned this publication into more than just a platform for student work. *Splice* has grown into a community of people passionate about promoting undergraduate voices and fostering an educational community for professional development. Our journal has exponentially grown in the number of submissions and student involvement since 2023, and we hope it expands further. Additionally, we have continuously promoted student learning through various developmental workshops such as our annual Copyediting and Publishing Workshop and Resume Workshop. *Splice* was also nationally recognized this year by the Council on Undergraduate Research, an organization that supports undergraduate research and creative programs on various campuses across the United States. *Splice* hopes to continue this growth and expand into a campus wide journal. As a journal for students by students, we pride ourselves on showcasing the academic and creative work conducted by undergraduates. The published work in Volume 8 encompasses the underlying theme of transformation. From research about creating more renewable energy to an exploration of the evolution of Disney princesses to a poem about change, there is something for everyone.

Splice would not be possible without the students and contributors who have helped this publication grow. We are especially thankful for our faculty mentor, Dr. Elisa (EJ) Sobo, who got *Splice* up and running again after its hiatus from 2019-2022, encouraging students to rebuild this scholarly journal for CAL. The Editorial Board would also like to thank the authors for their continuous work throughout the year to be published. We thank our collective team members: the developmental editors, copy editors, peer-reviewers, public relations team, and finance team. Additionally, thank you to the Faculty Advisory Board and SDSU Press for their guidance throughout the publication process. Lastly, we thank the Dean's Office for their continued support for *Splice* and the students behind it.

Sincerely,

The 2024-25 Editorial Board

Developmental Editors

Justin Deppiesse
International Security & Conflict Resolution and International Business-Chinese
Zora Henegan
Political Science
Jessalyn Hernandez
English & Comparative Literature and Marketing
Ines Liameche
Sociology and Television, Film, & New Media
Natalie Ponce
Creative Writing (MFA)
Raine Porath
Liberal Arts & Sciences (MFA)
Amilya Robinson
English & Comparative Literature
Maria Zaragoza
English & Comparative Literature

Copyeditors

Natalie Bishop
English & Comparative Literature and Spanish
Lucy Breitwiser
English & Comparative Literature (MFA)
Justin Deppiesse
International Security & Conflict Resolution and International Business-Chinese
London Hultgren
English & Comparative Literature
Raine Porath
Liberal Arts & Sciences (MALAS)

Peer Reviewers

Lucy Breitwiser
English & Comparative Literature (MFA)
Mikayla Culling
Psychology

Teal Davis
Journalism & Media Studies
Kallen Dun
English & Comparative Literature
Zora Heneghan
Political Science
Jessalyn Hernandez
English & Comparative Literature and Marketing
London Hultgren
English & Comparative Literature
Ines Liameche
Sociology and Television, Film, & New Media
Brianna Lucas
English & Comparative Literature
Benson Pham
Political Science
Raine Porath
Liberal Arts & Sciences (MFA)
Emma Robbins
Sociology and Psychology
Amilya Robinson
English & Comparative Literature
Joshua Silla
Journalism & Media Studies
Chloe Wendling
Journalism & Media Studies
Laia Williams
English & Comparative Literature

Public Relations Team

Zora Heneghan
Political Science
London Hultgren
English & Comparative Literature
Leia Nunez
Criminal Justice
Andrew Oliver
English & Comparative Literature
Celina Ramirez
History
Kian Riggan
Philosophy

Faculty Advisory Board

Quentin Bailey, *English & Comparative Literature*

Steve Barbone, *Philosophy*

Benjamin Gonzalez O'Brien, *Political Science*

David Kamper, *American Indian Studies*

Amanda Kearney, *Anthropology*

Minjeong Kim, *Sociology*

Charmane Perry, *Africana Studies*

Esra Tunc, *Religion*

Faculty Mentors

Amanda Beardsley, *Women's, Gender, and Sexuality Studies*

Claire Colquitt, *English & Comparative Literature*

Tracy Cummings, *English & Comparative Literature*

Amanda Kearney, *Anthropology*

Heidi Keller-Lapp, *History*

Nicole Mathwich, *Anthropology*

Cheryl O'Brien, *Political Science*

Charmane Perry, *Africana Studies*

Matthew Rowe, *Sociology*

Table of Contents

The Past as a Looking Glass: Critiquing Ecological Baselines for Restoration Using Archaeological Data

Dalila Ramirez

Department of Anthropology

Abstract

Rewilding and environmental conservation efforts often rely on ecological baselines to guide restoration, yet these baselines are marked by ambiguity and shifting interpretations among researchers. This study critically examines ecological baselines through interdisciplinary perspectives, drawing on anthropology, historical ecology, ecology, and archaeology to analyze their construction and application. By doing this study, this paper seeks to offer new perspectives on ecological baselines and conservation through a transdisciplinary approach. Anthropological insights from historical ecology provide a nuanced understanding of past human-environment interactions, offering a lens through which to evaluate modern conservation efforts. This work emphasizes the need for reflexivity and care in adopting baselines as conservation tools, contributing to ongoing debates about ecological restoration's goals and methodologies. By integrating perspectives across disciplines, this study seeks to enhance conservation practices and encourage more historically informed strategies for ecological stewardship.

Keywords: baselines, historical ecology, applied zooarchaeology, rewilding

Introduction

As the world progresses further into the Anthropocene, humanity is faced with the reality of damaged and minimized ecosystems, leaving ecologists to scrub away stains of industry and anthropogenic impact. The hope is to leave a ghost of a scar rather than the deep gash currently etched in the environment. Yet, as infrastructure continues to expand and urbanization continues to reach different corners of the globe, ecologists and conservationists are left to grapple with what is left of ecosystems. Ecologists and conservationists are increasingly looking to the past for guidance for how to restore and manage ecosystems altered by human activity, and this is where archaeological and historical data are uniquely situated to help contemporary problems. Historical ecology, the study of reconstructing past ecosystems from historical data, is a theoretical framework used as a tool for reconstructing the past. Historical ecology allows ecologists to build an ecological baseline or a reference towards past ecosystem health (Beller et al., 2020). Historical ecology, as traditionally framed in anthropology, emphasizes materialist interpretations of the interactions between humans and their environments—an appealing

lens for archaeologists. William Balée (1998, 2018) articulated its core principles: humans have modified nearly all ecosystems, societies shape their environments uniquely according to their distinct logics, human activities broadly maintain species diversity, and the cumulative effects of these transformations define global ecology. Not tied to specific methods or theories, historical ecology integrates data varying from flora and fauna to geochemistry and stratigraphy, offering tools for tackling conservation challenges (Braje and Rick, 2013; Wolverton and Lyman, 2012). Its reliance on extended temporal perspectives connects Indigenous traditions with their ancestral environments, challenging Eurocentric postcolonial narratives. It is these data and traditions that can be woven together to create a new baseline to heal ecosystems; however, the concept and creation of a baseline is not without its challenges.

An ecological baseline represents an idea of what a healthy ecosystem looks like and what should be the goal for conservation efforts. Ecological baselines set standards and values around past levels of biodiversity. Frequently, conservation baselines emphasize natural landscapes free of human influence. This understanding of ecological baselines is often incorporated into conservation efforts such as ecological restoration and rewilding (Pinnegar and Engelhard 2008). However, there is a level of ambiguity between ecological baselines rooted within the subjectivity of the research aims. The idea of what a natural landscape *should* look like can vary based on where and when a baseline is set. A natural landscape can be constituted either by the by the exclusion or inclusion of human influence. A natural landscape can be decided on a varied temporal scale, one that includes humans or industry. Given the inherent ambiguity of these baselines, I argue that efforts should not focus on returning to the past but rather on using historical insights to shape a sustainable future. Historical ecology serves a valuable purpose in understanding human-environment interactions and providing guidance on future interactions. However, using ecological baselines as a map to return climates to the past lies in ambiguity. Historical data should be used as a reference rather than a guide for reconstructing ecosystems and incorporate archaeological data for a holistic understanding of the ecosystems.

In the context of the Anthropocene, historical ecology offers invaluable insights into past human-environment interactions, yet the ambiguity in ecological baselines challenges their use as definitive targets for restoration. Instead of striving to recreate a "pristine" past state, conservation efforts should embrace a more nuanced, forward-thinking approach that integrates archaeological data, traditional ecological knowledge (TEK), and post-humanist perspectives, ultimately leading to a progressive vision of ecological restoration that acknowledges humanity's longstanding relationship with ecosystems. This essay will explore how historical ecology, TEK, and archaeological data can inform ecological baselines. Additionally, this essay will discuss how historical ecology and anthropological data can provide a post-humanist perspective on human-environment interactions.

Historical ecology and the new rewilding paradigm

Historical ecology is a burgeoning interdisciplinary field utilizing techniques from archival research within the context of ecology. Historical ecologists use historical maps, newspapers, diaries, logbooks, museum specimens, and so forth as tools for reconstructing past ecosystems and past levels of biodiversity (Beller et al. 2020). In one instance of applied historical ecology in research, tax documents and bank records from 1650-1950 were used to reconstruct a series of Mediterranean tuna catches. Another example of applied historical ecology includes the analysis of diaries from *conquistadores*, missionaries, and naturalists as data to provide levels of biodiversity in the Gulf of Mexico from the 16th to 19th century. Similarly, the International Whaling Commission will reconstruct population dynamics of whales by referencing historical catches of ship logbooks from the 18th and 19th century. Applied historical ecology can also include utilizing ancient art to provide information on ecosystem dynamics of that time period. Tombs, mosaics, pottery, and frescoes from Ancient Rome, Greece, and Egypt have clear depictions of wildlife and marine life useful for ecologists. (Pinnegar and Engelhard 2008). These past references of ecosystem not only aid in reconstructions of past biodiversity but also human subsistence and resource exploitation.

In one case study on the extinction of the Caribbean monk seal, data was gathered from archaeology, diaries from pirates, and other forms of historical records to reconstruct the population levels of the Caribbean monk seal. The Caribbean monk seal was hunted to extinction and the reconstruction of the seal's population structure allows for a greater understanding of the animal's behavior, reproductive habits, and geographic range. It also provides more context on the current state of those coral reefs and the decline of biomass in the reefs. Lastly, it provides data that can be used to understand modern endangered populations like the Hawaiian monk seal and how population structures can be depleted (McClenachan and Cooper 2008). Historical ecology is unique in that it not only provides ecological data but context on human interactions towards the environment. Analyzing historical ecology utilizes transdisciplinary thinking which can be beneficial towards navigating current human-environment interactions.

Historical ecological methods play a foundational role in constructing ecological baselines and informing self-restoration targets (Beller et al. 2020). Within restoration methods, anthropology and archaeology can provide tangible evidence of past human-environment interactions and reveal how societies managed resources and adapted to ecological changes. Together, these approaches enrich the construction of ecological baselines, ensuring they are not only historically grounded but also culturally informed and ecologically relevant.

Ecological restoration vs. rewilding

Ecological restoration often relies on ecological baselines to guide reintroduction of species to ecosystems. Ecologists and conservationists may look towards a specific historical baseline as a model for what ecosystems

looked like, ideally before severe anthropogenic influence altered them (Nogués-Bravo et al. 2016). However, the idea that ecosystems existed in a "pristine" state prior to human activity may overlook the fact that many ecosystems have been shaped by millennia of human-environment interactions (Silva et al. 2022). The recent conservation trend toward restoration efforts is one where ecological baselines are the benchmarks for species reintroductions. However, as the current climate shifts and environment evolves, many historic baselines used as a guideline were under different, irreplicable, environmental conditions (Pinnegar and Engelhard 2008). Therefore, to use baselines as an exact guide for reintroductions would be impacted by the different environmental conditions apparent today.

Rewilding is a conservation strategy that works to restore ecosystems by focusing on reintroductions and the maintenance of ecological processes. Rewilding utilizes a top-down approach by introducing keystone species (Nogués-Bravo et al. 2016). What differentiates rewilding processes is the inclusion of progressive themes. Rewilding seeks to include themes of deep ecology, ecotourism, human-nature relationships, and bushcraft (Carver et al. 2021). Rewilding utilizes a "top-down" approach by introducing large keystone species hoping to control lower levels of trophic interactions. One case study reintroduced sea otters in an area where they were previously locally extinct to provoke growth in the kelp forests. Sea otters would then eat the sea urchins therefore allowing for more kelp to grow (Nogués-Bravo et al. 2016). Rewilding marks a shift towards maintaining ecosystems through cultivating natural mutualistic processes (Carver et al. 2021). What differs rewilding from previous restoration methods is its emphasis on cultivating interspecies interactions and coexistence.

Rewilding is seen as a form of positive environmentalism in achieving restoration. In the case of rewilding in Europe, it's said the practice of rewilding is often theory-led rather than "evidence-based" (Hart, Haigh, and Ciuti 2023). However, rewilding can be used as a progressive and dynamic approach to restoration since it focuses on ecological function versus on ecological baselines. Rewilding will still reference past levels of biodiversity and geographic range. However, instead of seeking to replicate past ecosystems, rewilding seeks to restore ecological function by focusing on mutualisms between organisms (Kaiser-Bunbury, Traveset, and Hansen 2010). Rewilding's use of theory and deep ecology allows for a more progressive and post-humanist view of ecology.

The Shifting Baseline Phenomena

Ecological baselines are constructed as reference points representing the health and structure of past ecosystems prior to anthropogenic influence. Ecological baselines tend to focus on periods of time where human influence is perceived as minimal and aims to represent a healthy ecosystem. However, baselines are not universal throughout ecological literature. Baselines can vary from pre-industrial times, pre-Colombian eras, or late Pleistocene states, depending on the research aims of the project (Pinnegar and Engelhard 2008). Ecological baselines tend to be a response to different cultural contexts, ecological

habitats, and overall research objectives. Due to the variety of factors that contribute to an ecological baseline, methodological challenges and varied time scales may arise.

Different perceptions and temporal frameworks significantly shape how baselines are constructed. Historical ecology often focuses on ecosystems before industrialization, aiming to understand changes brought by industry (Beller et al. 2020). Archaeological data may emphasize pre-colonial ecosystems, highlighting shifts caused by colonization and its environmental impacts (Jackson et al. 2001). In contrast, palaeoecological studies extend even further back, reconstructing ecosystems from pre-anatomically and behaviorally modern human impact (Silva et al. 2022). Daniel Pauly points out that many marine scientists accept the ecological baselines seen at the beginning of their career as the baselines to measure subsequent changes in their career (Pinnegar and Engelhard 2008). These varied temporal scales illustrate how baselines are inherently tied to the specific objectives and temporal preferences in research. For instance, one project might emphasize a pre-industrial baseline, while a different initiative could adopt a Pleistocene baseline to guide species reintroduction. Each perspective offers valuable insights but also introduces ambiguity, as these baselines are not universally agreed upon and can shift depending on the ecological and cultural lens applied.

While baselines are beneficial, their application must be holistic, emphasizing adaptability over rigid restoration to a specific historical state. They provide snapshots of biodiversity and ecosystem functions before significant anthropogenic changes, offering guidance for restoration and conservation, not a rule book. Anthropological data and perspectives can still be helpful in a progressive construction of ecology and restoration—particularly within historical ecology, archaeological data, and TEK (Wolverton, Figueroa, and Armstrong 2023). A transdisciplinary approach towards the construction of ecological baselines can allow for more progressive restoration and conservation.

Practical applications of archaeological and ethnographic datasets

The role of archaeological data can provide valuable insight into past human-nature interactions. It provides information on how humans and the environment have shaped each other as co-evolving systems of being. Archaeology can provide information on how humans have responded to climate change, shaped the environment, and exploited natural resources (Silva et al. 2022, Rivera-Collazo 2022). Environmental archaeology especially highlights an interdisciplinary approach. Environmental archaeologists are trained under both scientific principles and anthropological principles allowing for a cross-disciplinary lens of analyzing ecological systems (Wolverton, Figueroa, and Armstrong 2023). Environmental archaeologists and ethnobiologists must maintain awareness of their western approach of science and the environmental identity maintained in indigenous contexts. Many archaeologists also participate in community archaeology, fostering collaboration with local communities and the science being conducted

(Wolverton, Figueroa, and Armstrong 2023). Environmental archaeology has the capacity to include interdisciplinary scientific methods in addition to a progressive vision of ecology.

Environmental archaeology includes applications of zooarchaeology – the analysis of faunal remains in archaeological sites. Zooarchaeology in ecology will often be applied through restoration (Wolverton and Lyman 2012). Zooarchaeology provides a unique point of view on the time depth of ecosystems and biodiversity. It can also be used to provide a reference of which taxa to reintroduce to ecosystems. The zooarchaeological record also provides insight as to why the organism is threatened and how that contributes to modern dilemmas (Lyman n.d.). There is a lack of historical data in marine science, particularly in fisheries (Pinnegar and Engelhard 2008). However, humans have been impacting and influencing marine ecosystems for centuries and archaeological data provides context to past marine ecosystems. Marine fishing is considered to have developed late in human history. However, archaeological data demonstrates that early economies in Southern California incorporated marine shellfish, sea mammals, fish, and birds. Marine resources have been exploited in some capacity over the past 12,000 years. (Rick, Erlandson, and Vellanoweth 2001). This demonstrates progressive transdisciplinary methods through the incorporation of archaeological data in marine science. It also demonstrates the long-lasting relationship between humanity and seascapes.

TEK is a term used to describe indigenous knowledge or local knowledge of an area. TEK can be a source of local knowledge of landscapes and a source of sustainable cohabitation between humans and nature (Wolverton, Figueroa, and Armstrong 2023). TEK can also offer an alternative understanding for ecological baselines and the idea of an "untouched" landscape. Landscapes have the capacity to involve humans as participants in a mutual relationship with nature. Marine scientists studying shark fishing and shark vulnerability in Campeche, Mexico looked towards the local fisherman for ecological knowledge. The local fishermen provided information about the range and population of sharks from 1940, the industrialization periods of 1980, and post-industrialization in 1999-2018 (Martínez-Candelas et al. 2020). The local fisherman also provided information on how local fishing practices have impacted the local economy and the shark-fisherman relationship within the region. The TEK in this instance provided more information on the legacy and history of shark fishing in the region in addition to shark vulnerability and population dynamics. TEK encourages Western scientists to reconsider baselines that exclude human influence. Restoring these ecosystems to a pre-human baseline would not only be difficult but would risk undermining existing ecological relationships and local economies. Conservation strategies embracing transdisciplinary approaches would allow for a more holistic ecological understanding.

A Post-Humanist Approach to Ecology

In ecological baseline discussions, a core point of discussion is the distinction between anthropogenically-caused changes and natural changes within

ecosystems. The concept of an untouched environment often alludes to one free of human influence or interference. Studies in ecology will strive to return the environment to an "untouched" baseline representative of minimal or no human influence. However, this notion is complicated by the reality of human-nature relationships. Humans have been influencing ecosystems for thousands of years and will continue to do so (Silva et al. 2022). Humans and the ecosystem are not two separate systems but rather coevolving systems of beings influencing each other. Indigenous land use practices, for example, have created unique ecosystem dynamics that cannot be separated from "natural processes." As demonstrated by sweetgrass, some organisms thrive with human interference. Sweetgrass is a sacred plant to the Potawatomi people, and it's often harvested and cared for by Indigenous peoples. It has been studied that sweetgrass grows and prospers in harvested areas compared to areas left untouched from anthropogenic influence (Kimmerer, 2013). Sweetgrass demonstrates a mutually beneficial and harmonious relationship between humans and nature. It also demonstrates the incorporation of Indigenous science and TEK in Western science.

A post-humanist approach to ecology allows for ecological restoration that includes all components of an ecosystem, including human involvement. This perspective challenges the notion of an ecological baseline or a specific past state that ecosystems should return to. The philosophy of Dark Ecology suggests that the earth and its ecosystems resemble a Möbius strip – continuous and never-ending (Morton, 2016). Within ecological restoration, it is important to recognize the constant changing nature ecosystems engage in. Factors like temperature shifts, local economies, urban development, and extinction are all components of modern ecosystems. Dark Ecology suggests the acceptance of living in a mesh. A mesh represents all the components, living and non-living, that make up an ecosystem. This includes plants, animals, humans, pollution, cars, mushrooms, mountains, and so forth. A mesh is complicated and messy, but all the separate components shape the ecosystem in one way or another. The idea of a pure untouched ecosystem does not exist; humans have always touched the earth in one way or another. Humans have been meshed with the environment for as long as humanity has existed, making a baseline prior to human influence unattainable.

This approach does not ignore the severe anthropogenic impact or exploitation of resources in natural landscapes. However, "it is not the decline of species diversity per se that scientists, conservationists, and restoration managers should be most concerned about, but rather the interactions between organisms that breathe life into ecosystems" (Kaiser-Bunbury, Traveset, and Hansen, 2010). Historical ecology and environmental archaeology continue to provide valuable information on human-environment interactions, vulnerability of species, and population dynamics (Wolverton, Figueroa, and Armstrong, 2023). However, restoration efforts should focus on interspecies interactions and prioritize forward thinking rather than aiming to replicate past ecological states. Advocating for a post-humanist approach to historical ecology also means envisioning the possibility of a harmonious relationship between humans and the environment. Despite humanity's mesh with "weird" ecological loops and cycles of exploitation, historical ecology can provide

insight on fostering environmental harmony. TEK and certain historical examples exemplify the potential for a coexistence between humanity and nature. Ecological restoration, with a holistic approach, has the potential to nurture the human-environment relationship.

Conclusion

The past as a looking glass alludes to using past environmental states as a reference towards today's ecological issues. But a mirror only offers a reflection, and to use the past is to not replicate it but to better understand contemporary issues. Historical ecology can be a reference in recognizing and understanding human-environment relationships and allows for a holistic understanding of ecological restoration. However, the concept of ecological baselines is fraught with ambiguity, as it hinges on subjective choices about what constitutes a "natural" or "pristine" state. These baselines vary widely, reflecting different temporal, cultural, and ecological contexts, and often obscure the long-standing role of humans as active participants in ecosystems. The incorporation of anthropological perspectives and archaeological data into ecological restoration would allow for indigenous science and TEK in ecology.

Instead of replicating the past, modern ecology must focus on mutualistic interactions between species. A post-humanist perspective further reframes restoration as a collaborative system between humans and the environment, recognizing the interconnectedness of all ecosystem components. By embracing this integrated approach, ecological restoration can move beyond replicating baselines and instead foster a harmonious and sustainable relationship between humanity and the natural world; an ecological future where both human and non-human life can thrive in a balanced coexistence through transdisciplinary approaches. By using the past to inform, restoration efforts can craft adaptive and forward-thinking strategies that honor ecological complexity while addressing challenges of biodiversity loss and climate change.

Acknowledgements

References

Beller, E. E., McClenachan, L., Zavaleta, E. S., & Larsen, L. G. (2020). Past forward: Recommendations from historical ecology for ecosystem management. *Global Ecology and Conservation, 21*, e00836. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gecco.2019.e00836

Carver, S., Convery, I., Hawkins, S., Beyers, R., Eagle, A., Kun, Z., Van Maanen, E., Cao, Y., Fisher, M., Edwards, S. R., Nelson, C., Gann, G. D., Shurter, S., Aguilar, K., Andrade, A., Ripple, W. J., Davis, J., Sinclair, A., Bekoff, M., … Soulé, M. (2021). Guiding principles for rewilding. *Conservation Biology, 35*(6), 1882–1893. https://doi.org/10.1111/cobi.13730

Hart, E. E., Haigh, A., & Ciuti, S. (2023). A scoping review of the scientific evidence base for rewilding in Europe. *Biological Conservation*, *285*, 110243. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biocon.2023.110243

Jackson, J. B. C., Kirby, M. X., Berger, W. H., Bjorndal, K. A., Botsford, L. W., Bourque, B. J., Bradbury, R. H., Cooke, R., Erlandson, J., Estes, J. A., Hughes, T. P., Kidwell, S., Lange, C. B., Lenihan, H. S., Pandolfi, J. M., Peterson, C. H., Steneck, R. S., Tegner, M. J., & work(s):, R. R. W. R. (2001). Historical Overfishing and the Recent Collapse of Coastal Ecosystems. *Science, New Series*, *293*(5530), 629–638.

Kaiser-Bunbury, C. N., Traveset, A., & Hansen, D. M. (2010). Conservation and restoration of plant–animal mutualisms on oceanic islands. *Perspectives in Plant Ecology, Evolution and Systematics*, *12*(2), 131–143. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ppees.2009.10.002

Kimmerer, R. W. (2013). *Braiding Sweetgrass: Indigenous Wisdom, Scientific Knowledge and the Teachings of Plants*. Milkweed Editions.

Lyman, R. L. (n.d.). *Applied Zooarchaeology: The Relevance of Faunal Analysis to Wildlife Management*.

Martínez-Candelas, I. A., Pérez-Jiménez, J. C., Espinoza-Tenorio, A., McClenachan, L., & Méndez-Loeza, I. (2020). Use of historical data to assess changes in the vulnerability of sharks. *Fisheries Research*, *226*, 105526. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fishres.2020.105526

McClenachan, L., & Cooper, A. B. (2008). Extinction rate, historical population structure and ecological role of the Caribbean monk seal. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences*, *275*(1641), 1351–1358. https://doi.org/10.1098/rspb.2007.1757

Morton, T. (2016). *Dark ecology: For a logic of future coexistence*. Columbia University Press.

Nogués-Bravo, D., Simberloff, D., Rahbek, C., & Sanders, N. J. (2016). Rewilding is the new Pandora's box in conservation. *Current Biology*, *26*(3), R87–R91. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cub.2015.12.044

Pinnegar, J. K., & Engelhard, G. H. (2008). The 'shifting baseline' phenomenon: A global perspective. *Reviews in Fish Biology and Fisheries*, *18*(1), 1–16. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11160-007-9058-6

Rick, T. C., Erlandson, J. M., & Vellanoweth, R. L. (2001). Paleocoastal Marine Fishing on the Pacific Coast of the Americas: Perspectives from Daisy Cave, California. *American Antiquity*, *66*(4), 595–613. https://doi.org/10.2307/2694175

Rivera-Collazo, I. (2022). Environment, climate and people: Exploring human responses to climate change. *Journal of Anthropological Archaeology*, *68*, 101460. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jaa.2022.101460

Silva, F., Coward, F., Davies, K., Elliott, S., Jenkins, E., Newton, A. C., Riris, P., Vander Linden, M., Bates, J., Cantarello, E., Contreras, D. A., Crabtree, S. A., Crema, E. R., Edwards, M., Filatova, T., Fitzhugh, B., Fluck, H., Freeman, J., Klein Goldewijk, K., … Williams, A. (2022). Developing Transdisciplinary Approaches to Sustainability Challenges: The Need to Model Socio-Environmental Systems in the Longue Durée. *Sustainability*, *14*(16), 10234. https://doi.org/10.3390/su141610234

Wolverton, S., Figueroa, R. M., & Armstrong, C. G. (2023). Integrating Historical Ecology and Environmental Justice. *Journal of Ethnobiology*, *43*(1), 57–68. https://doi.org/10.1177/02780771231162196

○ ○ ○ ○ ○ ○ ○

Their eyes were watching God

Zora Neale Hurston

Ethel Ray Nance: Racial Violence, Gender, and Colorism during the Harlem Renaissance

Madison Nance
Department of Africana Studies

Abstract

This paper explores the life and legacy of Ethel Ray Nance, a lesser-known yet influential figure in early 20th-century African American history. Through an analysis of her experiences with racial violence, gender discrimination, and colorism, this paper sheds light on the intersections that shaped her contributions during the Harlem Renaissance and broader New Negro Movement. This paper highlights Nance's resilience and impact within her community, simultaneously aiming to address the larger marginalization of Black women in historical narratives. Through the lens of Ethel Ray Nance's story, this work pushes for an inclusive retelling of American history that honors the contributions of Black women.

Keywords: Ethel Ray Nance, Harlem Renaissance, racial violence, gender, colorism, Black women's history, American history, African American Studies.

Introduction and Background

My great-grandmother, Ethel Ray Nance, is an unsung Black American icon. Her significant contributions have gone underappreciated and even unrecognized altogether in historical narratives. As a writer, activist, and community leader, she fought tirelessly for equity. Ethel Ray Nance was born in Duluth, Minnesota in 1899, to William Ray, an African American man from North Carolina, and Inga Ray, a Swedish immigrant woman. Nance would become her married name in 1974 (Bend, 1997). Despite her multi-racial heritage, Nance did not attempt to pass for White. Nance always identified as Black (or, as it was called at the time, Negro). It follows that Nance's upbringing in Duluth was marked by a profound sense of isolation and unbelonging. Demographics of Duluth in the year of her birth were about 0.3% Black and, to this day, the Black population has never exceeded 5% (U.S. Census Bureau, 2024). Nance's desire to leave Duluth was shaped not only by her experiences with discrimination but also by familial influences and the broader historical context.

The World War I draft affected many young Black men, including Nance's older brother, William Junior ("Will"). He had been a source of protection and guidance for Nance throughout her childhood. Reflecting on their conversations before his military service, she recalled: "After all, Will had been 18 when he left home, and I was 8. As the older brother, he had been my protector in 'skirmishes' outside and with my brother Oscar, five years my

senior. He secured employment as a welder in the shipyard [in Duluth] ... [Will] spent several months [in Duluth] until his call to service came. It was a wonderful reunion for me. We had long talks about my desire to leave Duluth. He cautioned me about hastiness and finally secured my promise to wait until he returned from service, and that then possibly we could work out something together" (Ethel Ray Nance Archive, n.d) Though Nance longed to leave Duluth, she also navigated the complexities of racial, social, familial, and economic barriers, which would continue to inform her journey. In the broader context of American History, predominantly White Midwestern cities like Duluth, Minnesota are not typically associated with the perils of racism and racial violence.

However, Duluth has a very tumultuous history of racial violence and White terrorism. After a trip throughout the South with her father in 1919, a twenty-year-old Ethel Ray Nance wrote in her diary,

> *The world for Negros was a lot bigger than I had ever imagined living in our little home in Duluth. It was bigger than the Southern prejudices that sat in your throat like molasses every time a white person crossed your path. Hearing about that young man who was lynched when we were in North Carolina stayed with me. My only comfort was as my father said, "those kinda things don't happen up north and certainly not in Duluth" (Ethel Ray Nance Archive, 1919).*

Ethel's sense of security in living outside of the South would prove false. On June 15, 1920, the city of Duluth would be forever altered by the lynchings of Elias Clayton, Elmer Jackson, and Issac McGhie (Minnesota Historical Society, n.d).

In the aftermath of the Civil War, lynchings were used as a form of extrajudicial punishment to instill fear, enforce racial subordination, and maintain systems of White supremacy. In 1974, Nance sat down with interviewer David Taylor in her San Francisco home and recalled her experience with the lynchings: "There was a circus in town. And 14 Negroes were taken off a train that was ready to pull out with all the circus paraphernalia late that night. And this white girl claimed that she had been raped by 14 negroes, and she's supposed to have identified these four. They had a kangaroo court. The chief of police was out of town; the mayor was out of town. And I understand that they got the necktie party up by parading up and down the main street, and no one stopped them. My father was furious. Of course, he was very upset, particularly because it happened about four blocks from our home... And as he walked down the hill that next morning to work; the bodies had been cut down and were lying there at the foot of his telegraph post." Nance and her family were particularly affected by the lynchings, being one of the few Black families in a predominantly White city.

As Ethel Ray Nance's great-granddaughter, I have marveled at her life and wondered how she managed to accomplish such monumental feats in the face of barriers that she faced growing up in the predominantly White city of Duluth, a city, like so many others, marked with a painful history of racial violence. This paper aims to unravel the intricacies of Ethel Ray Nance, to better

understand her journey and the intersections of her identity. Historically, the genre of biographies has been dominated by White-male narratives. Research on women, especially Black women, is scarce. This scarcity underscores the importance of projects like this, which seeks to elevate the voices and experiences of historically marginalized Black women like Nance. This paper will conceptualize the historical context of the early 20th century with the life of Ethel Ray Nance. The proposed research aims to cultivate an understanding of how Ethel Ray Nance, a Black woman from Duluth, Minnesota, found herself running with the Black elite in Harlem, New York. My great-grandmother's largely untold story is one of unwavering commitment to the betterment of our people. While this paper seeks to analyze Ethel Ray Nance's life, it also informs my own as I firmly believe that we stand on the shoulders of those who come before us.

II. Racial Violence During the Early Twentieth Century

The escalation of lynching incidents in the United States gained momentum in the mid-1880s, peaking in intensity during 1892 and 1893, following a brief decline immediately after Reconstruction. Although lynchings diminished during the 1890s, this form of violence persisted well into the twentieth-century. During this period, lynchings continued to occur throughout the country, with the highest volume occurring within the Jim Crow South. As endorsers of the brutal practice continued to defend it as a legitimate form of criminal punishment, the term "lynching" came to be primarily linked with racial domination and oppression by the turn of the twentieth-century (Williams, 2012).

In 1890, three-quarters of Chicago's population were foreign-born Eastern and Northern European immigrants. With the onset of World War I, the influx of European immigrants began to stagger dramatically (Drake & Clayton, 1962). Meanwhile, the booming war industries in Chicago needed laborers, mirroring the trend across the neighboring Midwest and Northern states,. During the period known as the Great Migration, between 1910 and 1970, over six million African Americans migrated to the North from the Southern states (Sugrue, 1999). Drake and Clayton contend that this influx of Black newcomers in Chicago—"The Black Metropolis"—during the early stages of the Great Migration was a direct response to the city's need for manpower and the abundance of work opportunities (1962). While social causes of Black migration from the Jim Crow South to Northern cities have been widely acknowledged as of secondary importance to the economic forces, Williams contends that racial violence was just as instrumental in the Great Migration North from the South (Tolnay, 1997; Williams, 2012).

While many African Americans saw the North as a "promised land," safe from the violence of the oppressive Jim Crow South, the Great Migration resulted in increased racial tensions in the North. The White majority in the "progressive" North felt threatened by the increasing number of Black people due to the pervasive nature of American racism. Numerous racial riots and lynchings occurred in Northern towns and cities throughout the first few decades of the twentieth century. Millions of White Northerners joined the Ku

Klux Klan in the 1920s (Sugrue, 1999). It became abundantly clear that the South was not the only place where bigotry and hatred existed. As Kidada E. Williams's book, *They Left Great Marks on Me,* demonstrates, African Americans were inspired to organize against racial violence during the twentieth century through the testimonies of victims and witnesses about the traumatizing effects of violence on individuals, families, and communities (2012).

In the aftermath of the 1920 Duluth Lynchings, William Ray, Ethel's father, founded the Duluth chapter of the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People (NAACP). Since its inception in 1909, the NAACP has been one of the most prominent civil rights organizations in America. The NAACP played a pivotal role in landmark Supreme Court cases, including Brown v. Board of Education, which famously outlawed school segregation (1954). Throughout the United States' history, the NAACP has been at the forefront of the fight for African American rights.

When William Ray heard that historian, sociologist, and Pan-African civil rights activist W.E.B. Du Bois would speak in St. Paul, he sent Ethel to meet him. Du Bois had been in St. Paul to speak on the rise in racial violence in the North. Her task was to persuade Du Bois to be the first speaker at a Duluth NAACP meeting. Nance was successful. Ethel Ray Nance and W.E.B. Du Bois rode together on the train from St. Paul to Duluth, and on March 21, 1921, Du Bois delivered a speech at St. Mark A.M.E. Church, a couple of blocks away from Nance's childhood home. Nance would introduce Du Bois to the crowd- a series of events that would mark the beginning of a friendship that would span over forty years until Du Bois' death in 1963.

Because of the efforts of William Ray, Ethel Ray Nance, and many others, Minnesota became the first state to establish an anti-lynching statute in 1921 (the year after the Duluth lynchings). This legislation, signed into law on April 21, 1921, defined lynching as "the killing of a human being, by the act or procurement of a mob" and held counties financially liable for such acts, allowing dependents of lynching victims to recover damages up to $7,500. Additionally, the law mandated the removal from office of sheriffs and deputies who failed to protect individuals from mobs (Minnesota Legislature, 1921). This legislative move coincided with the emergence of the Ku Klux Klan in the state, with their first meeting taking place in 1922 (Minnesota Historical Society, n.d).

Through speaking about and against racial violence, Black people and their White allies engaged in a "consciousness-raising" process, which Lisa Gring-Pemble refers to as the "pregenesis" phase of social movement development (Williams, 2012). I contend that their efforts were a catalyst for the ethos of the Harlem Renaissance and broader New Negro Movement, advocating for cultural expression as a means of challenging white supremacist structures and fostering societal transformation. When analyzing the roles of Black women within the movement, however, it is essential to recognize these women as daughters of Jim Crow. This period informed their resilience and dedication to a movement that undervalued their agency and contributions.

Traumatized by the lynchings, Nance felt increasingly restricted by her surroundings in Duluth. She yearned to leave her hometown and broaden her horizons. After graduating from Central High School in 1917, she reflected on

the limited opportunities available to her as a Black woman. On Friday, September 28, 1917, Nance wrote:

> *No plans had been discussed at home for college. I discovered that Duluth had considerable discrimination toward minorities when I started hunting for work, and noted other girls who had been high school classmates had no difficulty getting placed in department stores and offices...A neighbor helped me get temporary typing jobs, copying election lists, etc., and then located a friend in one of the Liberty Loan Drive offices who agreed to hire me. This was a short-term assignment, but at least I made some contacts I could use for future references...I took continuous civil service examinations for stenographer, and always marked the blanks as to preferred location "would accept employment anywhere" (Ethel Ray Nance Archive, 1917).*

In 1922, Ethel Ray Nance was appointed as a committee clerk in the Minnesota Legislature, making her the first African American woman to work for the state legislature. Reflecting in her diary on Wednesday, October 4th, 1922, she wrote, "I got the position! I will be the first Colored woman to have that position" (Ethel Ray Nance Archive, 1922). Her work as an stenographer and typist was celebrated in The Appeal on Wednesday, December 13th, 1922, which praised her as "an attractive young lady of very refined manners and a credit to her race" (Ethel Ray Nance Archive, n.d). Founded in 1885, The Appeal was one of the most influential African American newspapers in the United States, with a national circulation.

By 1924, Ethel's achievements and growing network led to a secretarial job offer from Charles S. Johnson, director of research at the New York Urban League and editor of one of the biggest Black publications at the time, *Opportunity: A Journal of Negro Life* (Bend, 1997). *Opportunity* was a leading magazine during the Harlem Renaissance, dedicated to advancing the arts, literature, and social issues affecting African Americans. Through its literary competitions and articles, it provided a platform for emerging Black writers, poets, and artists, helping to launch the careers of figures such as Langston Hughes, Zora Neale Hurston, and Countee Cullen.

In her role as Johnson's secretary, Nance handled much of the behind-the-scenes work for the publication, ensuring smooth communication and coordination for *Opportunity*'s operations. One could not reach Charles Johnson without going through Nance, who became a vital part of the magazine's success. "Ethel Ray may not have been the one producing the poetry, stories, and drawings, but without her help, the success of artists such as Langston Hughes and Countee Cullen would not have been as great" (Bend, 1997). In 1925, Nance played a key role in organizing the famous Opportunity Dinner, an annual event where Black artists, writers, and intellectuals gathered with powerful patrons. "Scholars of the Harlem Renaissance trace the inception of the movement to a Civic Club Opportunity dinner in 1924" (Pollock & Haley, 2018). The Opportunity Dinner emerged as the inaugural social event of the Harlem Renaissance, forging connections among Black creatives and facilitating opportunities for collaboration and advancement. Nance's

dedication and meticulous work made her indispensable to Johnson and helped establish *Opportunity: A Journal of Negro Life* as a central voice of the Harlem Renaissance. Her influence extended beyond administrative tasks, as she developed close relationships with many of the era's most renowned figures, fully immersing herself in the cultural and intellectual landscape of Harlem.

The Evolving Role of Black Women within the Harlem Renaissance/ New Negro Movement

Ethel Ray Nance arrived in Harlem in 1925, a time when the cultural and political landscape was rich with possibility. It was against this landscape that Black women of the twentieth century redemptively began to redefine their roles in society. This period, from 1925 to 1930, is often referred to as the Harlem Renaissance or simply the Renaissance, emerging within the broader context of the New Negro Movement. Alain Locke popularized the New Negro ideal, which in his 1925 anthology he emphasizes as a manifesto for the movement, promoting self-definition, artistic expression, and racial pride. Harlem became a hub for prominent Black creatives, publications, political organizations, and White allies, fostering an atmosphere ripe for opportunity and recognition. Within this era of cultural flourishing, Black women navigated the tensions of respectability politics and colorism while seizing the opportunity to author a new narrative for themselves: one that challenged traditional roles and asserted their presence in literature, politics, and the arts.

At the turn of the century, the most common form of attack on the Black woman was a portrayal of immorality and sexual deviance, constructed by their sexual vulnerability during slavery and weaponized against them in the decades following (Gilman, 1986). The respectability politics of the early twentieth century put immense pressure on Black women to demonstrate that Black individuals were worthy of equal citizenship rights. In her 1925 essay, "The Double Task," Harlem Renaissance woman Elise McDouglad asserts, "Throughout the years of history, woman has been the weathervane, the indicator, showing in which direction the wind of destiny blows. Her status and development have augured now calm and stability, now swift currents of progress. What then is to be said of the Negro woman of to-day, whose problems are of such import to her race?" (McDouglad, 1925).

The conflict between the politics of respectability-informed by Victorian era ideals, the role of housewife, and the twentieth-century ideals of activism and progress plagued these Harlem Renaissance women. In "For Her Own Good: 150 Years of the Expert's Advice to Women", Barbara Ehrenreich and Deidre English discuss this conflict: "In the new world of the nineteenth century, what was a woman to do? Did she build a life, like her aunts and her mother, in the warmth of the family? Or did she throw herself into the nervous activism of a world which was already presuming to call itself modern?" (1978). Despite invaluable contributions and great strides, women within the Harlem Renaissance ultimately operated as an "outsiders within," despite working alongside some of the most prolific and widely recognized Black male figures of the twentieth century (Ransby, 2003).

In "The Double Task," Elsie McDouglad denotes the New Negro women as "the hub of the wheel of progress," metaphorically referring to women as central to advancement and development of the era (1925). Despite her status within the circle of the Talented Tenth Black elite, Nance and countless other Renaissance women operated as "conditional insiders", a role shaped by their womanhood. As demonstrated, there were many difficulties in negotiating Black womanhood in the masculine era of the New Negro (Hinnov, 2012). Black women of the Renaissance Era-- as with the rest of the general Black population-- would be categorized into upper-middle class, the new professional-middle class, and lower-middle classes. The lower middle class worked domestic jobs. The upper-middle class Black women came from established families, either intellectually, or financially, or both.

The emerging middle class often graduated from newly established Historically Black Colleges and Universities (HBCUS), or came from families that emphasized self-reliance, education, and the ethos of the "race [wo]man". These women emphasized a "missionary spirit and zeal, rooted in Black education" (Barnett-Cash, 2001). Nance hailed from this emerging middle class. She found work in Harlem after being offered a secretarial position through the mail by Charles S. Johnson, who had seen her make headlines for breaking color barriers in the Minnesota State Legislature. This pivotal moment illustrates how Nance's middle-class foundation in Minnesota directly contributed to the opportunities available to her in Harlem, allowing her entry into the elite intellectual and artistic circles of the Renaissance.

In examining the lives of Black women of the Harlem Renaissance, I have discovered many parallels in social class, skin color, and geographic region. Regina Andrews was Ethel Ray Nance's roommate in Harlem. Ethelene Whitmire, author of Andrews' biography, Harlem Renaissance Librarian, argues that Andrews' upper-middle class status aided in providing her with the strength, the connections, and the tools to defy the expected conventions of her time. Andrews was also born a child of mixed-race parents, and spent her childhood in the predominantly White, midwestern city of Normal, Illinois. Whitmire contends that Andrews' socioeconomic background, parental education, political and social involvements, and even the geographical location of her birth align with other African American women of the Harlem Renaissance (2014).

It's crucial to note that the acknowledgement of these factors does not diminish the achievements of women of that era. Rather, it sheds light on the context in which they navigated their paths to success. While Whitmire discusses the many similarities between women of the era, she misses the opportunity to discuss one of the most prominent: the prevailing question of color. Many women within the Talented Tenth— Regina Anderson, Elise Johnson Mcdouglad, Ethel Ray Nance, and countless others— were light-skinned. The last section of my literature review will closely examine colorism during the Harlem Renaissance.

The Prevailing Question of Color

Despite the advancements of the Harlem Renaissance, which emerged within the broader political and cultural context of the New Negro Movement-- a period shaped by respectability politics and a push for racial uplift-- the era was still marked by colorism. In 1924, Regina Anderson Andrews, Ethel Ray Nance, and Louella Tucker held a social event for Langston Hughes at their St. Nicholas Avenue apartment, commemorating the day with photographs. Examining this and similar images from the Harlem Renaissance highlights a frequently neglected issue-- the intersection of class and skin tone, now referred to as colorism (Pollock & Haley, 2018). Mixed-race and light-skinned Black people like W.E.B. Du Bois, Charles S. Johnson, Langston Hughes, Bruce Nugent, Dorothy Peterson, and Georgia Douglas Johnson had some White ancestry. Some, such as Walter White and Fredi Washington, had much more (Davis, 1994). Nearly all the Negro leaders and members of the Negro upper-class were either light-skinned themselves or had light-skinned wives (Hunter, 2016). This suggests that Nance's light skin could have been an asset in her ability to network with influential figures and rise within the cultural movements of the time. Her ability to navigate these color-based hierarchies offers insight into the broader issues of colorism within the Harlem Renaissance.

Colorism in America must be understood as a variant of racism. Colorism is guided by the false notion that whiteness or proximity to whiteness is inherently better, more beautiful, sophisticated, and desirable. White supremacy relies on the corresponding myth of Black inferiority, wherein Blackness is associated with being inherently less than, ugliness, primitiveness, and thus less desirable. This is the direct manifestation of the legacies of colonialism and slavery in America, informed and constructed by Whites as a moral justification for the enslavement of Africans. The overrepresentation of light-skinned Blacks during the New Negro era is rooted in these constructed beliefs, and colorism remains deeply ingrained in the American psyche.

An investigation into the overrepresentation of light-skinned figures during the Harlem Renaissance reveals striking disparities. W.E.B. Du Bois believed that a liberal arts education was the best way for Blacks to advance in American society. Notably, Du Bois was also the first African American to graduate from Harvard University, an institution that symbolizes the pinnacle of American academia, yet remains deeply entrenched in exclusionary practices. In 1916, it was estimated that upwards of 80% of students attending newly founded HBCUS were light-skinned or of mixed ancestry. Often turned away from education in liberal arts, many dark-skinned individuals were encouraged to attend vocational schools like the Tuskegee Institute, founded by Booker T. Washington, a light-skinned man himself (Russell, et al., 1992). In *The Color Complex,* Kathy Russell contends that throughout African American history, mostly lighter-skinned individuals have led efforts toward progress. This phenomenon may be interpreted as a manifestation of the selective criteria that inform the composition of historical records.

Colorism affected not only Ethel Ray Nance but also her family dynamic as a whole. Both of her older brothers, Oscar and William Jr., passed as White. For the two brothers, passing offered safety and social mobility in early twentieth-century America, a period marked by extreme racial violence. As defined by Harvard Law School professor Randall Kennedy, passing is "a deception that enables a person to adopt certain roles or identities from which he would be barred by prevailing social standards" (Kennedy, 2022). By marrying a White woman and cutting off virtually all ties to his family, William effectively distanced himself from his family and Black heritage. This abandonment of his is portrayed by the fact that the only remnants of the man he once was are a few letters to his family— traces that silently testify to a life he would rather leave behind. Oscar became a business owner and actively practiced job discrimination against Black people, fearing that any connection to them might reveal his true identity. Ethel Ray Nance's lighter skin might have provided her with certain social advantages, allowing her to gain access to key cultural and intellectual circles, but she did not follow her brothers' path. The internalized racism behind Oscar's and William Jr.'s choices highlights just how pervasive the myth of White superiority was, even within families. Ethel Ray Nance chose a different path.

While her brothers fled from their Blackness, she chose to embrace hers. Colorism is often dismissed with the argument that dark-skinned Black Americans, too, have made significant progress and paved the way for advancement. This is akin to the flawed argument that racism does not exist today, simply because there are successful Black individuals like Oprah Winfrey and Lebron James. Winfrey, a billionaire media mogul and philanthropist, overcame poverty and systemic barriers to become one of the most influential figures in global media (Kelley, 2010). Similarly, James, a four-time NBA champion and cultural icon, has leveraged his platform to advocate for social justice and educational initiatives (LeBron James, n.d.). However, their success is the exception rather than the rule, and their prominence does not dismantle the structural disadvantages that persist for Black Americans, particularly those with darker skin.

The legacies of prominent dark-skinned leaders like Marcus Garvey do not erase his phenotypic minority status amongst Black leaders. As the founder of the Universal Negro Improvement Association (UNIA), Jamaican-born Garvey was a key figure in the Pan-African movement, advocating for Black self-reliance, economic empowerment, and global unity. His "Back to Africa" movement and emphasis on racial pride challenged the dominant respectability politics of the era, which often prioritized lighter-skinned individuals in leadership and public representation. In an interview conducted by David Taylor, when asked if she had anything to do with the Garvey movement, Nance responded, "No, but when I was in New York, there were parades of the Garvey Movement, but most of our group just laughed at the idea. This was somebody that just wanted to dress up. We didn't know the real significance of it, you know, that we were too busy living our lives and being interested in the movement there then, which they now call the Renaissance."

Nance's response and dismissal of Garvey highlights the elitism of Du Bois' Talented Tenth New Negro era, as well as divergent perspectives and division

within the Black community. The Du Boisian mulatto Talented Tenth era (as coined by Hall), though intended to advance the Black community, perpetuated internal divisions based on skin color and class (Hall, 2020). In the 1920s, Marcus Garvey's *Negro World* denounced the class of "want-to-be-White Negroes who peal [sic] their skins off and straighten their hair" to "share the blessings of the prosperous White race" (Cited in Carter, 2020). The overrepresentation of light-skinned elites during the Harlem Renaissance caused tensions within the Black community, particularly between the Black bourgeoisie and the emerging urban Black working-class.

Nance and Garvey's rhetoric provides insight into the politics of racial identity and division within the Black community during the early twentieth-century. Nance's dismissal of the movement and claim that she "did not know the significance" is profound, considering that Garvey's revitalization of Black Nationalism was one of the era's most widespread, most prominent Black freedom movements. In 1982, Franklin and Meier argued that Talented Tenth members faced accusations of assimilation and accommodation in their pursuit of social advancement, echoing Garvey's critiques in *Negro World*. But what about dark-skinned Talented Tenthers? Figures like Wallace Thurman and Dorothy West were often marginalized within elite Black circles that favored lighter skin, limiting their social and professional acceptance. West, frequently called "little Black Dorothy," was both infantilized and singled out for her complexion, highlighting how colorism shaped intra-racial hierarchies even among the era's most celebrated Black intellectuals (Davis, 1994).

Thus, it is strikingly evident that colorism was not merely a background issue but a central factor that shaped the lived experiences of Black Harlemites and broader Black life in the twentieth century. The perpetuation of light-skinned privilege and exclusion of darker-skinned individuals highlights a critical and often overlooked layer of discrimination. Addressing colorism involves understanding its origins and manifestations throughout history. If we continue to ignore colorism, we will continue to perpetuate divisions between the Black community.

Conclusion

The ongoing omission of African American, Native American, Asian American, Hispanic American, and other women of color from American biographies has profound repercussions, perpetuating their marginalization. This exclusionary practice implies that the lives of women of color are deemed insignificant, depriving them of visibility and acknowledgment. Biographies play a crucial role in understanding the lives of notable individuals. Yet, the absence of narratives documenting the experiences of women of color suggests their stories are unworthy of recognition. By elevating the story of Ethel Ray Nance, this study challenges existing narratives that marginalize women of color and highlights their agency in shaping change. Moreover, this research emphasizes the need for inclusive biographical narratives. Nance's story serves as a reminder of the resilience and determination of Black women against all odds.

Beginning with her formative years in Duluth, Minnesota, where she confronted racial prejudice and felt the impact of the 1920 Duluth lynchings,

Nance's journey is one marked by resilience. Her pivotal role in the Harlem Renaissance provided a platform for her advocacy despite the challenges posed by racism and sexism within the movement in Harlem and the broader early 20th century. Conceptualizing Ethel Ray Nance's privilege associated with the pervasive colorism of the era informs understanding of her social involvements and opportunities for advancement. This paper aims to illuminate Nance's contributions and legacy, and the legacies of other lesser-known Black women. While this paper scratches the surface in answering the several inquiries of my research, each could be investigated individually. Ethel Ray Nance's legacy is marked by barrier-breaking achievements. Still, in many ways, her path was shaped by the complexities that come with being both Black and woman. In 1927, she returned to Minnesota to care for her ailing mother, giving up her life in Harlem after two short years of invaluable contributions (Bend, 1997).

Nance became the first African American policewoman in Minnesota in 1928 (Bend, 1997). Her groundbreaking entry into law enforcement raises important questions about the role of colorism in shaping opportunities for Black women in predominantly White institutions. As discussed earlier, lighter-skinned Black individuals were often afforded greater access to professional and public-facing roles due to prevailing racial hierarchies. While Nance's appointment was a historic achievement, it is worth considering how her appearance, educational background, and social positioning influenced her selection.

In 1929, she married her first husband, LeRoy Williams, and had two sons: Thatcher (my grandfather), born in January 1933, and Glenn Ray (born in July 1934) (Bend, 1997). In 1945, she moved to San Francisco and resumed her work in civil rights: secretary to W.E.B. Du Bois at the founding of the United Nations and continued her work with the NAACP and the San Francisco African American Historical and Cultural Society. At seventy-nine, Nance became the oldest graduate of the University of San Francisco (Bend, 1997). Her life was a litany of both accomplishment and sacrifice, reflective of the complex, intersectional challenges faced by Black women of her generation.

The lack of diverse female biographical subjects limits the range of role models available to Black children. This limitation is not only distorting historical narratives but adversely affects the aspirations of young girls of color. The scarcity of positive representations of women of color worsens this issue, perpetuating their exclusion and reinforcing systems of White supremacy. To address this marginalization, celebrating the achievements and experiences of women of color within academia and beyond is of utmost importance. This paper underscores the importance of recognizing and celebrating the contributions of women of color at large to American history. Nance's story serves as a reminder of the resilience and determination of Black women in the face of systemic barriers and discrimination.

Acknowledgments

when she was born, and in Danville, the African American population has remained about 1% over my twenty-two years of life, with White residents making up around 72% (U.S. Census Bureau, 2020). Standing in my great-grandmother's hometown, especially at the Duluth Lynching Memorial for Elias Clayton, Elmer Jackson, and Isaac McGhie, I felt a strong connection to her journey and sacrifices, and a deeper appreciation for my roots and Black identity. In retracing Ethel's life, I have also discovered parts of myself and felt more than ever that I stand on her shoulders, continuing her legacy. I would like to express gratitude to my faculty mentor, Dr. Charmane Perry, whose guidance, unwavering support, and encouragement have been instrumental throughout the completion of this project. Thank you for believing in me and further igniting my passion for this work. Furthermore, my mother's support has been a constant source of strength, and I thank her for always encouraging exploration of my Black heritage despite not sharing it herself. I would also like to thank my Aunt Karen for her dedication to preserving our Nance family history and providing crucial archival materials, which have been an invaluable resource for this project. Finally, my thanks also extend to those who maintain the Duluth Lynching Memorial, a space of reflection and remembrance for Elias Clayton, Elmer Jackson, and Isaac McGhie. Their work is a poignant reminder of the history of racial violence and the importance of not only acknowledging, but honoring the lives affected.

References

Bend, H. E. (1997). *Ethel Ray Nance: A quiet heroine who fought incessantly for racial justice.* Senior Scholar Papers, Paper 387. Colby College.

Cash, F. B. (2001). *African American women and social action: The clubwomen and volunteerism from Jim Crow to the New Deal, 1896–1936* (Contributions in Women's Studies). Praeger.

Carter, J. (2020). *Of double-blooded birth: A history of mixed-race women in the United States during the early twentieth century* [Doctoral dissertation, University of East Anglia].

Davis, T. (1994). *Nella Larsen, novelist of the Harlem Renaissance.* Louisiana State University Press.

Drake, S. C., & Clayton, H. R. (1970). *Black metropolis: A study of Negro life in a northern city* (Rev. and enl. ed.). Harcourt Brace Jovanovich.

Ehrenreich, B., & English, D. (1978). *For her own good: 150 years of the expert's advice to women.* Anchor Press.

Ethel Ray Nance Archive. (n.d.). *Collection of letters, diaries, and documents.* Minnesota Historical Society.

Gilman, S. (1986). Black bodies, white bodies: Toward an iconography of female sexuality in late 19th-century art, medicine, and literature. In H. L. Gates Jr. (Ed.), *Race, writing, and difference* (pp. 223–261). University of Chicago Press.

Hall, R. E. (2020). The DuBoisian Talented Tenth: Reviewing and assessing mulatto colorism in the post-DuBoisian era. *Journal of African American Studies, 24*(1), 78+.

Heller, H. (n.d.). Nance, Ethel Ray (1899–1992). *MNopedia, Minnesota Historical Society.*

Hinnov, E. M. (2012). Maneuvers of silence and the task of 'New Negro' womanhood. *Journal of Narrative Theory, 42*(1), 46–68.

Hunter, S. C. (2016). *Jazz epidemics and deep-set diseases: The de-pathologization of the Black body in the work of three Harlem Renaissance writers* [Doctoral dissertation, University of Nebraska].

Kennedy, R. (2001). Racial passing. *Ohio State Law Journal, 62*(3), 1145–1174.

LeBron James. (n.d.). *LeBron James.*

Locke, A. (1925). Enter the new Negro. *Survey Graphic, 6*(6), 631–634.

McDougald, E. J. (1925, March 1). The double task: The struggle of Negro women for sex and race emancipation.

Minnesota Historical Society. (n.d.). *The lynchings in Duluth: The historical context*. Minnesota Historical Society Press.

Minnesota Legislature. (1921). *Session laws, Chapter 401: Anti-lynching law*. Minnesota Revisor of Statutes.

Morrison, T. (1970). *The Bluest Eye*. Holt, Rinehart and Winston.

Pollock, C. M. J., & Haley, S. P. (2018). "When I enter": Black women and disruption of the white, heteronormative narrative of librarianship. In R. L. Chou & A. Pho (Eds.), *Pushing the margins: Women of color and intersectionality in LIS* (pp. 3–32). Library Juice Press.

Ransby, B. (2003). *Ella Baker and the Black Freedom Movement: A Radical Democratic Vision*. University of North Carolina Press.

Russell, K. Y., Wilson, M., & Hall, R. E. (1992). *The color complex: The politics of skin color among African Americans*. Harcourt Brace Jovanovich.

Sugrue, T. J. (1999). Expert report of Thomas J. Sugrue. *Michigan Journal of Race & Law, 5,* 261.

Tolnay, S. E. (1997). The Great Migration and changes in the Northern Black family, 1940 to 1990. *Social Forces, 75*(4), 1213–1238.

U.S. Census Bureau. (2020). *QuickFacts: Danville town, California*.

U.S. Census Bureau. (2024). *QuickFacts: Duluth city, Minnesota*. U.S. Department of Commerce.

Whitmire, E. (2014). Harlem Renaissance women and 580 St. Nicholas Avenue. In R. A. Andrews (Ed.), *Regina Anderson Andrews, Harlem Renaissance Librarian* (pp. 32–47). University of Illinois Press.

Williams, A. B. (2022). *The implications of colorism on Black women from the early 20th century to the present* (Master's thesis). The University of Southern Mississippi.

Williams, K. E. (2012). *They left great marks on me: African American testimonies of racial violence from emancipation to World War I*. NYU Press.

Renewable Energy, Critical Minerals, and Human Rights: Artisanal Cobalt Mining in the Democratic Republic of Congo

Josh Rea

Departments of Economics and International Security & Conflict Resolution

Abstract

Renewable energy has been at the forefront of climate change mitigation methods due to the potential for drastically reduced carbon emissions. Much of the current literature on renewable energy focuses solely on the potential economic and environmental benefits of decreasing the emissions inherent in fossil fuels. This article contributes to the existing literature by focusing on whether critical minerals instrumental in renewable energies have the potential to threaten human rights, particularly in developing nations with substandard regulations. I find a relationship between human rights abuses and renewable energies in the literature as well as in a case study on the Democratic Republic of the Congo (DRC). The findings reveal the need for mitigating climate change from a critical perspective that accounts for human rights in developing nations alongside the current economic and environmental lenses.

Keywords: renewable energy, clean energy, critical minerals, human rights, artisanal mining, Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC)

Introduction

Globally, the issue of climate change and global warming has taken center stage in public policy and discourse. Climate change, defined as "long-term shifts in temperature and weather patterns" by the United Nations (n.d., para. 1), has been worsening, with average temperatures around the globe hitting approximately 1 °C above pre-industrial levels in 2017 (Allen et al., 2018). According to studies by Allen et al., Al-Ghussain (2019), and Rossati (2017), the increase in temperature will be accompanied by extreme weather events, such as floods, droughts, and heat waves, as well as oceans rising and becoming more acidic. In addition to their direct impacts on human health, Rossati describes how these natural events can have indirect effects, namely non-communicable diseases, famine, and mental health impacts. Overall, research across academia shows that global warming is an imminent danger that threatens to negatively impact human life and exacerbate existing social injustices.

Due to the urgency of this public policy issue, there have been efforts to mitigate the effect of global warming by promoting renewable energies across varying levels of governance. Renewable energy technologies are seen as one of the most attractive mitigation strategies due to their low cost of implementation

and ability to dramatically reduce carbon dioxide emissions (Al-Ghussain, 2019). However, the current discourse surrounding decarbonization ignores significant impacts on the developing nations that source crucial minerals for technologies like batteries (Sovacool et al., 2020; Kramarz et al., 2021). To ensure a truly just transition to cleaner energy, a broader perspective and understanding of the entire clean energy lifecycle—from extracting materials to recycling—is critical. As such, my research question asks: What is the relationship, if any, between renewable energies and human rights in developing nations? By exploring this question, I contribute to the literature on the renewable energy transition by taking a critical lens that includes human rights for all.

In this study, I examine whether the increases in renewable energies may intensify human rights challenges within extractive mining sectors—specifically artisanal mining—and then I explore this relationship in the context of developing nations. Following, I present a literature review that examines this relationship from an economics, energy studies, and human rights perspective. Building upon this literature review, I then present a case study of artisanal mining and human rights in the Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC), focusing on the extraction of the mineral cobalt. From this case study, I find that as the share of renewable technologies increases globally, the sustainable procurement of critical minerals will only grow in significance. This study's findings could be applied beyond the DRC and to mining sectors across the world. In sum, while transitioning to renewable energies is crucial in combating the global threat of climate change, any transition should incorporate a human rights perspective in order to address the negative impacts on humans in developing nations who already bear disproportionate impacts from climate change.

Literature Review

The literature review will draw on both academic and grey literature to encompass multiple facets of this public policy issue. During the process of this review, I find two important relationships. First is the impact of increased demand for clean energy and the resulting supply and demand implications for critical minerals, such as cobalt. Second is an understanding of the extractive mining process for these minerals, and how the artisanal mining sector perpetuates alarming human rights violations. By establishing these relationships, the question of whether there is truly a connection between the renewable energy transition and human rights abuses can be addressed.

The scope of this literature review is on the selective side, as it draws from the disciplines of economics, energy studies, and human rights studies. The issue of renewable energy is an expansive field with many processes and issues along the lifecycle, and thus this review will omit a large amount of research that does not directly pertain to the question at hand. In addition, this review is limited by length and consequently will not elaborate on the relevant aspects of environmental rights abuse, the effect of corporate or government regulations on extractive industries, or the impact of targeted policy on renewable energy sectors through acts (e.g., subsidies). Further, there are limitations in the literature on data accuracy and extensiveness due to challenges such as

unregulated sectors or inaccurate reporting in developing countries. Nonetheless, this literature review provides evidence of an identifiable connection between increases in renewable energy and human rights abuses, showing the need for greater consideration of human rights impacts when addressing clean technologies.

The Transition to Renewable Energy: Increased Demand for Minerals

As the current state of energy infrastructure transitions to a more sustainable path, renewable energies and technologies that support less emissions will be at the forefront. This has already been seen with record growth in renewable energies and electric vehicles, according to the consulting firm McKinsey & Company (2023). Despite this growth, the International Renewable Energy Agency (IRENA, 2023a) predicts that renewable energy would have to increase from 16% of global energy to 77% by 2050 to meet the Paris Climate Agreement's goal of keeping global temperatures within 1.5 °C of pre-industrial levels. IRENA also states that solar photovoltaic and wind energy would need to account for 70% of this transition, a conclusion corroborated by McKinsey & Company's analysis.

According to the World Bank (2020) and the International Energy Agency (IEA, 2021), technologies at the heart of clean energy, such as solar plants, wind farms, lithium-ion batteries, and electric vehicles, require critical minerals in quantities much greater than traditional energy technologies. These minerals serve important functions across a wide range of clean technologies. By 2040, aluminum (used for solar photovoltaic panel frames) and copper (used in conductive ribbon strips) are forecasted to have a 350% increase in demand to limit global warming well under 2 °C (World Bank, 2020). Similarly, demand for zinc, predominantly used in wind energy for protection against rust, is predicted to increase up to 80%. Lithium, graphite, cobalt, and nickel are likewise expected to see drastic growth, reflecting increased battery storage demand. Of these, lithium sees the greatest increase, with demand increasing over 40 times, while graphite, cobalt, and nickel all see demand growing by 20–25 times (IEA, 2021).

To create a sustainable future, renewable technologies and their mineral components are indispensable. The literature widely agrees that transitions in energy infrastructure will result in increases in mineral demand, and the IEA (2021) expresses this, detailing how the average quantity of minerals required for a unit of power generation has increased by 50% since 2010. Although this growth in the demand for minerals is an integral component of the clean energy lifecycle, it is but one node in the greater network; thus, any discussion of clean energy must go beyond this mineral demand and analyze upstream processes where materials are sourced.

Geographical Distribution of Critical Minerals

Increased reliance on critical minerals essential to the energy transition introduces several new threats to the stability and security of supply chains. The IEA (2021) expressed challenges, notably geographical concentration,

declining resource quality, and exposure to climate risks, among others. Due to limitations in scope and length, this review will only focus on the geographical distribution of critical minerals.

An extensive body of research suggests that many critical minerals are highly concentrated within a select few countries (IEA, 2021; IRENA, 2023b; World Bank, 2020). South Africa mines over 88% of the world's iridium and 73% of the world's platinum, while the DRC contributes 70% of the global cobalt supply, and China extracts over 64% of natural graphite (IRENA, 2023b). Including the aforementioned minerals, others, such as lithium and rare earth elements, see well over three-quarters of production concentrated in their respective top three producing nations. Additionally, the World Bank (2017) noted that over two-thirds of the world's population living in extreme poverty, or on less than $1.90 per day, inhabited 81 countries where critical minerals play a dominant role. Many low-income countries with large deposits view mineral extraction and processing as a central pillar of their economies (World Bank, 2017). This is only natural, as countries with large deposits should stand to benefit economically as the renewable energy sector expands. Ironically, the presence of vast natural resources in developing countries can stagnate economic development through a theory known as the "resource curse" (van der Ploeg, 2011). While the resource curse literature goes beyond the scope of this paper, many scholars fear that current decarbonization policies via extractive activities will harm rather than improve the lives of those in less developed, poorer nations (Dou et al., 2023; Kramarz et al., 2021; Sovacool et al., 2020).

However, much of the literature concerning the global geographical distribution of critical minerals relies on the U.S. Geological Survey. Although extensive, this survey has large gaps in data that result from a lack of accurate reporting, often in developing countries (Church & Crawford, 2018). Given this, there is a need for further research that will fill these gaps and provide comprehensive data on global mineral deposits.

Extractive Mining and Human Rights

Extractive mining is often demarcated into two subsections: large-scale mining and small-scale mining, which includes artisanal mining (ASM). Lacking a consistent international definition, ASM can range from miners working individually to those working in small groups with an investor. Large-scale mining consists of companies with advanced technology and large investments, while ASM is characterized by the labor-intensive use of basic tools (Hilson & Maconachie, 2020). Large-scale mining companies and small-scale miners often come into violent conflict over land and resources, which will only continue to be an issue as the mining of minerals grows worldwide.

In recent years, ASM has been growing throughout developing regions of the world and is a critical income stream for rural locals as well as a significant contributor to global production. ASM accounts for about 15–20% of global mineral production (Hilson & Maconachie, 2020), as well as over 75% of national production of gold and diamonds in the DRC and Sierra Leone (World Bank, 2009). The World Bank estimated that over 100 million people depend on

ASM, either directly or indirectly. However, the informal and unregulated nature of ASM is widely disruptive to human rights worldwide, with various studies showing poor conditions resulting in health and safety violations (Church & Crawford, 2018; Kramarz et al., 2021; Landrigan et al., 2022). Exposure to toxic elements, physical hazards, and infectious diseases are all constant threats to the health of artisanal workers (Landrigan et al., 2022). In addition, Landrigan et al. (2022) found that data on ASM remains unclear, as much of ASM occurs in developing, rural areas with little governmental oversight. This bleeds into the lack of comprehensive health data impacts of ASM, making sustainable regulatory measures challenging.

With the necessary expansion of mineral production due to renewable technology, the potential for exploitation of human rights will likely increase as more low-income workers flock to meet demand. The low barriers of entry to ASM allow for ease of access, making related health hazards of ASM all the more important to address as the sector grows. To ensure sustainable procurement of critical minerals and to combat the dangers of ASM, strategies—such as increasing access to lifesaving equipment and providing alternative pathways to economic success—will be necessary. Additionally, research into specific ASM data should be prioritized to fully understand the scale of health hazards and challenges.

Case Study: Democratic Republic of Congo

As evidenced by the above literature, I expect people in developing nations to experience human rights abuses in the mining industries that source materials for the renewable energy sector. The Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC) was selected for this case study due to a high concentration of cobalt within its borders. Consequently, the DRC will bear a large portion of the increased demand for cobalt resulting from the transition to renewable energy. This case study focuses on how increased demand for electric vehicles will subsequently increase demand for cobalt, placing more pressure on the DRC's mining industry. With the prevalence of ASM in the country, this analysis sheds light on how the global energy transition will likely increase human rights violations in the mining sector for the people of the DRC.

Brief Background on the Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC)

The DRC contains nearly half of the world's cobalt reserves and produces the majority of global cobalt. This concentration of worldwide cobalt production poses threats to stable supply chains due to the political instability and corruption that has plagued the DRC (Church & Crawford, 2018). Despite the presence of abundant natural resources, the DRC is one of the poorest nations in the world, with almost two-thirds of the population living below the international poverty line of $2.15 in 2022 (World Bank, n.d.). Amnesty International (2016) detailed how war and poor governance have mired the country in poverty, leading many to adopt ASM after the largest state-owned mining company collapsed in the 1990s. In 2002, a mining code attempting to regulate ASM was introduced, outlawing it outside of select authorized zones

(Amnesty International, 2016). However, this effort only led to the continuation of informal, or illegal, ASM. Although it only accounts for 20% of mining production, ASM in the DRC employs 98% of the mining workforce (Sovacool et al., 2020). The DRC government estimated that there were over 110,000 artisanal miners in the southern region of Congo (Amnesty International, 2016), while the World Bank (2009) estimated anywhere between 800,000 to 1.5 million workers. This discrepancy in data can be attributed to the largely informal character of ASM in the DRC. Despite international standards that address the unethical sourcing of critical minerals, Amnesty International found that multinational corporations—including Apple, Mercedes, Microsoft, Samsung, and Volkswagen—manufactured products with artisanal cobalt.

Lithium-ion Batteries and the Importance of Cobalt

The energy transition has increased demand for various technologies around the globe, and lithium-ion batteries are no exception. These batteries have a wide range of applications and have been instrumental in the development of devices such as smartphones and laptops. However, this market dominance is currently being overtaken by electric vehicles (Zubi et al., 2018). There is also potential for lithium-ion batteries to be used in energy storage. These applications of lithium-ion batteries make them a principal technology in clean energy agendas. In fact, demand for lithium-ion batteries has already been on the rise. Between 2019 and 2020, the number of battery mega-factories scheduled over the next decade increased from 118 to 181 (Moores 2021).

To understand the dependence of lithium-ion batteries on cobalt, a brief overview of battery chemistry is necessary. Lithium-ion batteries are comprised of four key components: the cathode, anode, electrolyte, and separator. The five main types of lithium-ion batteries identified in Zubi et al.'s study (2018) were characterized by the type of lithium metal oxide in the cathode. Of these five types, three involved cobalt, two of which dominate the electric vehicle industry. Due to the importance of cobalt in lithium-ion batteries, Zubi et al. concluded that the share of global cobalt used in lithium-ion production is rapidly increasing, with consumption jumping from 37,000 tons in 2016 to an estimated 76,000 tons in 2025. As 30% of global cobalt is used in lithium-ion production, increased demand for renewable technologies and lithium-ion batteries will have a direct impact on cobalt production in the DRC. Indeed, the IEA (2021) expects cobalt demand to soar by 21 times by 2040. However, it should be noted that battery technology changes rapidly (World Bank, 2020), and the significance of cobalt in future battery compositions may affect the demand impact on the DRC.

Cobalt Production in the DRC

The DRC is a critical country in global cobalt supply chains, producing around 70% of the world's cobalt (IEA, 2021; IRENA, 2023b). In addition to the geographical concentration of cobalt present in the DRC, the quality of reserves within the DRC is well above global averages, with the consulting firm KPMG (2014) claiming some mines have superior grades of 3% compared to the

average of 0.6% to 0.8% worldwide. Both the large quantities and high quality of cobalt found in the DRC suggest a continued dominance in global production, a conclusion corroborated by Seck et al.'s (2022) model, which predicted the DRC's cobalt output would remain between 60% and 67% of the global share through 2050.

The DRC's mining sector is a crucial sector of its economy, contributing over 80% of the country's export revenues (IRENA, 2023b). As the demand for renewable energy and cobalt continues to increase, the DRC's cobalt industry will continue to grow. As the next section will discuss, this growth poses the risk of perpetuating grave health conditions for artisanal miners within the sector.

Human Rights in the DRC's Artisanal Mining Industry

As discussed, ASM comprises a significant portion of the workforce in the DRC, where poor working conditions and various human rights violations against artisanal miners have been documented. Cobalt mining is dangerous by nature, as exposure to high levels of cobalt can cause many adverse health effects. This issue is only compounded by the lack of access to protective equipment that artisanal miners face. Long-term exposure to cobalt dust can cause "hard metal lung disease," a potentially fatal disease that targets the pulmonary system (Amnesty International, 2016). However, cobalt exposure is not limited to just miners. Alarmingly, research shows cobalt levels in the urine and blood of children and women living in mining communities were much higher than people living elsewhere (Sovacool, 2019). A preliminary study also suggested higher rates of birth defects when the father worked a mining-related job (Van Brusselen et al., 2020).

In addition to health risks stemming from the toxicity of metals, artisanal miners face danger in the form of occupational hazards. Miners work underground with basic tools, often without any support to prevent tunnel collapses (Amnesty International, 2016). ASM in the DRC also depends considerably on child labor. Children often operate surreptitiously on large-scale mining sites, sorting through discarded tailings and scraps. Amnesty International found that children as young as seven were working up to 12 hours a day, if not more, all while carrying heavy loads up to 40 kg. They also found that children were physically abused and extorted by security guards of large-scale mines. However, little data has been gathered on these types of abuses against children, because children fear reporting these incidents to authorities since they trespass on large company mining sites to conduct ASM.

These human rights violations are in large part a result of government policies and inadequate regulation. The 2002 mining code's establishment of certain mining areas prioritizes large-scale mining companies, which receive the highest quality mining land. This combined with the scant land allotted to ASM drives many artisanal miners to operate illegally outside of government-designated ASM zones (Amnesty International, 2016). Although the DRC has set up agencies to oversee the ASM zones, the government lacks regulation of ASM that occurs outside of designated zones. Amnesty International also discovered that some government officials exploit this situation; officials from

various agencies have controlled access to mines and extorted miners for money. Further, child labor in the DRC is intensified by the government's lack of funding for education. The DRC's free and mandatory education should theoretically decrease child labor by allowing for other routes to survival and prosperity. However, the state inadequately funds schools, thus leading to an often-unaffordable monthly school fee charged to parents, who, in turn, encourage their children to work in ASM or other jobs (Amnesty International, 2016).

Conclusions and Policy Recommendations

As this research has shown, critical minerals play irreplaceable roles in renewable technologies. Given the potential for human rights violations in countries with poor governance and large informal extractive sectors, the need for greater consideration of human rights when enacting clean energy policies is apparent. The clean energy transition is global in scale, affecting countries that participate in areas of the renewable technology lifecycle. Countries with large deposits of minerals are positioned to remain key suppliers to consumers of renewable energy technologies. Unfortunately, as seen in the case of the DRC, the mining of minerals for renewable energy has direct impacts on the human rights of workers and people living in the mining areas.

The DRC has long been characterized by political instability and violence. Fundamental issues of poverty, weak governance, and corruption have led to the rise of the ASM sector, and the human costs associated with it. Until these issues are addressed, human rights in the ASM sector will remain substandard. However, several policies could be implemented to mitigate the violation of human rights in the DRC's cobalt trade. These policies include increasing government funding for education, increasing the number of ASM zones, and cracking down on government corruption. Supporting schools with additional funding would reduce, if not eliminate, the high educational fees. This would reduce the need for additional income in the form of child labor while also providing children a path to a prosperous future. The source of this additional funding could be the large mining companies, either via higher rates of taxation, or mandates requiring the corporations to support schools in areas where they have been given access to mines. In addition, increasing the number of authorized ASM zones would reduce the need for miners to operate informally, thereby increasing the ability of the state to enforce safety regulations. Greater enforcement would also lessen the extortion of miners by private company guards as well as increase overall data on the ASM sector. Finally, by cracking down on government corruption, the DRC could prevent officials from shirking their duties and profiting off of workers.

Aside from national policy, international regulations can play a significant role in mitigating the health costs of ASM. Regulations, such as the UN Guiding Principles on Business and Human Rights, adequately outline protections for human rights, yet are not always followed, as demonstrated by the involvement of multinational corporations in artisanal cobalt supply chains. To combat this, greater pressures on supply chain transparency by the international community and home states of corporations could limit the use

of minerals from artisanal sources. In addition to enforcing international regulations, greater efforts to promote less mineral-intensive renewable technology would reduce the burden on extractive industries as a whole.

From this paper, several avenues for additional research can be highlighted. The relationships outlined in this paper do not exist in a vacuum, and the scope and length limited discussion on other relevant facets connecting renewable energy and human rights. Any feasible policy changes must rely on further research across contexts. For instance, research on the regulation and impacts of ASM is necessary to improve and enforce protections for workers and nonworkers living in different mining areas. Additionally, a greater effort to collect geographical data from developed and developing nations would provide a more holistic view of critical minerals and alternative deposits to mitigate supply chain vulnerabilities. Lastly, research into multinational corporations and their supply chains is vital in understanding the extent of artisanally sourced critical minerals and enforcing human rights.

This paper strives to expand the literature on the clean energy transition past mere supply chain challenges to highlight the importance of the ethical sourcing of critical minerals. As the effects of climate change intensify, threatening human society, discussions of clean energy will continue to become increasingly important. The case study of the DRC and its preponderant role in the global cobalt and battery economy exemplifies the urgency of addressing risks, such as poor governance and international accountability, and the successive human rights challenges that threaten the foundation of an ethical energy transition. As the clean technology sector grows, improvements in technology will contribute to shifts in specific mineral demands, but the need to implement these changes sustainably and with a human rights lens will remain.

Acknowledgements

References

Al-Ghussain, L. (2019). Global warming: Review on driving forces and mitigation. *Environmental Progress & Sustainable Energy*, *38*(1), 13-21. https://doi.org/10.1002/ep.13041

Allen, M.R., Dube, O. P., Solecki, W., Aragón-Durand, F., Cramer, W., Humphreys, S., Kainuma, M., Kala, J., Mahowald, N., Mulugetta, Y., Perez, R., Wairiu, M., and Zickfeld, K. (2018) *Global Warming of 1.5°C. An IPCC Special Report on the impacts of global warming of 1.5°C above pre-industrial levels and related global greenhouse gas emission pathways, in the context of strengthening the global response to the threat of climate change, sustainable development, and efforts to eradicate poverty.* Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change. https://doi.org/10.1017/9781009157940.003

Amnesty International. (2016). *This is what we die for": Human rights abuses in the Democratic Republic of the Congo power the global trade in cobalt.* https://www.amnesty.org/en/documents/afr62/3183/2016/en/

Church, C., Crawford, A. (2018). *Green Conflict Minerals: The fuels of conflict in the transition to a low-carbon economy.* International Institute for Sustainable Development. https://www.iisd.org/system/files/publications/green-conflict-minerals.pdf

Dou, S., Xu, D., Zhu, Y., & Keenan, R. (2023). Critical mineral sustainable supply: Challenges and governance. *Futures, 146*, Article 103101. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.futures.2023.103101

Hilson, G., & Maconachie, R. (2020). Artisanal and small-scale mining and the Sustainable Development Goals: Opportunities and new directions for sub-Saharan Africa. *Geoforum, 111*, 125-141. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geoforum.2019.09.006

International Energy Agency. (2021). *The Role of Critical Minerals in Clean Energy Transitions.* https://www.iea.org/reports/the-role-of-critical-minerals-in-clean-energy-transitions

International Renewable Energy Agency. (2023a). *World Energy Transitions Outlook 2023: 1.5°C Pathway.* (Vol. 1). https://www.irena.org/Publications/2023/Jun/World-Energy-Transitions-Outlook-2023

International Renewable Energy Agency. (2023b). *Geopolitics of the energy transition: Critical materials.* https://www.irena.org/Publications/2023/Jul/Geopolitics-of-the-Energy-Transition-Critical-Materials

Kramarz, T., Park, S., & Johnson, C. (2021). Governing the dark side of renewable energy: A typology of global displacements. *Energy Research & Social Science, 74*, Article 101902. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.erss.2020.101902

KPMG. (2014). *Democratic Republic of Congo: Country Mining Guide.* Retrieved December 4, 2023, https://assets.kpmg.com/content/dam/kpmg/pdf/2014/09/democratic-republic-congo-mining-guide.pdf

Landrigan, P., Bose-O'Reilly, S., Elbel, J., Nordberg, G., Lucchini, R., Bartrem, C., Grandjean, P., Mergler, D., Moyo, D., Nemery, B., Braun, M., & Nowak, D. (2022). Reducing disease and death from Artisanal and Small-Scale Mining (ASM) – the urgent need for responsible mining in the context of growing global demand for minerals and metals for climate change mitigation. *Environmental Health, 21,* Article 78. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12940-022-00877-5

McKinsey & Company. (2023, Oct. 18). *Global Energy Perspective 2023.* Retrieved November 20, 2023, https://www.mckinsey.com/industries/oil-and-gas/our-insights/global-energy-perspective-2023#/

Moores, S. (2021). *The Global Battery Arms Race: Lithium-ion battery gigafactories and their supply chain.* The Oxford Institute for Energy Studies. https://www.oxfordenergy.org/wpcms/wp-content/uploads/2021/02/THE-GLOBAL-BATTERY-ARMS-RACE-LITHIUM-ION-BATTERY-GIGAFACTORIES-AND-THEIR-SUPPLY-CHAIN.pdf

Rossati, A. (2017). Global Warming and Its Health Impact. *The International Journal of Occupational and Environmental Medicine, 8*(1), 7-20. https://doi.org/10.15171/ijoem.2017.963

Seck, G. S., Hache, E., & Barnet, C. (2022). Potential bottleneck in the energy transition: The case of cobalt in an accelerating electro-mobility world. *Resources Policy, 75*, Article 102516. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.resourpol.2021.102516

Sovacool, B. K. (2019). The precarious political economy of cobalt: Balancing prosperity, poverty, and brutality in artisanal and industrial mining in the Democratic Republic of the Congo. *The Extractive Industries and Society, 6*(3), 915-939. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.exis.2019.05.018

Sovacool, B. K., Hook, A., Martiskainen, M., Brock, A., & Turnheim, B. (2020). The decarbonisation divide: Contextualizing landscapes of low-carbon exploitation and toxicity in Africa. *Global Environmental Change, 60,* Article 102028. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gloenvcha.2019.102028

United Nations. (n.d.). *What is Climate Change?* Retrieved January 2, 2024, https://www.un.org/en/climatechange/what-is-climate-change

Van Brusselen, D., Kayembe-Kitenge, T., Mbuyi-Musanzayi, S., Lubala Kasole, T., Kabamba Ngombe, L., Musa Obadia, P., Kyanika Wa Mukoma, D., Van Herck, K., Avonts, D., Devriendt, K., Smolders, E., Nkulu, C. B. L., & Nemery, B. (2020). Metal mining and birth defects: a case-control study in Lubumbashi, Democratic Republic of the Congo. *The Lancet. Planetary health, 4*(4), 158–167. https://doi.org/10.1016/S2542-5196(20)30059-0

van der Ploeg, F. (2011). Natural Resources: Curse or Blessing? *Journal of Economic Literature, 49*(2), 366-420. https://doi.org/10.1257/jel.49.2.366

The World Bank. (n.d.). *Democratic Republic of Congo: Overview.* Retrieved December 8, 2023, from https://www.worldbank.org/en/country/drc/overview

The World Bank. (2009). *Mining Together: Large-Scale Mining Meets Artisanal Mining, A Guide for Action.* https://documents1.worldbank.org/curated/en/148081468163163514/pdf/686190ESW0P112ongoTogether0HDofinal.pdf

The World Bank. (2017). *The Growing Role of Minerals and Metals for a Low Carbon Future.* https://documents1.worldbank.org/curated/en/207371500386458722/pdf/117581-WP-P159838-PUBLIC-ClimateSmartMiningJuly.pdf

The World Bank. (2020). *Minerals for Climate Action: The Mineral Intensity of the Clean Energy Transition.* https://pubdocs.worldbank.org/en/961711588875536384/Minerals-for-Climate-Action-The-Mineral-Intensity-of-the-Clean-Energy-Transition.pdf

Zubi, G., Dufo-López, R., Carvalho, M., & Pasaoglu, G. (2018). The lithium-ion battery: State of the art and future perspectives. *Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews, 89*, 292-308. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rser.2018.03.002

DU
PAIN

Exploring Female Participation in
the French Revolution: Was It Worth It?

Alyssa Godwin

Departments of English & Comparative Literature and History

Abstract

When discussing major historical events, there is a tendency to group, or at least discuss, the participation of all social groups and credit them with the outcome. In the discussion of the French Revolution, women's participation in the revolutionary effort alludes to female involvement post-revolution, immediately including them in the benefits of the French Revolution. However, women's rights took a significant step back following the revolution, opening the door for new discussion on whether the effort during the revolution automatically meant that the movement should be included in women's history. In this shift, the central question of whether women even had a French Revolution arises, splitting the historical world into two rival schools of thought: yes, women had a French Revolution or something adjacent to it, or no, women are not able to be included in the French Revolution due to the restrictions following the event. In discussing these rival schools, the top historians or sources who cover the topic of women in the French Revolution spearhead this historiographical paper. By analyzing their work debating female participation and inclusion during the revolution, the rival schools demonstrate the historical shift in women's history and open the door for further consideration regarding women and minority groups in significant events.

Keywords: French Revolution, women's history, historiography, marginalized history, political participation, feminist history

In July 1789, an enraged, Enlightenment-driven mob of French citizens, both men and women, stormed the Bastille—the chants "Liberté, Égalité, Fraternité" echoing from the porphyry cobblestone streets. Fueled by the terrors of taxation, starvation, rapid population growth, and an unrepresentative government, the storming of the Bastille is widely credited with the beginnings of the French Revolution. Additionally, in October of that same year, more than 6,000 Parisian women marched on the Palace of Versailles, protesting the unobtainable price of bread. These women were market women, or "fishwives," armed with carving and kitchen knives, chanting for the same equality called for in the surge on the Bastille. The Women's March on Versailles demonstrated a political and social power for women in French politics as the Royal Family agreed to return to Paris and be subjected to the people's will (Landes, 1988, p. 109). While the French Revolution is one of the

most studied revolutions in world history, serving as a bookmark between absolutist monarchial Europe and the concept of democracy, the coverage surrounding female activism during this time is minute compared to the actions of male counterparts, revealing a void of historical narratives and representation.

The narratives of today's French Revolution scholars depend largely on the writings and perspectives of other antecedent historians. By gathering critical studies of works of colleagues, mentors, and authors, historians gain diverse perspectives on historical evidence, allowing them to establish a more complete picture. The study of past scholarship on the events or people of the past is referred to as historiography – a web of varied perspectives on historical events tied together by an author who analyzes or studies the continuity and change in historical writing over time. Change is inevitable, and historiography seeks to recognize, highlight, and explain the shifts in attitudes in historical perspectives or, on the contrary, to unite the works through the similarities that link them back to one another over decades. Recognizing the shifts in scholarship is a mirror into cultural attitudes and the tides of today, as older works function as time capsules and building blocks to reach recent conclusions. In fields like women's history, the change in social, cultural, and political perspectives in the 1970s and 1980s contributed to shifts throughout recent scholarship, making historiographical studies gateways to understanding modern attitudes. For history as a field, the French Revolution was an event that created a domino effect worldwide. Yet the revolution's place in women's history is still debated, taking form in two rival schools of thought. On the one hand, scholars argue that the revolution contributed to women's history because of female involvement and contributions. Other scholars, however, challenge that stance, positing that the revolution should not be considered a part of women's history due to the regressive tendencies that followed the movement.

Even in the shortage of scholarship focusing on women in the French Revolution, there is no denying the women's participation and influence to the movement—women were an undisputed, foundational factor throughout the revolution. However, does participation in a revolution guarantee an equally revolutionary outcome for all participants? In her 1976 article, "Did Women Have a Renaissance?" Joan Kelly-Gadol questions the outcome of the Renaissance, analyzing women's role in pre- and post-Renaissance Europe, finalizing that while scholars credit this central historical turning point as a universal experience, it was simply a masculine one. While the movement prioritized the value of a robust, well-rounded education, the reality of the Renaissance was a reinforcement of traditional gender roles, preventing women from having access to education and any contribution to intellectual life. Analyzing aspects of class and social relations, political involvement, and ideological perspectives, Kelly-Gadol uncovered the objectification and dependency of Renaissance women in a male-dominated and androcentric Renaissance (Kelly-Gadol, 1979). While the Renaissance is regularly referred to as an impactful moment of "rebirth," it was realistically a reinforcement of traditional, subordinate gender roles. Her conclusion shook the historiography of feminist history, pushing historians to explore and use her question to study

the role of women in other major historical events. The French Revolution was a radical turn in French and European history, shaping political, moral, and sociocultural thinking. However, though the voices calling for Jacobin "Life, Liberty, and Fraternity" were unisex, one might be led to ask if the outcome was as inclusive as the fight. Applying Kelly-Gadol's question to the French Revolution, scholars of women's history study the vast influence of women throughout the revolutionary effort, yet study the question of if women, as the chants quieted and the guillotines stored, get as equal of an outcome as their male counterparts? Or, as Kelly-Gadol's research into the Renaissance reveals, was this yet another major historical event misinterpreted as universal?

In answering this question, recent scholarship is divided. While most historians covering women's participation in the French Revolution agree that women had an inarguable role in the political and social environment, the kind of revolution, whether positive or negative, is disputed. Some authors argue that women did not have a revolution, especially in comparison to the male population. To these scholars, the political participation by female revolutionaries did not match the same outcome of the revolution, and therefore, the movement cannot be recognized with women in mind. Others, however, say that French women did, in some way, have a revolution, whether positive or obstructive. These historians assert that because women were direct, active participants in the French Revolution, the revolution was inherently theirs as much as it was for men, no matter the political, social, or legislative outcome. While Joan Kelly-Gadol opened the divisive conversation of female participation in major historical events, today's scholars continue to debate and analyze the answer. This is what historians refer to as a historiographical debate.

Defining what qualifies as a revolution is essential to understanding the roots of the discussion about whether women did or did not have a French Revolution. Jack A. Goldstone, in his second edition of *Revolutions: A Very Short Introduction*, represents a revolution as "the forcible overthrow of a government through mass mobilization in the name of social justice, to create a new political institution" (Goldstone, 2014, p. 4). By this definition, women actively and directly participated in the "forcible overthrow" of the French monarchy, spearheading the March on Versailles. Historians who argue in favor of women having a French Revolution push that because women were heavily participatory in the revolutionary effort, they had a revolution. However, the movement was not as positive in the outcome compared to the male revolutionaries. In other words, yes, they had a revolution because of their indisputable political, social, and domestic involvement, but it was not an equal revolution.

To understand the context of today's scholarly debate, we must envision the French woman of 1789, perched on the windowsill of the private sphere, looking out to the public realm just beyond her. Women in pre-Revolutionary France were subjugated and reliant on men, lacking the right to vote or maintain any political influence. The realms of intellectual or educational life were reserved and limited to men, relegating French women to the domestic sphere entirely. However, armed with bread knives and the whispers of insurrection, the women of France experienced a shift that upturned their

political and social rights, leveling them to the same men who once dictated their lives. With the revolution came the open doors of political saloons, where men and women were encouraged to meet, discuss political ideology, and plan for the action to come. Even in the private sphere, the ideologies that fueled the French Revolution uplifted women's rights as the call for "republican motherhood" echoed throughout Parisian households. Under the intellectual philosophies of Jean-Jacques Rousseau came the concept of republican motherhood, which advocated for women to assume an assertive role in the household through the education of both sons and daughters. The inclusion of women as having a role in the political upbringing of youth, as well as the rhetoric including daughters in the population to be educated, exemplifies a shift in political thinking regarding gender. While still separated, the role given to women provided an achievement in itself, highlighting just one of the benefits that came to women alongside the revolution. However, even with the progressive successes of the movement, the French Revolution was ultimately a bell curve for women's rights, providing a peak as women took control and participated in political action before reverting to levels lower than pre-Revolutionary France.

Some scholars hesitate to decide if the participation of women equals automatic inclusion in a significant historical event. To Sean Wright, in his 2013 publication *Insurrectionary Heroines: The Possibilities and Limits of Women's Radical Action During the French Revolution*, the absence of liberty in post-revolution France translates to no female revolution. Under Wright's argument, the banishment of women's political rights and citizenship denial metamorphoses into a banishment from the French Revolution as a whole. Throughout his article, Wright cites four main actions done by French women that directly contributed, or led, the revolution: the March on Versailles, the Bread Riots of 1795, the Society of Revolutionary Republican Women, and *The Declaration of the Rights of Women* in 1991. As women marched, stormed, and raided their way into Versailles, carrying pikes that held the heads of guards or as they openly discussed the necessity of equality in France, the political action done by female revolutionaries forever shook the French Revolution, opening the door for a more open discussion of women's rights, while also making male counterparts weary. Wright describes the role of women in radical action taken before and during the revolution, describing their participation alongside men and the expectation that the liberty being fought for would extend to female revolutionaries.

The radical action and behavior discussed by Wright were encouraged, fought for, and done by both men and women, yet the inclusion of women worked against their rights as male revolutionaries looked next to them in their fight against the monarchy to find female faces. As revolutionaries destroyed and executed the monarchy, placing the heads of both aristocrats and commoners on spikes that were displayed along the streets of Paris, the realization that sisters, mothers, and daughters fought alongside them in equal violence was startling. Alongside analyzing French women's actions, Wright explains how the behavior scared female inclusion in reformist political spheres away, ultimately proving "French society's inability to handle radical female political behavior" (Wright, 2023, p. 3). Wright analyzes the political course of

action women took, ultimately deducing that female political action, with a specification on radical action, was wholly dependent on male revolutionaries, foreshadowing the limitations forced on women who sought to be heard during and after the revolution. While female revolutionaries were vocal and supportive of revolutionary efforts, there was an overarching exclusion of women from prominent political groups like the National Assembly, which had a no-women policy. With the publication of *The Declaration of the Rights of Man and of the Citizen,* Olympe de Gouge and other French feminists addressed the absence of women in the document and sought to advocate gender equality in the political sphere of France. Wright argues that Olympe de Gouges' *The Declaration of the Rights of Woman* was a "direct challenge to the limiting ideals of patriarchal control over the revolution," pushing that for such a document to exist in the first place, a document demanding political and social equality, means that women did not have nearly the same revolution as their male revolutionary counterparts (Wright, 2014, p. 4). Using the political involvement of women and comparing the outcome following the revolution, Wright's article and other scholars argue that because women did not get the payoff or equality they fought for in the Revolution, this absence of liberty translates into the lack of a revolution. Where once women were able to be involved and even lead political atmospheres, on October 30, 1793, the First French Republic permanently prohibited the attendance of French women in organized political groups.

Popular analysis of the French Revolution centers largely around urban populations and large-scale trends. However, Dominique Godineau, in her 1988 publication *The Women of Paris,* focuses not on noble or aristocratic women but on "the common woman" or "the working woman" and her role in the Revolution (Godineau, 1998). Like Wright, Godineau's argument agrees that while women played a vital role in the revolution and political action, and their initiative served as a major turning point in feminist history, the revolution and its outcome were strictly masculine, with women rarely, if ever, presented as complex conceptual revolutionaries (Godineau, 1998). She argues that women were commonly painted beside the revolution instead of in it, recalling Kelly-Gadol's point that depictions of major historical events can misinterpret universality rather than being entangled and ingrained in historical narratives. Godineau describes how women's history often parallels major movements like the French Revolution despite women's immediate involvement. Can we say that women had a French Revolution when what they fought for was either ignored or directly worked against? Alongside this question runs the analysis and evolution of citizenship for French women and what that looks like in domestic and political spheres, questioning if "any sort of political existence" outside of their spouse was possible after the revolution and whether that serves as evidence for the lack of a female French Revolution (Godineau, 1998). The regressive tendencies following the revolution, according to Godineau, override female political participation during the movement. Where once women were allowed in political spheres, sitting next to and leading male revolutionaries, the end of the revolution meant that they were not allowed to congregate in any political setting, forcing them back into the private, domestic sphere and successfully distancing women from the French Revolution.

Samantha Dobbie, in her 2024 dissertation "Women's Political Agency in Revolutionary Paris, 1789-1793 - Enlighten Theses," analyzes several primary sources from the French Revolution, from salon writers like Madame Roland to groups like the Society of Revolutionary Republican Women, to describe women's political agency pre- and post-revolution. Dobbie describes the extension of female political action and allowance, but also their reception in varying degrees to which female membership in political clubs was tolerated. Using this analysis, Dobbie concludes that the lack of tolerance in fraternal political societies pushed women to establish their own network of early feminist ideals, framing the French Revolution as a revolution for men but an even more significant turning point for French women and, consequently, modern feminist thinking. One of her most prominent arguments is that the political influence on revolutionaries from women was done out of "political survival" and short-term alliances, reflecting the political turnout post-revolution as political rights were stripped from women who were forbidden to be a part of women's political clubs (Dobbie, 2024). While Dobbie recognizes that the French Revolution inspired an undisputed amount of female political action, she ultimately argues that the French Revolution remained a masculine movement and, thus, was significant for its contribution to modern feminist history point than an actual revolution for women. To this point, Dobbie sides with Kelly-Gadol's point that the French Revolution, like the Renaissance, was ultimately a masculine political movement that didn't count in women's history.

Historians like Godineau and Dobbie, who argue that women did not have a French Revolution, do so with a post-revolution perspective. Because the outcome of the effort did not match and was radically different from the political action present during the movement, scholars say that the revolution should not be counted with women in mind. The contrast between women being allowed in political clubs, even running their own, and the domestic banishment to the home is stark. Like Kelly-Gadol's analysis, historians argue that either regressive or ineffective outcome translates to an inability to count major historical events as part of women's history. However, scholars who oppose this position argue that to say that women did not have a French Revolution is ignoring the political and social efforts of female revolutionaries. The conflict between the two rival schools of thought poses a critical, echoing question for the history of all marginalized groups. Can two steps forward and one step back be considered a revolutionary success? I would argue that if structural and systematic change is required to label a revolution, then, in the context of women's experiences in the French Revolution, an inarguable change did, undisputedly, occur, but was later regressive and ultimately harmful to women's rights.

Joan B. Landes' *Women and the Public Sphere in the Age of the French Revolution* broadly represents the concept of women having a revolution, just not an equal one. Landes' analysis of French women in the pre-revolution public takes on Kelly-Gadol's method to examine whether women had a Renaissance. Here, she "insists that the eighteenth century [specifically the Renaissance as a historical event] marked a turning point for women in the construction of modern gender identity" (Landes, 1988, p. 22). While not outright disagreeing with Kelly-Gadol's analysis, Landes emphasizes how

exclusion and progress can be simultaneously achieved and recognized when it comes to analyzing women's involvement in major historical movements. While women were excluded from Renaissance achievements and ideals, Landes argues that there was a definite moment when a new degree of power coexisted between men and women. Landes' position on Kelly-Gadol's argument that women did not have a Renaissance is homogeneous to her opinion on whether women had a French Revolution. According to Landes, both a step back and forward are possible: women in the French Revolution, she concludes, were vastly influential in their political participation while simultaneously experiencing resistance and discrimination. Women participated in the French Revolution and gained civil rights recognition while concurrently experiencing political repression and activist punishment.

The idea that women experienced both wins and losses is shared by scholars who agree that women, whether it was a complete, equal revolution, had a revolutionary experience. In her 1975 article "Feminism in the French Revolution," Jane Abray outlines the advancements and declines in women's rights during and following the French Revolution. Abray highlights how women experienced an advance in political participation during the revolution and gained civil and marriage rights after it. However, the article simultaneously highlights the background of the forefathers of the French Revolution and their misogynistic tendencies, foreshadowing the shift in the removal of female political participation (Abray, 1975, p. 13). According to Abray, denying female citizenship was a predictable result of the French Revolution. While women lost the ability to participate in political clubs, Abray highlights a loophole utilized by factions and women to maintain female political agency when she argued that the government "did not take [women] seriously," they were used by some political groups to give "subversive speeches for which men could be jailed," making them key figures in post-revolution political affairs (Abray, 1975, p. 13). Like Landes, Abray analyzes the steps forward and backward when discussing female participation and the outcome of the revolution, arguing that women did have a French Revolution because of the involvement and steps forward in civil and marital rights.

For historians arguing that women did have a French Revolution, the extent to which they participated and the outcome wavers. For some, like Landes and Abray, successful progress can coincide with regression. However, historians like Olwen Hufton conclude that the French Revolution was a successful step forward in women's history. In her 1994 publication *Women and the Limits of Citizenship in the French Revolution*, Hufton argues that, despite setbacks and inequities, women did have a revolution: their "responses transformed and modified the entire history of the period" on a scale that extended beyond France (Hufton, 1992, p. 3). Like Dominique Godineau, who focused on French working women, Hufton broadened her contextual understanding of working populations outside of Paris. While Godineau focuses on the working women of Paris, Hufton argues that those rural groups had little to no choice during the revolution and responded to it with resistance. Hufton differentiates between female revolutionaries in urban contexts and women in rural France, finding that women outside of Paris were not only hesitant to embrace the new ideals of the French Revolution but entirely resistant to it. For these groups,

Hufton argues that "it was possible for women to subvert the revolution in the home and on the domestic front" and turn the regressive rights following the revolution around (Hufton, 1992, p. 10). In this way, Hufton explains that rural French women had a revolution that was actually counter-revolutionary during and after the French Revolution in Paris. By distinguishing the complex difference between rural and urban French women, Hufton recognizes a counter-revolution experienced by French women protesting the radical change happening in Paris. Hufton's argument reveals a larger context of political participation in private spheres, providing different examples of women's historical agency.

All scholarship agrees that women took direct political action and participated in revolutionary efforts to one degree or another. From Dobbie to Landes, scholars directly acknowledge and agree that the French Revolution would not have occurred without female revolutionary efforts. We, as contemporary historians, need to acknowledge duality: we can recognize that women were inarguably participating in direct revolutionary action while also acknowledging that the aftermath of the French Revolution ultimately opposed main female political efforts. To say that women never had a French Revolution simply because it did not look the same as it did for men would be to discount political action taken by female revolutionaries. This would be like arguing that the nearly 200,000 African American union soldiers and activists did not prove their equality, fight for emancipation, nor earn their citizenship simply because President Andrew Johnson later revoked those earned rights during the Age of Reconstruction, beginning what is referred to as "the nadir of American race relations. (National Archives, 2023; Pettigrew, 1980). African American contributions and Reconstruction gains are still too often either vaguely included discussions of the American Civil War or even wholly ignored, revealing a problematic trend when it comes to the inclusion of marginalized groups in historical narratives. The broad inclusion, or the assumption of an equal effect, is another form of dismissing their history, as it ignores the necessity of recognizing both the participation of minority political efforts and the possibility of retrogression. It would be wholly inaccurate and dismissive to argue that African Americans did not have a Civil War experience in the 19th century, just as it is inaccurate and dismissive to argue that French women did not have a revolutionary experience and legacy.

Joan Kelly-Gadol's question about whether women had a Renaissance has opened the door for more analysis, both inside and outside of women's history. When women's history began as a field of study and analysis in the late 1970s, Kelly-Gadol's article caused a certain revolution in its own right, upturning the long-mossed stones of assumed inclusion. The historiography of female inclusion in major historical events grows beyond the French Revolution and into other historical movements and revolutions, revealing either a methodological gap in historical coverage or general representation. Likewise, Kelly-Gadol's questioning whether a marginalized group experienced a significant event opens the door for this same questioning regarding other marginalized groups, a change in perspective that changed not only women's history but also human history in general.

Arguing that women did not have a French Revolution is an erasure of women's history and feminist efforts, continuing the minimization or dismissal of women from major events. Women had a revolutionary experience. Their voices were not only entangled with male revolutionaries, but they led them. As Samantha Dobbie argues, at the very minimum, the French Revolution was a turning point in women's history. The advocacy and action of female revolutionaries were an awakening that have long passed the chronological boundaries of the French Revolution period. The women who led the March on Versailles - their leadership, community, and intensity - continued to be called upon throughout the later feminist movements. The effort made by Olympe de Gouges and fellow French female advocates continues to succeed the revolution and inspire the women's rights movements of today. Dobbie and Hufton's analysis that women had a separate but parallel French Revolution is a testament to the necessity of duality in feminist historical analysis. Additionally, this duality must include the paired acknowledgment of rural and urban French women and their differing experiences as passive citizens. To openly discuss women in the French Revolution, the parameters of women as a social group and the almost unrecognizable process of political participation-based regression must be mentioned and advocated.

Acknowledgements

References

Abray, J. (1975). "Feminism in the French Revolution." *The American Historical Review, 80*(1), 43–62. JSTOR. https://doi.org/10.2307/1859051

Dobbie, S. (2024). *Women's Political Agency in Revolutionary Paris, 1789-1793 - Enlighten Theses* [Review of *Women's Political Agency in Revolutionary Paris, 1789-1793 - Enlighten Theses*]. Https://Theses.gla.ac.uk/84358/1/2024DobbiePhD.pdf.

Godineau, D. (1998). *The Women of Paris and Their French Revolution*. University Of California Press.

Goldstone, J. A. (2014). *Revolutions: A Very Short Introduction*. Oxford University Press.

Hufton, O. H. (1992). *Women and the limits of citizenship in the French Revolution*. University Of Toronto Press.

Kelly-Gadol, J. (1976). "Did Women Have a Renaissance?" https://nguyenshs.weebly.com/uploads/9/3/7/3/93734528/kelly_did_women_have_a_renaissanace.pdf.

Landes, J. B. (1988). *Women and the Public Sphere in the Age of the French Revolution*. Cornell University Press.

National Archives. (2023, October 4). *Black Soldiers in the U.S. Military During the Civil War*. National Archives; The U.S. National Archives and Records Administration. https://www.archives.gov/education/lessons/blacks-civil-war

Pettigrew, T. F. (1980). *The Sociology of Race Relations: Reflection and Reform*. Free Press.

Wright, S. (2013). *Grand Valley Journal of History Insurrectionary Heroines: The Possibilities and Limits of Women's Radical Action During the French Revolution*. https://scholarworks.gvsu.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1047&context=gvjh

In the City of Fury

Bernardo Miranda Sanchez
Department of English & Comparative Literature

Abstract

What follows here is a work of creative writing dealing with various themes that relate to life in Tijuana, exposed in an abstract magical realism short story. Literary inspiration for this work includes Ernest Hemingway's minimalistic style from novels like The Sun Also Rises, *and Latin American magical realism novels like Juan Rulfo's* Pedro Paramo. *The various magical or supernatural elements in the story are juxtaposed with a harsh reality. When characters react to such elements it is in a nonchalant way meant to invoke similar reactions to violence that people in Tijuana sometimes show a stoic mentality towards. A quick summary of the story is of a young man that has gone through the death of his brother and now deals with the aftermath of that experience. We read the story from his perspective as he describes the violence of Tijuana in a poetic, melancholic way that wishes for calmer times; times of innocence when he could feel and be sensible. This blend of magical elements with a realistic environment is meant to describe the complex reality of life in Mexico that can only be described to outsiders in the fantastical, the banal, in the dark comedy, and the surrealist. Salvador Dali once said: "There is no way I'm going back to Mexico. I can't stand to be in a country that is more surrealist than my paintings."*

Key words: Dogs, blankets, beach, dead, Tijuana

> *"And when he woke up. It was still there."*

These were some of the ultraviolent years in Tijuana, the ones that come, go and return. In other countries, other cities, blankets are used to cover children on cold nights. In México, blankets are used to wrap corpses to be dumped on the road, outside stores, schools, boulevards, or even to wrap those hanging from bridges. Underneath those blankets of colorful cartoon animals, you would find the remains of a human now a bloated, bloody bag of flesh. Those years in Tijuana came and went. The blankets shelter the children again. Now the only bodies you see on the road are dead dogs. Sometimes altars appear on the edges of the roads; Virgin Marys protect the dogs. Even during those years not even the quiet coastal borough of Playas was without a scene of violence; many blankets had been used in those years. They even killed my favorite taquero; he was found lying at the doorstep of his shop, dead. His wife closed their place and went with their daughter to the United States. Because of that Manuel and I went to another taco stand.

"There is a party on Saturday," he told me, it was Wednesday.

"Whose?"

"I don't know, someone from our year. They already told me where it is." Things were starting to calm down around the city, and it was a few weeks before the last year of high school ended. Last year two kids from our school ended up dead by the river. They had dropped out at the beginning of high school, but we knew them. There were rumors that they were involved in trafficking drugs to San Diego. Last year there was a student who had been kidnapped, but they paid the ransom, and he was let go. He never talked about what happened.

A dog walked down the street towards us, and I threw him a tortilla. He was gray and small. "Do you think it has a name?" I asked Manuel.

"Don't know, ask him."

"I'm going to name him Jose"

"He looks more like a Felipe," Manuel told me.

"My name is Marques," said the dog.

"His name is Marques he says."

"I used to be a narco, but they killed me, and I came back to life as a dog. I found the one who killed me, he was a dog too, I killed him and ate a bit of his ear."

"He says he kills dogs."

"And so it ends," Manuel said.

I walked along the beach. It was cloudy, and gray, with a wet fog crashing on my face, among the mists a dead woman appeared playing a giant piano, the sound was that of a sad guitar. "I have seen you before," she told me.

"I've seen you on the news; they barely found you last week. The sea tide brought you back with your clothes destroyed, body swollen and purple. But still very pretty, young." "Everyone says that," she said.

"The pretty part?"

"I hope they remember me."

"They will."

"Will you remember me longer than your brother?"

I didn't respond. She was wearing a dirty, soaked white dress, and makeup. The piano was now swollen from water damage, legs broken, teeth missing, a hole on the side. She was still playing when the sea rose and she devoured everything, waking me back to my room.

It was now Saturday night, Manuel picked me up and we made our way towards the party. It was on a patio, and the patio was covered in white tables, red cups, liquor bottles and a mass of strangers with no responsibilities. Music blasted and bright colorful lights blinded me, and I was indifferent to most of the people there. I lost Manuel for a while and then found him again talking to some friend of hers, having some conversation about love and human development. I got into the conversation, she asked me about love and human development, and that was when I told her something that left her confused and perhaps irritated. I was already drunk. I walked into some other group of people that weren't really friends but were not strangers either. They were talking about violence in the nation. About whose fault it was, how to fix it,

how to not fix it, and ignorance. They were very ignorant. There is an old joke where two people are talking and one says, what is worse, ignorance or indifference? the other responds "I don't know, and I don't care." I was caught in a conversation with someone I really didn't like but he didn't know that. At some point during the conversation, I answered to some inquiry of him by just saying: "Fuck I don't know perhaps you are just a cunt."

It was getting hard for me to keep going from place to place and to still not be able to find a reference to myself. Steph was there, and I didn't care to talk to her. What would be the point of talking to my dead brother's girlfriend. She is like my mother, ashamed of the way my brother died, I wonder if she is lying. My mother would lie and tell people my brother died on the road through the mountain range of La Rumorosa. And why even correct people about it? Maybe I should have some more shame about it. He was a dog and died like a dog. He never prayed with us at dinner; neither did my father before or after he died. I was getting too drunk, too honest, and too frail and sensitive.

I keep seeing Steph around and would think about how she must have told more than a couple of people about my brother's death. If she lied, I would think she was a snob but if she told the truth about it, I would think of her as insolent and disrespectful towards my brother. Leave him alone. Stumbled my way around the party and fell into another conversation with another group of strangers that once called me a friend. They kept talking about violence, dead dogs, blankets, and gunshots and then someone asked me about my brother, and everyone was watching me, and Steph was watching me as if I reminded her of my brother, and I was tired and sensitive and kept thinking about my brother. My brother who died. My brother that died in a bar, not driving La Rumorosa as my mother said, in a fight like my father, he always got into fights, but this time it was with the wrong person and he ended up stabbed 6 times, in downtown and unnoticed, he died bleeding out on his way to the general hospital. Before he died, he once drunk told me that he hated me. If he had died in Playas everyone would have known the truth. Then I just said, "My mother said that he died on the Rumorosa Highway, but he died in a drunk bar fight."

Acknowledgements

MUSIC FOR THE MILLION.

Religious Argumentations and the Construction of Race in Early America

Michael Weiler
Departments of Psychology and Religious Studies

Abstract

Religion and race are two interlinked concepts that have shaped each other throughout North America. This article explores the interconnection of religion and race in certain Christian discourses in early America, focusing on argumentations that were employed to justify enslavement and colonialism. Through various examples such as The Great Chain of Being, The Doctrine of Discovery, Manifest Destiny, and others, this article contends that theological arguments were utilized to construct the concept of race. The construction of race had many consequences throughout history which are also examined. The article also explores how Christian religious reasoning was employed to argue against the very same oppression and racial hierarchy that was supported by religious argumentation in early America. For this reason, race and religion must be analyzed and understood together, as attempting to analyze them separately would fail to capture their full context and implications.

Keywords: Christianity, early North America, race, colonization, religion, slavery

Introduction

Religion and race have a deeply interconnected history which has shaped contemporary social systems, defined how they are structured, and determined how they operate. In early America, Christian argumentations have had a central role in the creation of the concept of race, as well as justifying colonization and slavery. When discussing race, it is important to critically analyze the role of religion in the construction of race in order to understand historical context and its impact in shaping today's world. While religious reasoning has been employed to construct a hierarchy of power based on race in early America, religious reasoning has also been used to argue against this hierarchy. Christian reasoning has been utilized to promote liberation and justice throughout early America, arguing against things like slavery. This convergent history is crucial to recognize and investigate to understand both religion and race.

Religion and Indigenous Peoples of North America

In early America, religious argumentations had an important role in creating a dehumanized and infantilized understanding of Indigenous peoples. This

dehumanized perception of Indigenous peoples acted as justification for centuries of maltreatment of Indigenous peoples, which includes indoctrination, stolen land, forced removal, termination of sovereignty, and genocide. These actions were justified by certain religious arguments and sanctioned by specific Christian organizations.

When Europeans and Indigenous Americans first came into contact, they perceived each other in very different ways. While Europeans were met with cautious hospitality, Indigenous spiritual traditions were described as "animism," and were perceived as primitive and childish by the Europeans (Avalos, 2020). This was the first stage of infantilizing and animalizing the Indigenous peoples of America. They were considered inferior due to their beliefs being "unsophisticated," which allowed Europeans to establish their superiority by considering Indigenous peoples to be child-like or animal-like, ultimately dehumanizing them. This accentuates religious scholar Talal Asad's argument that the ruling or dominating culture defines what religion is (1993). This concept was used as a tool to dehumanize the oppressed group, as religion was considered intrinsic to be human by the Europeans. If the dominating culture determines the oppressed culture to not have religion according to the dominator's definition, they can then question and even deny the humanity of the oppressed people.

Land Ownership

The differences in religious beliefs between Europeans and Indigenous Americans were abundantly apparent, and these differences were often exploited by the Europeans. The largest example of this was the idea of private land ownership. While land ownership did exist to some degree before European contact, the concepts greatly differed between Indigenous Americans and the Europeans. Many Indigenous groups in North America did not believe people could own land, especially in an exclusive and absolute manner (Otto, 1999). This concept of ownership of land was brought to America by the Europeans, who then claimed they owned this land. This European concept of land ownership can be attributed to The Great Chain of Being, which is a Christian hierarchy of beings. This hierarchy poses God at the top, followed by angels, humans, animals, plants, and finally land. This granted humans "dominion over" the land (as well as plants and animals) from the European perspective, which created the concept of private land ownership (Wilber, 1993).

This was a foundational concept to colonialism, as seizing and owning land was motivated and justified by Christian beliefs. The Great Chain of Being would also act as a framework for the hierarchy of whiteness based on polygenesis, which was the concept that each race evolved or was created independently, implying that some races can be superior or inferior to others. This concept of private land also shows the massive role of religion in the construction of contemporary social systems, as private property is at the very foundation of capitalism, which is the most common economic system in the world (Choi, 2022).

Doctrine of Discovery, Requerimiento, and Manifest Destiny

Another crucial example of how colonization was justified is The Doctrine of Discovery. The Doctrine of Discovery was a document issued by the Catholic Popes which established legal grounds for the seizure of any non-Christian occupied land. This acted as both moral and legal justification for the theft of Indigenous lands around the world (United Nations, 2022). The religious argument behind this document was that Christianity was the supreme religion, and that Christians were the superior people. By this logic, it was the obligation of the Catholic Church to spread Christianity to any land or people that were not Christian, and anything that these Christians did was justified because they were superior, therefore they had the right to claim land as their own.

The colonization of North America and its justification were not only supported but commissioned by the Catholic Church. This colonization took place on both coasts of the continent, with the reading of the Requerimiento on the west coast and Manifest Destiny on the east coast. The Requerimiento was a document that was read to Indigenous peoples of the west coast as an ultimatum, stating that each Indigenous person had a choice; assimilate to Catholicism, or risk subjugation, enslavement, or death. This document also declared the Roman Catholic Pope to have religious authority over the entire world and was central in the colonization of the west coast of North America (Council of Castile, 1510). Colonization by the Catholic Church was most prominent on the west coast through the California missions, which were also a powerful tool in the indoctrination and forced assimilation of Indigenous Americans. These missions were built by the Catholic Church in order to colonize and indoctrinate much of the west coast, operating in the 18th and early 19th century, and directly resulted in the deaths of at least a third of the Indigenous population of California (Castillo, n.d.).

On the east coast, Manifest Destiny played a similar role. Manifest Destiny was the belief that white Christians must settle the entire contiguous United States and spread the word of God throughout its lands (Dunbar-Ortiz, 2015). Manifest Destiny followed a very similar religious reasoning to the Doctrine of Discovery, arguing for the superiority of Christian religion, culture, and people, and justifying westward expansion of the United States and subsequent maltreatment of Indigenous peoples that occupied the land (Miller, 2015). It was prevalent on the east coast and acted as motivation and justification for the seizure of Indigenous land and the forced removal of Indigenous peoples, as well as the violence that accompanied this expansion. Manifest Destiny took place in the early to mid-19th century and was largely supported by the Puritans, among other Protestants, as well as Mormons (Scott, n.d.). Indigenous groups were stripped of their land and forced to flee west, a journey during which many perished. The most infamous case being the Trail of Tears, which caused the deaths of thousands of Cherokee people, among others (Dunbar-Ortiz, 2015). Indigenous groups were often allocated land for reservations west of the Mississippi; however, this land lacked the wealth of resources that their native land had, not to mention that these peoples were

culturally and spiritually connected to their original land. All of this was supported by the concept of Manifest Destiny, which was based on the Doctrine of Discovery. The logic behind Manifest Destiny was that Christians were doing the Indigenous peoples a favor, as they would be indoctrinated into the "superior" religion and culture, thus helping, and ultimately saving them by converting them and their land to the rule of Christianity.

These actions over time culminated in multiple genocides of Indigenous Americans and resulted in the destruction of Indigenous culture, language, and social systems. This genocide was driven by disease, as Indigenous Americans had no immunity to European diseases, and at times disease was intentionally spread by Europeans to the Indigenous Americans (Hibbard, 2023). It was furthered by assimilation, forced removal, enslavement, and execution, and has contributed to the current lack of Indigenous culture, population, land, and sovereignty throughout North America.

Christian Boarding Schools

While the Requerimiento served as an initial tool for the indoctrination of Indigenous Americans, which was later followed by Manifest Destiny in a similar fashion, one of the most impactful mechanisms for indoctrination and assimilation in the United States during the 19th and 20th centuries was boarding schools (Cronquist, 2021). These schools were intended to separate Indigenous children from their people and culture, both psychologically and physically. The goal was to assimilate these children into white Christian culture, language, and religion.

These boarding schools were also widely prevalent in Canada, where children faced indoctrination, abuse, and death (Pember, 2021). Indigenous children were not permitted to practice their culture in any way, which led to intense detachment between Indigenous peoples and their culture, traditions, and language. These boarding schools were also present in Mexico and were directly operated in each country by their respective federal governments (Adams et al., 2007). This has led to the current state of culture and language loss of Indigenous peoples in North America. These boarding schools, in the U.S., Canada, and Mexico, were not only supported, but were often directly operated by the Catholic Church in collaboration with federal governments (Pember, 2021).

Termination of Sovereignty

While the dominant culture of white Christianity had already removed, assimilated, and killed the vast majority of the Indigenous population, this was not the end. The few Indigenous groups that survived these centuries of subjugation were still entitled to legal sovereignty; however, this largely came to an end throughout North America. In the U.S., this was called the termination era, where Indigenous sovereignty was largely abolished by the U.S. government from the 1930s to the 1970s (Bureau of Indian Affairs, 2024). Today, while Indigenous groups are technically supposed to have some level of sovereignty regarding the formation and enforcement of laws, tribes in the U.S.

and Canada are not able to enforce their laws due to federal interference and are therefore unable to be truly sovereign (Crane-Murdoch, 2013).

While Mexico had a different history regarding colonization and assimilation of Indigenous culture, the pattern remained consistent for the Indigenous groups that tried to maintain autonomy and sovereignty in Mexico. The most famous example was the war between the Mexican government and the Indigenous Zapatistas, which resulted in strong limitations to the sovereignty of the Zapatistas and all Indigenous groups in Mexico (Australian Institute of International Affairs, 2023). These terminations of sovereignty can be seen as a final nail in the coffin of the centuries of colonization, land theft, abuse, and overall maltreatment of the Indigenous peoples of North America. They clearly exhibit the lack of regard to the rights of Indigenous Americans which directly stems from the religious ideas that dehumanized Indigenous peoples and eventually developed into the hierarchy of whiteness.

Ultimately, religious concepts, rhetoric, and organizations themselves were used to dehumanize, tyrannize, and destroy the Indigenous peoples of North America, and to colonize their land and resources.

Religious Reasoning and Slavery

Religious beliefs and institutions have also been used to justify the dehumanization and historical maltreatment of African people and the African diaspora. This includes colonial rule, theft of resources, abduction, and slavery. These actions were motivated, sanctioned, and justified by certain Christian beliefs and established organizations.

Similar to the perception of the religious and spiritual beliefs of the Indigenous groups of North America, African culture, tradition, and religion were also perceived as primitive and childish. This was the first stage in the animalization, infantilization, and bestialization of African culture, spiritual belief, and sexuality (Collins, 2004). Not only were African religious beliefs infantilized and animalized, but their expressions in the African diaspora in North America were considered dangerous and evil, and even criminalized (Jesús, 2024). Europeans then questioned the humanity of African people due to their professed primitive religions, ultimately dehumanizing them. African people were also animalized through their sexuality, which was fetishized, exoticized, and bestialized, portraying African sexuality as animal-like, once again dehumanizing them (Collins, 2004). This highlights Asad's argument that the ruling culture defines religion, which is used as a tool to dehumanize the oppressed group, as religion was considered intrinsic to be human by the Europeans (1993). If the ruling culture determines that the oppressed culture does not have religion according to the dominator's definition, they are able to deny the humanity of the oppressed people.

Transatlantic Slave Trade and Colonialism Justified by Polygenesis

The colonization of Africa followed a similar pattern of religious motivation and justification to North America. This colonization was supported and defended by certain Christian concepts and Catholic legal documents such as

the Doctrine of Discovery (United Nations, 2022). The religious reasoning was the same: Christian religion, culture, and people are superior; therefore, they are entitled to any land that is not inhabited by Christians and are permitted to treat non-Christians as inferior and less human. In a similar manner, the Transatlantic Slave Trade, which entailed the abduction and enslavement of Indigenous Africans, was justified by certain Christian beliefs. A foundational argument for the justification of slavery was polygenesis. Polygenesis was the concept that each ethnicity or race had evolved or was created independently, therefore the races of people may differ in their level of evolution, suggesting that some races are evolutionarily inferior to others (Keel, 2013). This, combined with Social Darwinism, was used to pose Africans, and essentially all non-white people, as inferior to white people, and used the domination and subjugation of non-white people as evidence for white superiority.

This was incorporated into the model of The Great Chain of Being in two different ways. The first framed white people as created by God, while framing non-white people as evolved from animals, therefore they were inferior. The second framed a single race created by God, from which humans degenerated, white people being the least degenerated, and Black people being the most degenerated (Gould, 1981). This led to the construction of the hierarchy of whiteness, which will be discussed later. The framing of white people as people of God acted as motivation and justification for both the colonization of Africa, and enslavement of its people.

Like North America, the colonization of Africa was viewed as the ordained right of Christians as declared by the Doctrine of Discovery. Slavery was also justified by polygenesis and The Great Chain of Being, as white Christians were granted dominion over everything that fell below them in this hierarchy, which in this case included all non-white people (Wilber, 1993). The Great Chain of Being served as a framework that not only justified but actively reinforced the hierarchy of whiteness and dehumanized Africans and Black people (Jackson, 2020). The Great Chain of Being was a hierarchy that granted humans supremacy over animals and land, and due to the animalized perception of African people, white Europeans considered themselves superior to Black people and all non-white people. By placing people with darker skin below them in The Great Chain of Being, the Europeans used this religious reasoning as both motivation and justification for the authority and dominance of Africans, and in turn their land, as they were granted superiority over everything below them in The Great Chain of Being. While this practice of dehumanization is similar to that of Indigenous Americans, instead of centering around genocide, stealing land, and settling, it was centered around the extraction of resources and enslavement of people. Ultimately, certain Christian beliefs have been rationalizations for the exploitation of Africa and its Indigenous peoples.

Indoctrination and Weaponized Religion

Throughout the era of slavery in the United States, countless slaves were indoctrinated into Christianity. The religion was taught to slaves with a specific rhetorical intent to ensure their obedience to white slave owners (Muhammed,

2022). This greatly differed from how Christianity was taught to white people. While white people learned about things like liberation and rights through Christianity, its religious teachings were manipulated and presented to slaves in a way that would reinforce obedience and discourage insubordination (Muhammed, 2022). This is a clear example of Asad's argument that the ruling class, in this case white slave owners, defines and constructs what religion is, and in turn, creates the structure of social power by which all people are subjugated to (1993).

Religion also had a role in the maltreatment of Black Americans after the civil war and the end of slavery. Fueled by the desire to preserve white supremacy, the Ku Klux Klan, also known as the KKK, grew into a massive paramilitary following the abolition of slavery. Professor and author Randall Stephens argues that this organization was foundationally based upon ideas of religious ethnonationalism (2017). The KKK had direct ties and motivation from Christianity, specifically Protestantism. This can be seen in what is one of the most recognizable symbols of the KKK aside from the infamous white robes, a burning cross. The burning of crosses is a clear representation of the weaponization of Christianity and is representative of the inextricable link between the KKK, Christianity, and white supremacy (Stephens, 2017). The rhetoric of the KKK also emphasized ethnic purity, which along with white supremacy was connected to religious concepts such as The Great Chain of Being and polygenesis.

The Creation of Whiteness and The Melting Pot

The direct connection between the hierarchy of whiteness and Christianity can also be seen in the shift in language and treatment of freed slaves in the late 17th century. While most scholars agree that the term "white" and the concept of whiteness stemmed from the word "Christian," in Barbados this was a direct response to the existence of freed Black Christians (Gerbner, 2018). The most cited example of this was Charles Cuffee, who was a free Black Christian. Because Cuffee was free and Christian, he was allowed certain rights according to the language of the law, such as voting. This led to the laws being changed, as Christian slave owners protested that Black people should not have these rights at all. The word "Christian" was replaced with the word "white," restricting the rights of all non-white people. Whiteness was a legal category that was created by slave owners to protect slavery and restrict the rights and freedoms of all Black people (Gerbner, 2018). Much of the Protestant colonies followed suit, and throughout the end of the 17th century the term "Christian" shifted to the term "white," thus creating the concept of whiteness and establishing an order of white supremacy (Gerbner, 2018). This also shows the evolution of this hierarchy, as just being Christian was no longer enough to be superior according to the Doctrine of Discovery; superiority was then reserved for those who were Christian and white.

Throughout the United States, the analogy of the melting pot has been used to describe the culture of the United States. All cultures are "melted" into the pot, creating a universal culture for U.S. citizens that is formed from a combination of everyone's culture. This is widely criticized and considered an

inaccurate model of culture in the U.S. by most scholars of ethnic studies (Amoskala, 2020). The true melting pot is that of white people. Early in the life of the U.S., most people racially identified by their own culture, including Europeans. White people's races were categorized as follows: Italian, Irish, Spanish, English, etc. However, the melting pot effect did not apply to all people of the U.S., but instead only for Europeans. Over time, Europeans were no longer Italian, Irish, Spanish, English, etc., but simply white (Amoskala, 2020).

This was both a result of and a factor in the construction of the hierarchy of whiteness. The hierarchy of whiteness is a class system that establishes the superiority of white people over non-white people (Choi, 2022). It directly stems from The Great Chain of Being, which is a Christian concept that was employed to establish white superiority, dominance, and supremacy over all non-white people (Jackson, 2020). This is often an implicit and subconscious attitude, meaning many people are unaware that they hold this bias. As a result, many people would not attribute it to Christianity even though it is directly related to multiple expressions of Christianity throughout history. This hierarchy of whiteness is pervasive throughout American culture and is reflected in all major social institutions, even today (Choi, 2022).

Ultimately, specific expressions of Christianity have had an irrefutable role in the construction of race and its social hierarchy. This racial hierarchy, which is paradigm that values white people above all people of color, is both a consequence of and a motivation for the colonization of Africa and the Transatlantic Slave Trade. The construction of this hierarchy has had enormous impacts on people throughout history and persists even today.

Religious Arguments for Justice

While this article concentrated on the role of religion in colonialism and slavery, it is also important to acknowledge the role of religion in fighting for liberation and justice. In North America, while certain interpretations of Christianity were used to construct whiteness as an ideal category, Christian religious reasoning has also been used to liberate people from the oppression that stemmed from this.

Christianity and the Abolition of Slavery

While Christian beliefs and organizations had an undeniable role in the creation of whiteness and the practice of slavery, they had a very important role in the abolition of slavery as well. Christianity was often weaponized against slaves to maintain obedience, however, it also played a critical role in various slave revolts prior to the abolition of slavery (Wyatt-Brown, n.d.). The Black church had an enormous role in advocating for the abolition of slavery. Religious leaders such as Frederick Douglass and Sojourner Truth not only used the Black church as a platform to advocate for abolition but utilized Christian beliefs and reasoning such as equality before God and the emancipatory attitude of God to support their argument for the abolishment of slavery (Mellowes, 2019). While Christian reasoning such as polygenesis was used to

support and defend slavery, it was also used to dispute and reject slavery. The Black church played the largest role in the abolition movement; however, it was not the only Christian group to do so. There were also large numbers of white Evangelicals in the north who actively opposed slavery and argued for abolition, employing Christian reasoning to argue against slavery (Morris, 2007).

Christian Protest of Colonization and Slavery

Throughout the history of colonization and slavery, there was much debate about the ethics of these actions. Not all Christians and not all Europeans supported these actions, in fact, there was intense debate throughout Europe about the violent actions that were taking place on other continents (Graeber & Wengrow, 2021). While this debate is at times ignored, many Catholics and Protestants did not support colonization or slavery whatsoever, and thought it went against their religion. In the mid-eighteenth century, there was also a shift among some Protestants' view of Indigenous culture and religion. Many Protestants on the east coast developed more complex understandings of Indigenous culture and religion, which resulted in debate about moral appeals of religions rather than arguments of racial hierarchy (Valeri, 2023).

Another crucial example of Christian reasoning for justice is the emergence of liberation theology. Liberation theology argued that religion should actively fight against social injustices and has led to churches playing a larger part in fighting to lift people from oppression. While it began and is most prevalent in South America, it has reached all corners of the globe including North America and has also led to the development of Black liberation theology, which seeks to liberate all Black people from any oppression that stems from colonialism and white supremacy (Avalos, 2020).

Conclusion

Religion and race are associated due to their interdependent history in colonialism and slavery. It is for these reasons that scholars such as Sylvia Chan-Malik argue that it is not only uninformed to try to understand race and religion independently, but quite impossible to understand one without understanding the other (2020). While the focus of this article is relevant to North America, this pattern has had a global impact. The impacts of colonialism are so extensive that this article could only focus on race, religion, and colonialism in North America and Africa, while there are a vast number of impacts on a global scale. Additionally, this article focused on race and did not even begin to address the role of religion in the domination of women, queer people, neurodivergent people, and generally any nonconforming person. This again brings us back to Asad's argument that the dominating class establishes a status quo and then punishes those who do not conform (1993).

Religion is immensely powerful, and due to this immense power, it has enormous consequences no matter how it is utilized. Religious reasoning, specifically Christian arguments in this case, have been utilized for the construction of race and the hierarchy of white supremacy which is prevalent around the world. At the same time, Christian reasoning has also been utilized

to argue for the liberation and freedom of all oppressed people. This exhibits the immense power of religion and the massive role it has had in shaping the dynamics of race, just as racial dynamics have continued to shape the state of religion. For these reasons, it would be ignorant to examine both religion and race without understanding their interdependent past and present.

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank Professor Jung Min Choi for the inspiration to create work like this. I would also like to thank former Professor Lori Stewart for introducing me to religious studies and sparking my passion for the field. I would also like to acknowledge the class Writing on Religion, as this article is based on an essay written for that class. I would also like to thank Professor Caitlyn Thompson for her role in enhancing my ability to write on this topic. I would also like to acknowledge Professor Desmond Hassing and Professor Antwanisha Alameen-Shavers for their role in expanding my knowledge and passion for these topics. Finally, I would like to thank Professor Angela Feres for everything she has done both in my academic and personal life.

References

Adams, D. W., Fitzgerald, T., & United Nations Permanent Forum on Indigenous Issues. (2007). Historical overview of boarding schools. In *United Nations Permanent Forum on Indigenous Issues* (pp. 2–3). https://www.un.org/esa/socdev/unpfii/documents/IPS_Boarding_Schools.pdf

Amoskala. (2020, February 21). *The Melting Pot vs. The Salad Bowl – Black & Green Atlantic*. https://sites.nd.edu/blackandgreenatlantic/2020/02/21/the-melting-pot-vs-the-salad-bowl/

Asad, T. (1993). Genealogies of Religion. In *Johns Hopkins University Press eBooks*. https://doi.org/10.1353/book.16014

Australian Institute of International Affairs. (2023, May 5). *The Zapatista Movement: The fight for Indigenous rights in Mexico - Australian Institute of International Affairs*. https://www.internationalaffairs.org.au/news-item/the-zapatista-movement-the-fight-for-indigenous-rights-in-mexico/

Avalos, N. (2020, October 14). *Taking a critical indigenous and ethnic studies approach to decolonizing religious studies*. Contending Modernities; University of Notre Dame Keough School of Global Affairs. https://contendingmodernities.nd.edu/decoloniality/critical-indigenous-approach/

Bureau of Indian Affairs Records: Termination. (2024, September 9). National Archives. https://www.archives.gov/research/native-americans/bia/termination

Castillo, E. D. (n.d.). *California Indian History – California Native American Heritage Commission*. https://nahc.ca.gov/native-americans/california-indian-history/#:~:text=About%20100%2C000%20or%20nearly%20a,of%20the%20missions%20of%20California.

Chang, M., Meizhu Lui, Insight Center for Community Economic Development, Ford Foundation, Levi Strauss Foundation, & Women and Wealth Working Group. (2010). Lifting as we climb: Women of Color, Wealth, and America's Future. In *Insight Center for Community Economic Development*. https://static1.squarespace.com/static/5c50b84131d4df5265e7392d/t/5c5c7801ec212d4fd499ba39/1549563907681/Lifting_As_We_Climb_InsightCCED_2010.pdf

Chan-Malik, S. (2020, May 15). race. *SSRC The Immanent Frame*. https://tif.ssrc.org/2020/05/15/race-chan-malik/

Choi, J. M. (2022). *Lecture at San Diego State University*. Sociology Department.

Collins, P. H. (2004). *Black sexual politics: African Americans, Gender, and the New Racism*. Psychology Press.

Council of Castile. (1510). REQUERIMIENTO. In National Humanities Center, *National Humanities Center Resource Toolbox*. https://nationalhumanitiescenter.org/pds/amerbegin/contact/text7/requirement.pdf

Crane-Murdoch, S. (2013, February 27). On Indian land, criminals can get away with almost anything. *The Atlantic*. https://www.theatlantic.com/national/archive/2013/02/on-indian-land-criminals-can-get-away-with-almost-anything/273391/

Cronquist, O. (2021). From Captive to Captor: Hannah Duston and the Indian Removal Act [Masters Thesis, Brigham Young University]. In *BYU ScholarsArchive*. https://scholarsarchive.byu.edu/etd/8962/

Dunbar-Ortiz, R. (2015). *An Indigenous Peoples' history of the United States*. Beacon Press.

Franklin, B. (1751). *Observations concerning the Increase of Mankind*. Founders Online, National Archives. https://founders.archives.gov/documents/Franklin/01-04-02-0080

Gerbner, K. (2018). Chapter 4. From Christian to white. In *University of Pennsylvania Press eBooks* (pp. 74–90). https://doi.org/10.9783/9780812294903-005

Gould, S. J. (1981). American Polygeny and Craniometry before Darwin. In *The Mismeasure of Man*. W. W. Norton.

Graeber, D., & Wengrow, D. (2021). *The dawn of everything: A New History of Humanity*. Allen Lane.

Hibbard, A. (2023, November 15). *Investigating the smallpox blanket controversy*. ASM.org. https://asm.org/articles/2023/november/investigating-the-smallpox-blanket-controversy

Hilliard, S. B. (2024, September 7). *Native American Land Loss Maps — Civil Rights teaching*. Civil Rights Teaching. https://www.civilrightsteaching.org/resource/native-american-land-loss-maps

Jackson, Z. I. (2020). Becoming human. In *New York University Press eBooks*. https://doi.org/10.18574/nyu/9781479873623.001.0001

Jesús, A. M. B. (2024). *Excited delirium: Race, Police Violence, and the Invention of a Disease*. Duke University Press.

Kamara, K. (2023, December 19). *Reparation Payments May Narrow Racial Disparities - Penn LDI*. Penn LDI. https://ldi.upenn.edu/our-work/research-updates/the-wealth-and-health-gap-between-black-and-white

Keel, T. D. (2013). Religion, polygenism and the early science of human origins. *History of the Human Sciences*, *26*(2), 3–32. https://doi.org/10.1177/0952695113482916

Kochhar, R., & Moslimani, M. (2023, December 4). *2. Wealth gaps across racial and ethnic groups*. Pew Research Center. https://www.pewresearch.org/2023/12/04/wealth-gaps-across-racial-and-ethnic-groups/

Mellowes, M. (2019, May 13). The Black Church. *American Experience | PBS*. https://www.pbs.org/wgbh/americanexperience/features/godinamerica-black-church/#:~:text=uprisings%20and%20abolition.-,ABOLITION,slavery%20would%20suffer%20divine%20punishment.

Miller, R. J. (2015, May 14). *The Doctrine of discovery, Manifest Destiny, and American Indians*. https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=2689279

Morris, B. F. (2007a). *The Christian life and character of the civil institutions of the United States*. American Vision.

Muhammad, E. A. (2022). Weaponizing Religion: A document analysis of the religious indoctrination of slaves in service of white labor elites. *University of Georgia*. https://www.libs.uga.edu/reserves/docs/main-archive/2022/main-fall2022/roulston-qual8150/muhammad-weaponizing-religion.pdf

Otto, P. (Winter 1999): 75-83, Previously published in De Halve Maen 72, no. 4, reprinted in A Beautiful and Fruitful Place: Selected Rensselaerswijck Papers, vol. 3, edited by Margriet Lacy, 41-48. Albany: New Netherland Institute, 2013 Posted with permission https://digitalcommons.georgefox.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1064&context=hist_fac

Pember, M. A. (2021, November 24). Unearthing the legacy of Native American boarding schools. *The Atlantic*. https://www.theatlantic.com/ideas/archive/2021/11/native-american-boarding-schools/620760/

Sambol-Tosco, K. (n.d.). *Slavery and the Making of America. The Slave Experience: Religion*. PBS. https://www.thirteen.org/wnet/slavery/experience/religion/history2.html

Scott, D. M. (n.d.). *The Religious Origins of Manifest Destiny, Divining America, TeacherServe©, National Humanities Center*.

https://nationalhumanitiescenter.org/tserve/nineteen/nkeyinfo/mandestiny.htm?utm_source=perplexity

Smith, J. M. (2012). Maintaining racial inequality through crime control: mass incarceration and residential segregation. *Contemporary Justice Review*, *15*(4), 469–484. https://doi.org/10.1080/10282580.2012.734577

Stephens, R. J. (2017, June 26). *The Klan, White Christianity, and the Past and Present*. The University of Chicago. https://voices.uchicago.edu/religionculture/2017/06/26/the-klan-white-christianity-and-the-past-and-present-a-response-to-kelly-j-baker-by-randall-j-stephens/

United Nations. (2022, May 8). *'Doctrine of Discovery', Used for Centuries to Justify Seizure of Indigenous Land, Subjugate Peoples, Must Be Repudiated by United Nations, Permanent Forum Told* [HR] https://press.un.org/en/2012/hr5088.doc.htm

US Census Bureau, Orzechowski, S., & Sepielli, P. (2003). *Net worth and asset ownership of households: 1998 and 2000* (Report No. P70-88). U.S. Census Bureau. https://www2.census.gov/library/publications/2003/demo/p70-88.pdf

Valeri, M. (2023). *The opening of the Protestant mind: How Anglo-American Protestants Embraced Religious Liberty*. Oxford University Press.

Wilber, K. (1993). The great chain of being. *Journal of Humanistic Psychology*, *33*(3), 52–65. https://doi.org/10.1177/00221678930333006

Wyatt-Brown, B. (n.d.). *American Abolitionism and Religion*. Divining America, TeacherServe®. National Humanities Center. https://nationalhumanitiescenter.org/tserve/nineteen/nkeyinfo/amabrel.htm

SNOW WHITE AND OTHER STORIES

by the Brothers Grimm

With illustrations in color
by Wuanita Smith

And in black and white
by Edward Shenton

the portrayals of the on-screen princesses. The first section covers the first three princesses: Snow White, Cinderella, and Aurora. The second generation includes Ariel, Belle, Jasmine, Pocahontas, and Mulan. The final and current generation includes Tiana, Rapunzel, Merida, Anna, Elsa, and Moana. These sections reveal how the increase of women and women of color in Disney Animation influenced the on-screen evolution of the princesses throughout the three generations.

Disney Princesses have become a complicated symbol in our culture. Some fondly remember childhoods filled with magic and fairytales, while others look back and critique the messages about gender and race that were sent to impressionable children. Disney Princesses are at the heart of our culture, and as the name of the franchise, they represent the face of the Walt Disney Company. The messages Disney sends out about gender and race are influential on children; therefore, it is important that these stories relay positive messages to children and provide representation to children who see themselves in the princesses. This evolution is not only important for identifying progress, but also for highlighting the areas where there is still progress to be made.

The study of the Disney Princess is a well-established topic that spans disciplines from feminist and gender studies to business and economics. With such a wide range of approaches, it can be hard to make sense of the existing scholarship. Some scholars focus on the nature of the princesses and gender, while others investigate the role of the production and economic processes. Current scholarship largely examines the evolution of the Disney Princess either through the lens of gender and feminism, through the lens of race and ethnicity, or through the lens of production and economics. This paper examines the intersection of these approaches to understand how the production process influenced on-screen gender and racial depictions.

Many scholars investigate the relationship between gender and the Disney Princess. Some provide a general overview of gender in the films, while others focus on a specific film or princess. In her article "Gender Role Portrayal and the Disney Princesses," Dawn England and her co-authors examine the representation of gender roles in the Disney Princess films. They find that the prince and princess characters display a mix of traditionally masculine and feminine characteristics, but the princesses' behaviors were more varied across the films than the princes' behaviors were. England and her co-authors conclude that the evolution of gender roles across the films is complex and not always linear. Other scholars focus on specific films to investigate gender. The journal article "Constructing

the evolution of princesses. Women at different stages of production shape the characters and stories in different ways and have been doing so throughout the decades of Disney. Change comes from within the companies as employee demographics expand to include more voices. Change also comes from external feedback from fans and critics that prompts changes in production. Both internal and external pressure for change follows the social and political movements of the time, like the many waves of feminism. These changes reflect the need for greater, more accurate, and appropriate representation in animated Disney Princess movies.

Animated Disney Princesses play a big role in defining gender and racial roles in society. Because of their prominence in pop culture, they inform viewers on cultural values like what it means to be a woman or how to be a valued member of society. They exemplify societal definitions of "good" and "bad" through consistent themes across films' characters and storylines. It is particularly important to pay attention to these messages because the main audience of animated Disney films is young children. The films are often children's first exposure to certain harsh societal identity definitions–like those within gender and race. These messages start to draw boxes around identity, influencing both how children see themselves and their peers (Baker-Sperry, 2007, p.719). Every story adds information to a child's developing concept of gender roles, among other identities. These films are incredibly powerful in enculturating children, informing them about what they and their peers can and cannot do in our society (Baker-Sperry, 2007, p.718).

First-Generation Disney Princesses: The Emergence of Women at Disney

The era referred to as first-generation Disney Princesses includes *Snow White* (1937), *Cinderella* (1950), and *Sleeping Beauty* (1959). In addition to starting the Disney Princess franchise, these films established the "happily ever after" and "true love's kiss" as the important moments for princesses (Hatheway et al., 2017). These ideas are reasonable reflections of the time period and aligned with the goals and expectations for women. However, these films were made almost entirely by men, without voices of women in leadership roles. As a result, women are portrayed as having little ambition beyond finding a man to "rescue" them and give them a better life, which was generally the message for young girls at the time (Bucksbaum, 2022).

In order to understand how Disney's princesses and their stories are evolving, Disney's evolution as a company must be explored. Women have had a long and revolutionary history at Disney Animation. The first woman hired for Disney Animation was Bianca Majolie in 1935, two years before the release of their first princess film, *Snow White*. Majolie worked in the all-male story department, doing technical work like translations of original stories into English (Holt, 2023). She would go on to select music, write material, and create character inspiration that would shape some of Disney's biggest films of the first generation (1937-1959). Despite her contributions, she received high levels of criticism from her male colleagues, which left her feeling anxious in the workplace (Holt, 2023). As the first woman hired at Disney Animation, Majolie paved the way for women to make bigger impacts on the stories and characters.

Sylvia Holland was the first female story director, and Retta Scott was the first credited female animator; both were large accomplishments in representation in the Disney workplace during the 1930s. Mary Blair was hired in 1940 and worked closely with Walt Disney in the early days (Holt, 2023). She went on Disney's first research trip, was later promoted to art director, and worked on many films. Her artistic contributions created lasting change in defining the art style of Disney films from the 1950s (Holt, 2023).

While women have worked at Disney nearly since its beginning, their small numbers limited their voice, agency, and impact on characters and stories. Furthermore, like the anxiety Mojolie faced being an "outsider" to the boy's club of animation, women at early Disney experienced discrimination and microaggressions on a daily basis, making Disney a difficult and potentially undesirable place to work.

The first-generation princess films were coming out during the World Wars and the very beginning of feminist movements, which fought for women's place in the workforce. Perhaps in response to these events, the early Disney Princess films presented an idealized version of feminine life and how women were expected to act at the time. Quickly the onset of second-wave feminism and the increased normalization of women in the workforce allowed a shift in Disney Princesses on screen and more women's voices behind the scenes. Thus, the bluntly passive female characters came to an end with the beginning of second-wave feminism in the 1960s-70s, introducing a new era of princess movies (Bucksbaum, 2022).

In summary, the production of first-generation animated Disney Princesses saw the very beginning of women working in animation. While the presence of a few women was historic, they had little impact on how women were portrayed in Disney films. However, these women involved in the production process paved the way for Disney Princesses on the big screen to become more representative of women's experiences, eventually leading to the animated Disney Princesses of today.

Second-Generation Disney Princesses: Cultural Sensitivity

Disney experienced a three-decade gap during which no princess films were released. This gap can be explained by a few factors including changes in the animation industry, financial considerations, and the death of Walt Disney leading to management changes (Walt Disney Animation Studios, 2024). This time became a transition period at Disney, which allowed time to employ more women. Ending the break, the second generation of Disney Princesses emerged in 1989 with *The Little Mermaid* and went on to include *Beauty and the Beast* (1991), *Aladdin* (1992), *Pocahontas* (1995), and *Mulan* (1998).

This Disney era saw big changes in character personality including the voice and ambition of princesses; however, they still ended up finding husbands to end their journeys. These behaviors align with certain motives of second-wave feminism of the 1960s and 1970s that focused on increasing women in the workplace. Disney films across the board, not just princess films, overrepresented female characters as protagonists and businesspeople during the 1970s, even in films with all-male leadership (Shawcroft et al., 2022, p.359).

This era of Disney Princesses also brought the first princesses of color, a big step for the company. *Aladdin* featured Jasmine, the very first non-white Disney Princess. However, she was drawn with relatively light skin, Anglo features, and voiced by white actress Linda Larkin. At the time of the film's release, in 1992, there was an emerging societal emphasis on inclusion and authenticity. This led to some initial audience criticism of a Middle Eastern character being voiced by a white, American woman (Breaux, 2010, p.400). Following this, Disney's next two princesses were Pocahontas and Mulan, who were voiced by Inupiaq-Metis actress Irene Bedard and Cantonese American actress Ming-Na Wen, respectively. The actresses better matched the ethnicities of the characters they were voicing. Since then, Disney has emphasized casting voice actresses who share ethnicities with the princesses they are voicing. This era created lasting changes to the production of animated Disney Princess films because as long as Disney includes characters of color on screen, they continue to employ actresses of color to voice them. This practice perpetuates norms of women of color being able to do anything seen on screen and, just as importantly, anything seen-off screen.

The importance of appropriate casting can be seen throughout Disney's history and has become the standard procedure for several significant reasons. In the name of authentic representation, having characters voiced by people of shared ethnicity allows a closer connection between the identity of the on-screen character and the actor's lived experience (Voice Casting, 2024). This more holistic understanding of the character helps avoid stereotypes and instead portrays a more complete and accurate representation.

Another important reason for shared ethnicity between characters and voice actors is to increase employment opportunities for underrepresented actors in the animation and greater Hollywood industries (Kim & Brunn-Bevel, 2023). Creating characters who represent the full range of society allows more members of society to participate in their portrayal and, consequently, the employment of all types of diverse people. It is important to recognize the historical exclusion of women and women of color from many US work industries, especially Hollywood (Kim & Brunn-Bevel, 2023). Beyond character voicing, women, especially women of color, have been noticeably absent from leadership and creative roles behind the scenes that shape the on-screen stories for consumers. This exclusion leads to problems of underrepresentation or misrepresentation, like those seen in *Aladdin*, which was made almost exclusively by white men.

The 1992 film *Aladdin* received high levels of criticism for its lack of cultural understanding and its inaccurate portrayals of Middle Eastern stereotypes. A strong voice of criticism was the American Arab Anti-Discrimination Committee (AAADC), which argued against problematic lines in songs as well as the nearly all-white cast and crew. In response to this, Disney swung far in the other direction for their next animated princess film *Pocahontas*, released in 1995. Disney cast all Native American actors and actresses to voice Native American characters, some of whom used the film to boost their careers (Dutka, 1995). Additionally, they hired historian consultants, including cultural experts from the primary Native American organization in Virginia where the

film takes place, to help produce a culturally sensitive and relatively accurate portrayal of the culture (Dutka, 1995).

While there are some gaps that viewers can recognize in retrospect, these actions taken by Disney importantly represent the production process' evolution in response to criticism. Not only did the company respond to audience feedback, but used it to change the production process and set standards regarding inclusions and portrayals of diverse cultures. These changes included ethnically appropriate casting choices and the employment of cultural consultants to gain and portray a deeper understanding of the characters. Peter Schneider, Disney's animation president at the time, stated that the aim of *Pocahontas* was to "celebrate Native American society" and that "[Disney] wanted to offer an ennobling and empowering view of Native Americans that hadn't been provided in cinema before," (Dutka, 1995). The success of this goal is a separate question; the important takeaway from the making of this film is the birth of Disney's cultural awareness and its first attempt to create a film that celebrates another culture with cultural sensitivity.

In summary, the second generation of animated Disney Princesses brought production changes to character ethnicities, voice actor authenticity, and attempted cultural sensitivity. This resulted partly from the help of second-wave feminism, which increased women's involvement. A higher societal standard emerged during this period for whose voices should be included in the media and many changes to the production process resulted from audience critique. These attempts to increase diversity during the 1980s and 1990s set up big changes in the creation of animated Disney Princesses from the 2000s to the 2020s.

Third-Generation Disney Princesses: Including Lost Voices

After the release of *Mulan* in 1998, the next animated Disney Princess was Tiana in the 2009 film *The Princess and The Frog*. The film introduced a new kind of animated Disney Princess in third-generation princesses from 2009 to 2019. This most recent period has marked a dramatic departure from the previous 72 years of princesses. The characters are dynamic: they do not follow one narrative, and they include many representations of what it means to be a woman. Disney Princess films of this time include *Princess and the Frog* (2009), *Tangled* (2010), *Brave* (2012), *Frozen* (2013), *Moana* (2016), and *Frozen II* (2019), all of which depict a modern tale of the Disney Princess. These princesses are independent, adventurous, skilled, and not driven by romantic love–though some find it along the way (Hatheway et al., 2017). Influenced by both internal (cast and crew) and external (fans and critics) pressures from societal changes, this era of animated Disney Princesses saw changes to the characters and their stories. Their on-screen stories were meant to reflect the experiences of the real women who created them.

Case Study: Tiana and the intersectional representation of race and gender

Starting in the 2000s, Disney took active steps to increase the range of representation in its stories. The first film of this era was *The Princess and The Frog* (2009), which featured Disney's first Black princess after 75 years. This was

a big moment for the company and all eyes watched carefully, creating a lot of pressure for Disney to give the audience what they had been missing for years (Breaux, 2010, p.400).

Layered with her important racial representation, Tiana marks the important shift in Disney's Princesses away from having a main goal of romantic love or needing a man. Tiana has her own dream, and it is separate from having a man to take care of her. At first, she is not interested in her love interest, and in the end, she does not sacrifice her dream, her culture, or her voice for the prince–all sacrifices made for love by past princesses. Tiana's independence set the stage for many subsequent independent princesses and was an important shift in the representation of Black characters, especially Black women, in Disney films.

Careful not to repeat past mistakes, Disney consulted members of the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People (NAACP) including Oprah Winfrey, who they then asked to be a part of the project (Breaux, 2010, p.402). The hope was that Winfrey's participation would provide a stamp of approval for the film and allure audiences (Breaux, 2010, p.414). The NAACP was involved in the early stages of the project and, along with feedback from shareholders, had a lot of influence on major character changes. Originally, Tiana was pitched as a happy servant-type character named Maddy, rather than a waitress with big dreams of opening her own restaurant using her savings (Breaux, 2010, p.398). The involved parties pointed out several issues, the first being the overrepresentation of African American characters as happy servant-types. Such depictions perpetuate stereotypes that African Americans are happy to serve white people in domestic roles (Breaux, 2010, p.407). This depiction also downplays domestic work, its demands, and its importance. A second issue was that the name "Maddy," while not sounding authentic to a Black girl in New Orleans in the 1920s, it also sounded too similar to "mammy." "Mammy" is a caricature archetype of Southern Black women seen throughout Hollywood as a "female pickaninny, topside, and maid" who is happy to serve white families (Breaux, 2010, p.407). The character was then changed to Tiana and was shifted away from this outdated, offensive, archetypal character of past entertainment.

During The Civil Rights and Black Power Era of the 1970s, Disney's African American women characters appeared as sidekicks and friends of the main, often white, characters (Breaux, 2010, p.410). White women and African American men were becoming stars, while the intersectional oppression of Black women left them on the sidelines. Behind the absence of representation for Black women on screen is the lack of opportunity for Black women in production. With roles for Black women mainly being voices of sidekicks and supporting characters, their career advancements and recognition at awards are limited (Breaux, 2010, p.412). They also risk being type-cast for the rest of their careers as "best friend types" and never having opportunities to advance.

The Princess and The Frog marks an important emergence of Black women represented as a main character. While the film received criticism on a number of plot points–for example Tiana is a frog for 57 of the 97 minutes of the film (Breaux, 2010, p.405)–viewers can still recognize the advancement of what a Disney Princess has become with the inclusion of an African American woman.

This evolution came from the mistakes in *Aladdin*, the steps made in *Pocahontas*, and the role of consulting and including Black voices throughout the production of the film.

Women's Voices Creating More Relatable Princesses

The Princess and the Frog marked another turning point as this new kind of independent princess was overtly made for Disney fans who were ready to see more of their own experiences on the big screen (Holt, 2023). The production of all third-generation animated princess movies incorporated the experience of the real women who created them to make them more authentic and relatable to audiences.

By the time of the third generation of Disney Princesses, audiences were anxious for a change in the narrative (Cohen, 2019). For 75 years the narrative depicted young women on a journey to find a man. With Princess Tiana, Disney introduced the new type of princess to pave the way for the rest of the modern princesses who are clever and independent. Audiences want stories about women that they can relate to (Cohen, 2019). The simple inclusion of women throughout all levels of the production process brought these important changes.

A study of depictions of gender across Disney animated films by Shawcroft et al. (2022) reveals the changes in characters and stories with the inclusion of women in various roles in Disney film production. The biggest influence was from the writers. Women writers gave male and female characters the most diverse gender roles that were out of the norm; for example, women included more males in caretaking roles and more women in leadership roles than men writers. In the films written by women, the female protagonists embodied "social obstacles faced by women" because of the inclusion of women's voices in the writing process (Shawcroft et al., 2022, p.362). They point to the example of *Frozen's* Princess Anna being taken advantage of for being trusting and seeking love (Shawcroft et al., 2022, p.362). This helps the plots speak to women's experiences in ways men do not have access to because of their own lived experiences.

One example of this authenticity in new stories is the sharing of women's experiences among writers, directors, and producers (Shawcroft et al., 2022). During the films' production (2011-2019), *Frozen* and *Frozen II* co-director and head writer Jennifer Lee hosted what she called a "sister summit" for women employees to share their experiences with their siblings to help the sibling relationship of the films' characters feel real and relatable to audiences (Holt, 2023). Lee also expressed her support of women working on the film in the docuseries *Into the Unknown: The Making of Frozen II* when describing her relationships with fellow mothers on the team. She states her admiration for working mothers, especially single mothers, who must prioritize and ask for help, and she strives to give them the support they need to be successful (Astley & Condon, 2020). This environment where women feel comfortable at work allows them to produce more meaningful and creative work, which ultimately leads to a deep connection with the audience.

In addition to connecting with those working on the film, Lee uses audience feedback to shape the film in the final stages. The audience viewing allows Lee to understand how to make the stories the most relatable and, therefore, enjoyable for the audience (Astley & Condon, 2020). She then adjusts the script to better present the details of the story. Jennifer Lee is an example of the importance of having women in leadership roles and how that affects the stories of animated Disney Princesses.

Script supervisor Jessica Heidt, who has been employed at Disney Animation since 2018, famously took action to support women and equality in the workplace. Because of her role working with the scripts through each stage of the movie, Heidt had access to information about the gender balance of lines and noticed men were overrepresented in speaking roles across Disney-Pixar animated films (Milsom, 2020). She worked with software developers to add gender-balance analysis to existing scripting software. Now tracking the script by gender is expected at every milestone and is integrated into the process of making Disney-Pixar animated films (Milsom, 2020). This technology has helped identify places for simple changes that make a big difference in representation. It was Heidt's position as a woman in leadership that allowed her to notice this problem and take action in an effective way.

In summary, Heidt and Lee both exemplify how, in addition to fostering a women-supportive workplace, having women involved in leadership of animated film production helped third-generation Disney Princesses break out of traditional gender patterns, especially the "prince-saving-the-princess trope" (Shawcroft et al., 2022, 362). Disney staff influenced this by bringing their experiences as women, sharing their stories, and encouraging the stories of others to be represented. When Disney Princess movies are made by women, they share the true stories of women, which is what creates the dynamic and relatable princesses of the third generation of animated Disney Princesses.

Conclusion

The evolution of the Disney Princess is the result of societal attitudes and expectations which changed in response to the political movements present in first, second, and third wave feminism; these movements can be aligned with the first, second, and third generations of animated Disney Princesses. The movements created social changes in attitudes toward women and political changes in their inclusion in the workforce. As the workforce opened to women in general, their involvement increased in the production process of animated Disney Princess films. Specifically, increasing the inclusion of women's voices in Disney productions improved gender representation in the films. Recently, the addition of the voices of women of color in the stories and animation process presents the experiences of women in a more relatable way. Finally, the animated Disney Princesses have evolved through response to feedback from critics, fans, and shareholders, which led to lasting production changes.

This study was limited to cultural change affecting production of Disney's animated princesses and did not look at the success of the production attempts to improve Disney Princesses or how they were received by consumers. This is

another very applicable way to study the evolution of the animated Disney Princess that was not addressed.

First-generation animated Disney Princess films brought difficult but necessary first steps to include women at Disney animation. Their presence was an important start in including women's voices in the characters on screen. The second generation of animated princesses saw changes to characters and representation of diversity through ethnically appropriate casting and cultural consulting. Third-generation animated princesses are the most modern and are the biggest departure from "classic" Disney that depicts traditional gender roles. The changes brought to Disney came from women sharing their stories in the production process to shape the stories and characters on screen.

The answer to the original question, "What social and political factors in the US contributed to the evolution of the animated Disney Princess?" is that social and political movements, like the feminist movements, influenced the creators and fans of Disney animation. The increased internal and external input from women–whom the films' characters represent–is what shapes the characters and makes them more relatable to the experience of women. Thus, over the span of several decades, the animated Disney Princess evolved in response to women's stories and their ability to share them.

Acknowledgements

References

Astley, A. & Condon, J. (Producers). (2020). *Into the Unknown: Making Frozen II* [TV series]. Disney+.

Baker-Sperry, L. (2007). The Production of Meaning through Peer Interaction: Children and Walt Disney's Cinderella. *Sex roles, 56*, 717–727. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11199-007-9236-y

Breaux, R. M. (2010). After 75 Years of Magic: Disney Answers Its Critics, Rewrites African American History, and Cashes In on Its Racist Past. *Journal of African American Studies, 14*, 398–416. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12111-010-9139-9

Bucksbaum, S. (2022, September 23). The evolution of Disney princesses, from Snow White to Encanto. *Entertainment Weekly*. https://ew.com/movies/disney-princesses-evolution/

Cohen, A. (2019, November 22). The Forgotten Women Behind Some of Your Favorite Disney Movies. *Refinery 29*. https://www.refinery29.com/en-us/2019/11/8855966/disney-women-animators-jennifer-lee-mary-blair

Dutka, E. (1995, February 9). Disney's History Lesson: 'Pocahontas' Has Its Share of Supporters, Detractors. *Los Angeles Times*. https://www.latimes.com/archives/la-xpm-1995-02-09-ca-29997-story.html

Hatheway, E, Wolfe, C., Wyler, I. (2017, April 20). The Deconstruction of Disney Princess. *WordPress*. https://sites.middlebury.edu/disneyprincesses/

Holt, N. (2019, October 22). The Forgotten Women Who Helped Shape the Look of Disney Animation. *Time*. https://time.com/5706383/feminist-disney-frozen-history/

Kim, M. & Brunn-Bevel, R. J. (2023). No Face, No Race? Racial Politics of Voice Actor Casting in Popular Animated Films. *Socio Forum* 38, *38*(2), 510-531. https://doi.org/10.1111/socf.12892

Milsom, E., (Director). (2020, November 13). Inspired: Jessica Heidt, Who Gets All the Lines? (Season 1, Episode 4). In Goralski, L. & Roman, N. (Producers), *Inside Pixar*. Disney+.

Shawcroft, J. E., Coyne, S. M., Zurcher, J. D., & Brubaker, P. J. (2022). Depictions of Gender Across Eight Decades of Disney Animated Film: The Role of Film Producer, Director, and Writer Gender. *Sex Roles*, *86*, 346–365. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11199-022-01273-6

Walt Disney Animation Studios. (2024, October 15). In *Wikipedia*. https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Walt_Disney_Animation_Studios

Voice Casting for More Diversity and Inclusion. (2024). Backstage. https://www.backstage.com/discover/diverse-inclusive-voice-casting-75354/

Restorative and Retributive Justice: Responding to Genocides

Billy Zhang
Departments of Criminal Justice and
International Security & Conflict Resolution

Abstract

How do we hold those responsible for genocide accountable? Do we punish, forgive, or both? By providing case studies of how countries and organizations have responded to genocide and human rights violations, this paper attempts to answer that question. It uses the case studies of South Africa, the former Yugoslavia, and Rwanda to determine what options can be used to ensure justice. Each of these countries approached their genocides or human rights violations differently. South Africa used a truth commission, the former Yugoslavia under the UN formed a tribunal, and Rwanda adopted the ancient Gacaca Court system in combination with its national courts. Through these case studies, the paper proposes two solutions that seek to forgive and punish.

Keywords: Restorative justice, Retributive justice, post-conflict justice, criminal justice, human rights, Gacaca Court, Rwandan genocide, Yugoslav wars, Apartheid

How does a country punish those responsible for genocide? Some countries seek to punish those responsible at the top while others prioritize truth over punishment. This paper will explore both types of justice in response to genocides. It will first explain the difference between restorative justice and retributive justice. Then it examines the case of South Africa, which made use of restorative justice; next, it discusses the case of Yugoslavia, which employed retributive justice. It will then look at a third case, Rwanda, which combines both types of justice. Finally, this paper will present two proposals of what a mixed system could look like.

What is Restorative Justice and Retributive Justice?

Restorative justice is a new movement that seeks to involve all those affected by a certain offense; it attempts to "identify and address harms, needs, and obligations to heal and put things as right as possible" (Zehr, 2002, p. 40). Restorative justice seeks to repair the harm that has been done rather than punish an offender. The core aspects of restorative justice are inclusion, dialogue, responsibility, and repair (Anderson, 2023). Through this process, notably, the offender is made an active part of the healing process in contrast to a traditional trial in which the offender is present but rarely does more than offer a plea of guilty or not guilty (Valenzuela et al., 2013, p. 264). Restorative justice seeks to make sure all parties are involved and that the wrong is resolved

in a way that is agreeable to both parties. The end goal of restorative justice is to heal; punishment is a secondary concern and only if it would help in healing both parties.

Retributive justice differs from restorative justice. In retributive justice, an offender has committed a wrong and must therefore be punished (Walen, 2014). If punishment is delivered, then the objective of retributive justice has been accomplished. Any side effects of the sentence that damage the offender's community or family are considered less important than punishment (Walen, 2014). Even if the victim does not experience the process as healing, as long as a punishment fitting the crime is delivered, the goal of retributive justice is considered accomplished (Walen, 2014). In sum, retributive justice is punitive-centric and restorative justice is healing-centric.

The next section highlights an example of restorative justice. The case of South Africa exhibits the healing and repair aspect of restorative justice.

South Africa

The period of Apartheid (1948-1994) in South Africa saw numerous acts of violence and human rights violations committed by both pro-Apartheid and anti-Apartheid supporters. Apartheid refers to the segregation and oppression of many Black South Africans by the White minority government. The end of Apartheid and the election of a fully democratic government in 1994 brought calls to address the human rights abuses and violence during the period of Apartheid (Truth and Reconciliation Commission for South Africa Website, n.d.). As a result of those calls, the South African Truth Commission was established to investigate and document human rights violations between 1960 and 1994 (Truth and Reconciliation Commission of South Africa Report: Volume 1, 1998). The commission's primary goal was to "enable South Africans to come to terms with their past on a morally accepted basis and to advance the cause of reconciliation" (Truth and Reconciliation Commission for South Africa Website, n.d., 1). This truth commission serves as an example of restorative justice.

The South African Truth Commission (hereafter referred to as the TRC) departed from the traditional method of investigating human rights violations. Instead of seeking to punish those responsible for the offenses like many of the organizations before it, the TRC chose to pursue the truth in exchange for amnesty (Truth and Reconciliation Commission of South Africa Report: Volume 1, 1998). Amnesty, which is like a pardon, could be given for crimes ranging from abduction to murder and torture (Truth and Reconciliation Commission of South Africa Report: Volume 1, 1998). No party would be blamed for the violence during Apartheid; the TRC made it clear that the truth was the ultimate goal. Amnesty from prosecution would be the incentive to convince those who were put before the TRC to confess instead of facing possible prosecution (Truth and Reconciliation Commission of South Africa Report: Volume 1,1998). However, this did not mean that every individual who came before the commission was given blanket amnesty. If the commission determined that the crimes committed were not politically motivated or if they determined the crimes too severe to be granted amnesty, then amnesty would

be denied (Truth and Reconciliation Commission of South Africa Report: Volume 1, 1998). The results of this deal led to over 11,000 applications for amnesty being submitted to the commission, thereby allowing for a wealth of information to be collected about what occurred during Apartheid (Truth and Reconciliation Commission of South Africa Report: Volume 1, 1998).

The TRC made yet another departure from the traditional form of investigating and responding to human rights violations in the way it treated the victims. It gave the victims a place to talk about what they had experienced under Apartheid outside of a trial. Victims were given a place where they were able to be heard by the government and the world, as evidenced by the volumes of witness testimonies completely unrelated to the amnesty cases (Truth and Reconciliation Commission for South Africa, n.d.). The commission reports list victims and the violence they suffered. Many of these lists do not name individual offenders, just institutions and groups (Truth and Reconciliation Commission of South Africa Report: Volume 3, 1998). These testimonies were not tied to specific cases or trials; all victims were free to make a statement regardless of whether there was an ongoing trial. What mattered to the commission was not the matter of guilt, but the matter of truth. This is shown in the 7th volume of the report by the commission. In this report we find summaries of victims and their stories as well as a dedication to the unknown victims (Truth and Reconciliation Commission of South Africa Report: Volume 7, 2009). One victim mentioned by the report is Em Achhurst, who was "severely injured when MK operatives detonated an explosive outside the South African Air Force (SAAF) headquarters in Church Street, Pretoria, on 20 May 1983. Twenty-one people were killed and 217 injured. The overall commander of MK's Special Operations Unit and two MK operatives were granted amnesty (AC/2001/003 and AC/2001/023)" (Truth and Reconciliation Commission of South Africa Report: Volume 7, 2009). From this, we can see that who committed the act is not as important as the fact that it is recorded. The perpetrators are not mentioned by name, but their testimony number is listed. This goes on for 290 more pages (Truth and Reconciliation Commission of South Africa Report: Volume 7, 2009). From the lists and lists of summaries, this victim-centered approach of documenting the truth combined with the amnesty offered created one of the most effective examples of restorative justice. The truth was found, and healing could begin.

In contrast to the restorative justice of South Africa, the next section discusses the retributive justice of Yugoslavia. In the case of Yugoslavia, the tribunal and courts established after the conflict focused on punishing those involved.

Yugoslavia

The Yugoslav Wars were a series of conflicts in the Balkans in the 1990s and early 2000s that led to the dissolution of the former Yugoslavia. The conflict was brought about as a result of nationalistic fervor in each of the six republics and two autonomous zones within the Republic of Serbia that made up the country of Yugoslavia. This nationalistic fervor led to rising ethnic tensions and the disappearance of the Yugoslav national identity. Eventually, many of these

republics would declare independence. Some of these independence declarations were bloodless like Slovenia and some broke out into war like Croatia where ethnic tensions led to civil war. Many of these conflicts saw ethnic cleansing carried out against minority ethnic groups like the Bosnian Muslims, as the dominant ethnic groups in the region sought to homogenize the ethnic demographics of their countries based on a hierarchy of ethnicity. The worst of this ethnic cleansing occurred in Bosnia and Herzegovina with an estimated 100,000 people killed between 1992 and 1995 (United States Holocaust Memorial Museum, n.d.). After the end of the conflict through NATO intervention, there came a need to address the genocide and human rights violations that had occurred during the conflict. The formation of the International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia in 1993 was the response to this need (International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia, 1993). This tribunal would use retributive justice to resolve the damage done by the perpetrators of the genocide.

The tribunal was formed to bring justice to those responsible for serious violations of human rights and genocide. The tribunal followed the more traditional route of responding to international humanitarian law violations: trials. These trials followed the standards of a traditional trial and focused on the punishment of the perpetrator (International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia, n.d.). Defendants entered a plea, and then a pre-trial occurred, followed by a trial before the chamber (for a not guilty plea), and finally, sentencing was carried out if the defendant was found guilty (International Criminal Tribunal for The Former Yugoslavia, 2009). This also included the customary rights offered to defendants in democratic legal systems, like the presumption of innocence until proven guilty and the right to a lawyer (International Criminal Tribunal For The Former Yugoslavia, 2009). The tribunal was essentially similar to the trials held in Nuremberg at the end of WWII that saw justice brought to those responsible for the Holocaust.

The work of the International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia ended with its last trial being in 2017 (International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia, 2017). Throughout its mandate, it successfully tried 61 cases (International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia, 2017). In all of these cases, the accused higher-level perpetrators went to the tribunal, while lower-level perpetrators became the responsibility of national courts (International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia, 2017). The perpetrator's rank was determined by whether they were the highest leaders of political, military, and paramilitary organizations suspected of committing violations of humanitarian law (International Criminal Tribunal Yugoslavia, 2008). The tribunal for Yugoslavia followed the traditional formula of an ad-hoc tribunal that sought to punish those responsible for gross violations of humanitarian law.

While justice in the former Yugoslavia centered on punishment, Rwanda provides an interesting case of a mixed system, meaning restorative and retributive justice. Rwanda employs Gacaca courts at a local level for a restorative or healing process, and it uses courts utilizing retributive justice for the worst offenders of the genocide.

Rwanda

In 1994, Rwanda experienced the genocide of the Tutsi minority by the Hutu majority. The Tutsi minority at the time had long been facing oppression from the Hutu majority that ran the country. This oppression led to a civil war between the government and the Rwandan Patriotic Front in 1990, but a power-sharing deal was reached through the Arusha Accords in 1993. This angered Hutu extremists, who used the media to claim the Tutsi were planning to murder the Hutus (United States Holocaust Memorial Museum, n.d.). Then in 1994, the assassination of Rwandan President Juvenal Habyarimana, a Hutu, led to the start of the Rwandan genocide. This genocide led to the deaths of between 500,000 and 1 million people between April 1994 and July 1994. (United States Holocaust Memorial Museum, n.d.).

The end of the genocide placed the Rwandan Patriotic Front in power, which wanted to pursue the prosecution of almost every individual who had committed genocide in its national courts (Drumbl, 2000). This focus was to take place alongside the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda, which focused on those most responsible for genocide (Bosco, 2014). However, due to a lack of resources, the government was forced to adopt a restorative justice approach in the form of the Gacaca courts, leaving only the most serious of offenses for the national court or the international tribunal (Drumbl, 2000). This swap to trials and the Gacaca courts gave the world an example of a mixed retributive and restorative justice system.

The Gacaca courts used by Rwanda come from an ancient court system originally used to settle minor property, inheritance, personal injury, and marital relations disputes (Human Rights Watch, 2011). These courts were headed by respected community elders who came together and served as mediators to restore social harmony with punishment being a secondary concern (Human Rights Watch, 2011). This emphasis on social harmony leaves room for punishment, but only if the punishment would help restore harmony. If the parties involved in a dispute could come to terms that can create peaceful relations without punishment is necessary, then there would be no punishment. In cases where there were punishments, both parties would agree upon it and the punishment would never be individualized (Human Rights Watch, 2011). These foundations would be used by the Rwandan government to create the modern Gacaca courts seen in the aftermath of the genocide.

The modern version of the Gacaca courts used after the Rwandan genocide differed greatly from the traditional one in five ways. The post-genocide Gacaca courts:

1. Handled serious crimes rather than the minor civil disputes they were originally used for
2. Ended up being retributive with a secondary focus on reconciliation and restoration
3. Were tied to the government instead of the local community
4. Applied codified law rather than traditional law
5. Used elected officials rather than community elders as judges (Human Rights Watch, 2011).

These differences allowed Rwanda to quickly try all low to mid-level cases ranging from murder to property damage (Bolocan, 2004). The Gacaca courts were also separated into two levels (cell and sector levels) (Bolocan, 2004). Cases that involved homicide and other serious attacks were classified as category 2 and dealt with at the sector level (Bolocan, 2004). Property-related crimes were classified as category 3 and handled at the cell level. Outside of the Gacaca courts, cases classified as category 1 involved leaders or instigators of the genocide and were transferred to the more traditional national courts (Bolocan, 2004). The Gacaca courts did have the power to sentence and did so, but massive incentives were offered for those who confessed to the community and begged for forgiveness. The offenders' sentences were not set in stone like in a traditional court. The decision to confess offered these offenders reduced sentences or sometimes halving a sentence in favor of community service (Bolocan, 2004). The offender is forced to perform acts of good towards the community to repair what they have damaged, and the victims don't feel like the offender is avoiding punishment because the court doesn't have the resources to try them. Offenders aren't avoiding punishment, but reducing it in exchange for telling the full truth about what had happened.

Despite the success of the Gacaca courts at healing the communities and processing cases that otherwise would have taken years, there were major issues facing them as well. One major issue is the ineffective training provided to those who sat on Gacaca courts as judges (Bolocan, 2004). These judges were provided only six days of training and expected to interpret and apply legislation as well as hand down sometimes harsh punishments (Bolocan, 2004). Six days of training could lead to judges failing to apply the correct legislation or failing to adhere to certain procedures. The two other major criticisms of the Gacaca courts were the impartiality of the judges and the failure to give due process to the offenders (Human Rights Watch, 2011). Judges were not paid by the state, leaving them vulnerable to corruption (Human Rights Watch, 2011). This combined with the fact that Gacaca courts did not guarantee legal counsel for the offender led to organizations like Human Rights Watch questioning the legitimacy of the Gacaca trials. Rwanda's use of a mixed system out of desperation to move forward post-genocide sounds solid in theory, but the reality proved that it had many problematic issues, especially when it came to the offenders.

While Rwanda incorporates both restorative and retributive justice, an improved combination of these two types of justice is needed. The next section offers an approach to justice that aims to improve upon Rwanda's use of restorative justice as well as offer an example of using both truth councils and trials.

Combining Restorative and Retributive Justice

From the cases of South Africa, (former) Yugoslavia, and Rwanda, this paper proposes two possible ways to combine restorative justice and retributive justice. One way is the use of a truth commission by the national government and the use of trials by an international governmental organization like the International Criminal Court. The national government can focus on the truth

and healing while the international community can hold those most responsible accountable. The other solution is to improve upon Rwanda's mixed system with the use of the Gacaca courts to handle lower cases of human rights violations while reserving national courts for the most severe cases. This route would limit international involvement and leave it within the borders of the country affected. It would also be useful in a similar situation to post-genocide Rwanda where the legal infrastructure was destroyed as a result of the genocide. This paper further discusses both of these proposals below.

The first solution would allow the two systems to complement each other with the national government handling a Truth Commission and an international governmental organization (e.g., the International Criminal Court) presiding over the trials. The weaknesses of the Truth Commission could be made up for by the strengths of the trials and vice versa. The Truth Commission could gather information and confessions from a wider range of people while the Tribunal could focus on trying those most responsible for the violations. This would solve issues facing Truth Commissions where victims feel that justice isn't being done (Gooley, 2012). A victim might feel that providing amnesty to those responsible for instigating the violence is wrong for those who have suffered. This feeling that those responsible for the violence are getting away with it can be solved by using trials to hold them accountable. The Truth Commission would also solve the problem of trials only targeting a small number of people, usually those at the top or those who committed the worst acts of violence (Gooley, 2012). In this solution, retributive justice would be done to the leaders, planners, instigators, and the worst offenders of these crimes and the truth of the events that occurred would also be found to heal the nation. The national government's implementation of a Truth Commission to document the confessions of the offenders and testimonies of victims would lead to a better picture of what had occurred. Truth Commissions would be a pure tool of restorative justice, but if a case is determined too severe to be forgiven, then it could be moved over to the tribunal. This would prevent amnesty for everyone involved and only leave amnesty for those who did not have a role in planning and ordering these crimes or were responsible for committing crimes too severe for amnesty. Those going through the Truth Commission would be reintegrated into the community instead of being put in prison, and the victim would also feel a sense of healing. Those at the top would not escape justice and those at the bottom would have to confess to gain amnesty.

The national government's focus on restorative justice could help the nation heal as a whole, while the international organization's trials could allow for the prosecution necessary for the nation's healing and the victim's overall sense of justice. The two systems would particularly benefit the victim. Mark Drumbl writes, "By their very nature, trials create simplistic categories of 'innocent' or 'guilty'" (Drumbl, 2000, p.295). This places blame on a party and could easily fail to tell the whole story of what had happened. Trials gather evidence that a person is guilty of a crime and end in their guilt or innocence. If a perpetrator kills a family and buries them in an unmarked grave somewhere, all the prosecution has to do is prove that the perpetrator killed the family. The perpetrator could refuse to give the location of the bodies and leave the

survivors without any knowledge of where their loved ones are buried. This leaves no closure and no chance to properly bury them. In a truth commission, if the offender knows they are going to be granted amnesty, then they would be more likely to confess and tell the victim the location of those bodies. The offender avoids prosecution, but the full story is given to the public and the survivors get closure on their loved ones. In addition, a better timeline of events can be established if perpetrators are encouraged to tell the truth.

The second solution is to fold restorative justice into the existing justice system like Rwanda did with the Gacaca-like courts, but to improve upon and learn from Rwanda's experiences. By using a model of the Gacaca-like courts, a country can reserve its national courts for the most heinous acts while the Gacaca-like courts can be used to quickly and effectively resolve cases. The use of the Gacaca system would help take the caseload off of the national courts while making sure those who are the most responsible for the genocidal acts are still punished at the national level. In other words, it would still hold those who are most responsible accountable to the national courts, while creating a sense of healing within communities through a more localized Gacaca system. However, first, the issues of Rwanda's Gacaca system would need to be addressed to ensure fairness for everyone involved.

For the Gacaca system to be adopted, its issues must first be addressed. The issues regarding due process have to be fixed. Issues like the right to a legal defense must be fundamental, or the Gacaca trial risks becoming a witch hunt against the perpetrator (Human Rights Watch, 2011). The officials involved in a Gacaca trial would also need to be paid to prevent corruption as well as have their training length increased (Human Rights Watch, 2011). Judges should also be assigned to serve from areas away from their communities to avoid being biased. Fixing these issues would allow the Gacaca courts to be brought up to international fair trial standards as well as prevent corruption of its judges. This would allow for the use of the Gacaca system in other cases of genocide that might occur in the future.

The Gacaca system offers a form of restorative justice that leans more towards retributive justice. The Gacaca system would offer heavily reduced sentences or sentences replaced with community service for offenders who confess completely. The perpetrators would also have a chance to find forgiveness from the community, which would be allowed to speak at the trial. This system would allow for the truth to emerge and for the offender to still face some kind of punishment. Those more severe cases can be transferred to the traditional courts within the country. This would allow for cases to be quickly processed and not stuck in waiting like many of Rwanda's cases before the adoption of the Gacaca system (Human Rights Watch, 2011). The use of the Gacaca-like Court also allows for the work of prosecuting and truth-seeking to be done within the country, encouraging participation from citizens of the impacted country and making it easier to attend trials. This solution limits international involvement and creates a sense of community.

Conclusion

How can a country punish those responsible for genocide? This paper has attempted to answer this question. It first explained the difference between restorative and retributive justice. It has then looked at one case of restorative justice, one case of retributive justice, and one combined case. Finally, it has attempted to provide a view of what a combined system might look like through two proposed models. The first proposal presented a national and international model, while the second described a national and more local (or Gacaca court) model. Through these case studies and the models offered, a solution that ensures that the greatest amount of justice is delivered to the victims and offenders might be found. However, more research needs to be done into how restorative justice and retributive justice might be combined to respond to genocide for this to be done effectively.

Acknowledgments

References

Anderson, M. (2023, September 12). *Understanding Restorative Justice vs. Retributive Justice*. Call for Justice. Retrieved February 16, 2025, from https://callforjustice.org/restorative-vs-retributive-justice/

Bolocan, M. G. (2004). Rwandan Gacaca: An Experiment in Transitional Justice. *Journal of Dispute Resolution*, *2004*(2), 355-400. https://scholarship.law.missouri.edu/jdr/vol2004/iss2/2/

Bosco, J. (2014). « *Domestic Justice Mechanisms : perspectives on referred cases*». International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda. Retrieved August 7, 2024, from https://unictr.irmct.org/sites/unictr.org/files/publications/compendium-documents/v-domestic-justice-mechanisms-mutangana.pdf

Drumbl, M. A. (2000). Sclerosis: Retributive Justice and the Rwandan Genocide. *Punishment and Society*, 2(3), 287 - 308. 10.1177/14624740022228015

Gooley, B. (2012). Nuremberg or The South African TRC: A Comparison of the Retributive and Restorative Models of Justice. *Honors Scholar Theses*, 270. https://digitalcommons.lib.uconn.edu/srhonors_theses/270/

Human Rights Watch. (2011, May 31). *Justice Compromised: The Legacy of Rwanda's Community-Based Gacaca Courts | HRW*. Human Rights Watch. Retrieved August 6, 2024, from https://www.hrw.org/report/2011/05/31/justice-compromised/legacy-rwandas-community-based-gacaca-courts

International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia. (n.d.). *About the ICTY*. International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia. Retrieved August 7, 2024, from https://www.icty.org/en/about

International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia. (1993, May 25).

Resolution 827 (1993). International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia. Retrieved August 6, 2024, from https://www.icty.org/x/file/Legal%20Library/Statute/statute_827_1993_en.pdf

International Criminal Tribunal For The Former Yugoslavia. (2009). *UPDATED STATUTE OF THE INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNAL FOR THE FORMER YUGOSLAVIA*.

International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia. Retrieved August 6, 2024, from https://www.icty.org/x/file/Legal%20Library/Statute/statute_sept09_en.pdf

International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia. (2017). *Completion Strategy Report 2017*. Retrieved August, 2024, from https://www.icty.org/x/file/About/Reports%20and%20Publications/CompletionStrategy/171129-completion-strategy-report-icty.pdf

International Criminal Tribunal Yugoslavia. (2008). *Letter dated 5 December 2008 from the Secretary-General addressed to the President of the Security Council*. United Nations Digital Library. Retrieved August, 2024, from https://digitallibrary.un.org/record/643317?ln=en&v=pdf

Truth and Reconciliation Commission for South Africa. (1998). Justice and Constitutional Development. Retrieved August 6, 2024, from https://www.justice.gov.za/trc/index.html

Truth and Reconciliation Commission of South Africa Report: Volume 1. (1998). Justice and Constitutional Development. Retrieved August 6, 2024, from https://www.justice.gov.za/trc/report/finalreport/Volume%201.pdf

Truth and Reconciliation Commission of South Africa Report: Volume 3. (2002). Justice and Constitutional Development. Retrieved August 6, 2024, from https://www.justice.gov.za/trc/report/finalreport/Volume%203.pdf

United States Holocaust Memorial Museum. (n.d.). *Bosnia and Herzegovina*. United States Holocaust Memorial Museum. Retrieved August 7, 2024, from https://www.ushmm.org/genocide-prevention/countries/bosnia-herzegovina

United States Holocaust Memorial Museum. (n.d.). *Massacre of the Tutsi Minority*. United States Holocaust Memorial Museum. Retrieved August 6, 2024, from https://www.ushmm.org/genocide-prevention/countries/rwanda/massacre-of-the-tutsi-minority

Valenzuela, S., Kaplan, P., & Henry, S. (Eds.). (2013). *Crime and Behavior*. Cognella Academic Publishing.

Walen, A. (2014, June 18). *Retributive Justice (Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy)*. Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy. Retrieved August 6, 2024, from https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/justice-retributive/

Zehr, H. (2002). *Little Book of Restorative Justice: A Bestselling Book By One Of The Founders Of The Movement*. Good Books.

BLOOD CHILD

and other stories

octavia e. butler

The Societal Queerness of "Bloodchild"

Chloe Hunter

Departments of Integrated Marketing & Communications and Chinese

Abstract

"Bloodchild" by Octavia E. Butler is a complex, gory, and queer short story occurring on an alien planet that focuses on the love story between a human and an alien. "Bloodchild" takes place in a world where humans and an alien species need to coexist. This short story challenges the reader's perception of intimacy and gender, especially when Octavia Butler indicates in the Afterword that "Bloodchild" is a genuine love story between two individuals of different species and not meant to be an allegory for slavery. This indicates that the dynamics around contraception between two species regarding the truce and strange symbiosis of coexisting and the intimacy between them were unlike those of reality. This paper explores the queerness that exists within "Bloodchild" and how this is indicative of a queer future. While gender still plays a role in this short story, its importance in society is significantly different than what readers can expect. While gender is emphasized, it is not surrounded by traditional gender roles with the same gender socialization and constructionism as reality. This relates to "Bloodchild" as the story challenges our perceptions of gender and its roles, sex, and power structures. Octavia Butler's work is recognized by her ability to write queerness in a way that does not conform to what our world recognizes as queer and is therefore beyond sexuality. Amanda Thibodeau, who has published a peer-reviewed article about "Bloodchild," writes how Butler's work represents a utopia of transcending past the binary of what constructs restrict us in queerness in our modern day. Octavia Butler represents a new future within other worlds which brings an openness that also does not stay among only human beings in the genre of science fiction. This paper also addresses the reproductive dystopia within the society of "Bloodchild" and its relation to societal disability and its relation to eugenics.

Key Words: Octavia E. Butler, Queer, Science Fiction, Gender, Power Structures, Constructs, Eugenics, Societal Disability

Octavia E. Butler's "Bloodchild" is a complex, gory, and queer short story occurring on an alien planet that focuses on the love story between a human and an alien. "Bloodchild" takes place in a world where humans, known as the Terran, and an alien species, referred to as the Tlic, are thrown together by a need to coexist and reproduce. This difference between the dystopian world of "Bloodchild" and reality is that the alien species uses humans to reproduce and, in return, grant them safety in the Preserve. "Bloodchild" explores this dystopian world through the eyes of Gan, who's been chosen at birth to have the honor to be an alien government official's mate.

T'Gatori is that high ranking official, and she has been like a member of Gan's family for years because of her close friendship with Gan's mother. However, the dynamics of who is willing to accept this role to produce offspring with her causes tension throughout the whole family. This short story cleverly portrays queer themes such as same sex attraction, gender role reversals, and polyamory, to name a few. It challenges the reader's perception of intimacy and how gender affects that, especially since Octavia Butler indicates in the Afterword that "Bloodchild" is a genuine love story between two individuals of different species and not a story of slavery. This compelling work expresses the lack of importance of an individual's gender/sexuality as demonstrated in this alien culture of the future. Queerness within the gender structure of relationships is displayed in intimacy, and the complexity of intimacy in relationships, especially regarding conception and how it is affected by societal disability (in this futuristic alien world, the government decides who may reproduce and who may not). This project engages with scholarship that addresses biology in relation to arguments regarding gender versus sex, along with the significant amount of literature that has been done on "Bloodchild" since it emerged in 1995. This paper will be unpacking the gendered constructs that are displayed in the article with peer-reviewed journals such as "Alien Bodies and a Queer Future: Sexual Revision in Octavia Butler's 'Bloodchild' and James Tiptree, Jr.'s 'With Delicate Mad Hands'" written by Amanda Thibodeau and "Mama's Baby, Papa's Slavery? The Problem and Promise of Mothering in Octavia E. Butler's 'Bloodchild'" by Kristen Lillvis. "Bloodchild" has had several peer-reviewed articles and critiques discuss the uniqueness of gender that is involved in this story. Gender roles are reversed by the fact that the females in "Bloodchild" are the ones who impregnate their chosen partners, thus making it a departure from men having that role in the world that we know. These were intriguing written analyses on the queerness of gender structure and social constructs along with conceiving children and family dynamics that are greatly embedded in the social norms in this alien world. The biggest area of discussion is around the sociopolitical dynamics between the Tlic and Terran. After reading many critiques of this work, it was fascinating to see the perspective of the writers on whether or not the Tlic and Terran have an ethical symbiosis, and if the writer believed T'Gatori to be a good individual or a manipulator. It is also a curiosity to see if the writers believed that Gan and T'Gatori had a genuine relationship or if the writer viewed "Bloodchild" through the lens of reality and compared it to past historical experiences and morality. This essay will depart from established literature so as to explore the queer coding of "Bloodchild" and how this connects to the topic of intimacy among the two species (human and alien) and the moral compass needed to critically analyze the intimate dynamic they share.

Kristen Lillvis, the writer of "Mama's Baby, Papa's Slavery? The Problem and Promise of Mothering in Octavia E. Butler's 'Bloodchild,'" acknowledges another critique in their work. This was addressed with, "While critics such as Elyce Rae Helford and Ernest Larsen read T'Gatoi's last words ('I'll take care of you') as ominous... Gan and T'Gatoi's mutual statements of ongoing care not only suggest that Lien has succeeded in passing her lessons of kinship and respect to Gan but also that Gan is passing these lessons to T'Gatoi" (Lillvis,

2014, p. 16). Lillvis' critique focuses on the caretaking of children, especially since the acts of parenting and conceiving children are separate concepts in the Tlic world. This focuses on how relationship intimacy holds different values in relation to conceiving children. The passage addresses how Gan's role in becoming T'Gatoi's mating partner is also introducing to her what mothering and taking care of offspring can be like in the Terran family structure. While some critics viewed "Bloodchild" to be a reflection of negative aspects of reality, there are other readers who view this short story with the perspective that this world is unlike ours and is not meant to be placed against reality.

The first queer theme represented in "Bloodchild" is gender identity and its significance. While gender still plays a role in "Bloodchild," its importance in society is significantly different than what readers can expect. Gender, as it is expressed in this unfamiliar world, is not conveyed by traditional gender roles or socializations and constructs as in our own familiar reality. Human bodies and the human gender as well as the Tlic gender are very reproduction-centric. Human bodies do not have their human parts involved in the impregnation or birth of Tlic offspring. While Gan is referred to with he/him pronouns, his physical body is not described in "Bloodchild." There are hints that Gan has the opposite genitals of humans that were assigned female at birth or humans able to biologically conceive human children, but neither Gan's body nor his genitals are ever confirmed. In the intimate scene between Gan and T'Gatori, T'Gatori's body is described and Gan is not described, yet is the receiving partner. The human body part that is noted to be involved in the sexual act is his stomach, where he will receive her ovipositor. This calls into question the importance of Gan's relation to gender identity. Gan understands that his role is to one day birth Tlic with T'Gatori, but that doesn't mean he will have to live with an emotional and socially constructed gender norm to follow within his gender such as hiding his emotions or being the dominant "gender." Gender domination and patriarchy are not integrated into the society of "Bloodchild," unlike in reality. This is one of the reasons why "Bloodchild" should not be read from the perspective of today's social issues or with the same moral compass.

Gender socialization or lack thereof is also represented in "Bloodchild" through Gan's disposition. Gan is suggested to be a man, however, the socialization that Gan experienced in his life is different from modern day gender expression. Gan outwardly expresses emotions, while in the socialization of men today it is common for them to be encouraged not to express emotions. Gan presents emotions in the scene when he picks a fight with his older brother and is on the ground crying. Gan's gender itself comes into question as his gender is presented next to his sister. In his conversation with T'Gatori, who decided that she will go to Hoa if he does not choose to mate with her, she responds with, "'It will be easier for Hoa. She has always expected to carry other lives inside her.' Human lives. Human young who should someday drink at her breasts, not at her veins" (Butler, 2005, p. 48). While males were the preferred gender to give birth to the aliens, females were also supported as they were needed to continue the human race, which also indirectly supports the alien race in the future. Being treated as a male, Gan is chosen to be T'Gatori's mate. Queerness in "Bloodchild" is exhibited by challenging societal constructed binaries (that we experience today) through

relationship dynamics within gender and sexuality that transcends past individuals' sex.

Amanda Thibodeau's work "Alien Bodies and a Queer Future: Sexual Revision in Octavia Butler's 'Bloodchild' and James Tiptree, Jr.'s 'With Delicate Mad Hands'" focuses on the queerness of the future including where gender's relevance will be exhibited. Thibodeau includes a passage from Kilgore's essay on race and sexuality as a reference to detail what the future of queerness would mean. The quote from Kilgore's essay included in Thibodeau's work states: "A future that seems queer from our perspective—that is, one not implicated in our experience of race, gender, and sexuality—would result from a resignification of the sexual customs we consider natural. Since our sexuality has as much to do with pleasure and power as with reproduction, such resignification inevitably calls into question our possessive investments in race and gender, culture, and nation" (Kilgore, 2008, p. 237). This passage explains that the word queerness is being used to represent the differences from what we have created to be normative. This relates to "Bloodchild" as the story is challenging our perceptions of gender and its roles, sex, and power structures. This explains that the queerness of the future transcends past sexuality, gender, and even race, as it is more about redefining what we "consider natural" (Thibodeau, 2012, p. 265). Amanda Thibodeau's work touches upon the idea of how queerness in science fiction also represents a "utopia" in which the conformities of today's world such as the gender and sexuality binaries are transcended, and queerness explores what is beyond these constructs. Thibodeau emphasizes this idea by including, "If aliens always already exist outside the normal, and if 'queer' means that which is outside or resists regimes of the normal, a queer reading of speculative alien bodies and relationships is a useful and organic approach to analyzing their utopian implications" (Thibodeau, 2012, p. 265).

Gender roles follow the idea of queer gender identity significance. Amanda Thibodeau also provides analysis not only of a biological standpoint of gender/sex in the alien race but one that makes connections with the insect mating cycle. They make a point that "Given their different life cycles, the female Tlic not only raise their young, but they also create and control the cultural and social systems, while the males have little impact on the society" (Thibodeau, 2012, p. 269). This is a way that gender plays a role in "Bloodchild," yet it is non-traditional from what readers are familiar with. While using the words male-dominated or female-dominated to analyze the world of "Bloodchild" would support understanding of this futuristic world, these words are not actively present in this short story.

To the characters in this futuristic world, this structure (of gender and bodies) is their "normal" and there are no labels present to describe this hierarchy. Gender and bodies are quite insignificant outside of lifespan and breeding. Its relevance correlates more toward who has the physical capabilities to serve which functions. For humans, it is whether or not you can conceive human children. And for the Tlic, it is if you are strong enough to impregnate, aid in the birth or even live long enough to raise your offspring. "Bloodchild" displays these hierarchical roles and how the sex/gender distinction is greatly present through its characters such as the dynamic

between Hoa and T'Gatoi (the sister of Gan and Gan's eventual partner, respectively). Thibodeau provides a critical analysis throughout their work, arguing that while the relationship between Gan and T'Gatoi is genuine and intimate, there are power dynamics surrounding their partnership and society that fall outside of gender identity. "Bloodchild" challenges the inclusion of gender around sex. While the alien race can conceive with any human person, regardless of human genitalia, they prefer humans that were assigned female at birth. However, the alien race tended to choose humans assigned male at birth (those who couldn't conceive human children biologically), so humans that could conceive may continue the human race. Within this mating partnership, the human accompanying the alien may also have a human family if they choose to. An example of this is Gan's father, who was described as having lived "more than twice as long as he should have. And toward the end of his life, when he should have been slowing down, he had married my mother and fathered four children" (Butler, 2005, p. 14). Gan's father is mentioned in relation to his acceptance of consuming sterile alien eggs that "prolonged life and vigor in humans." (Butler, 2005, p. 14). Gan's father had given birth to three alien groups in his prolonged human life and has been described in multiple critiques to be "feminized" as in this world he is impregnated by the females. It wasn't uncommon for human men to birth many alien children and it wasn't uncommon for them to have human children with human partners as well.

There is also a queerness in family structures relating to gender roles that are represented in "Bloodchild." Kristen Lillvis' "Mama's Baby, Papa's Slavery? The Problem and Promise of Mothering in Octavia E. Butler's 'Bloodchild'" addresses this, especially in their thoughts about T'Gatori. Lillvis writes, "Although she is not Gan's birthfather, or even male, T'Gatoi possesses the power of the phallus and occupies the father function because of her governmental and social authority as well as her physical superiority, including her phallic stinger (a body part located on her tail that allows her to drug Terrans) and her ovipositor (the appendage through which she implants her fertilized eggs into a host)" (Lillvis, 2014, p. 12). This influences the "gender" role of T'Gatoi. She does not identify as a man, though she is a pivotal figure in Gan's life. The passage continues to write how T'Gatoi had been someone of security and comfort for Gan, while she allows him to "lounge" on her, and she would "teach him about Terran history, Tlic government work, and the Terran role in reproduction" (Lillvis, 2014, p. 12). Gan's mother was portrayed to be generally emotionally absent, and T'Gatoi had served a caring role in Gan's family.

Kristen Lillvis argues that "T'Gatoi possesses the power of the phallus" which means that through the eyes of our modern world's societal constructs, her existence is symbolized and validated as the dominant role in terms of the physical body, therefore impacting her role in the social hierarchy since she will be the one to impregnate Gan. However, this challenges the perception of dominant and submissive roles within gender and bodies. Traditionally, and as represented through our reality, "men" or "phallus-holders" have historically held more dominant power. However, T'Gatoi is not a man, and in the world she lives in, it is not unusual for women or non-men (individuals not identifying as men) to have a dominant role in "Bloodchild," whether it is

referring to sexual roles and/or having an influential social status. The role of gender in "Bloodchild" within gender/sex, gender importance and gender roles indicates one of the ways queerness is implemented in the world of "Bloodchild."

The second queerness role in "Bloodchild" was the role of sexuality within this society. While "Bloodchild" does not explicitly mention the impact of queer sexuality, it is portrayed as not having much abnormality. Gan's older sister Hoa shows interest in T'Gatori, which includes an underlying tension between the siblings, as Gan was the one that T'Gatori chose at birth to be her mate. Gan and Qui were well aware of Hoa's interest in being T'Gatori's mate and stated this during their discussion, with Qui showing concern that he would be chosen to be her mate if Gan refused: "'She wouldn't take you, Qui. You don't have to worry.... No. She'd take Xuan Hoa. Hoa ... wants it'" (Butler, 2005, p. 40).

Considering that Hoa and T'Gatori both identify as women, it would make their relationship homosexual or queer in a sense. However, the constructed labels we use to describe our sexuality in the modern world, such as homosexual, heterosexual, queer, etc., don't hold the same relevance or importance to the society in "Bloodchild." In modern day, being heterosexual and monogamous is considered the default sexuality and relationship structure and assumed unless stated otherwise. In this process of assumption, it inherently "others" anything past this standard we had given power and worth to because it highlights anyone's existence who does not follow what we are inherently expecting others to be. In "Bloodchild," there isn't a specific structure of relationship dynamics that is considered "superior" or inherently the "norm" of what a relationship on the alien planet looks like within sexuality. It is quite common for relationships to be non-monogamous, without even using these words to describe it as such. This is represented in this short story of humans with alien partners also being welcome to have another human partner and having human children alongside having to birth alien children occasionally. The gendered constructs that were being distinguished were the human's reproductive capabilities and while the alien species took "men" the most it was confirmed by Qui in his conversation with Gan that they prefer "women" to mate with. Within this construct, sexuality seems very fluid, and sexuality labels are not mentioned throughout "Bloodchild." This work constantly challenges what gender and sex mean to the Tlic (alien race) and Terran (human race) on the alien planet. Readers are questioned about where we have to separate our moral stances on certain topics (away from the ones we hold for our reality) such as pre-established relationships, intimate experiences when one is not ready, and the use of one's body given the different life circumstances these characters face in "Bloodchild."

Jess S. Bennett's work reflects on how Octavia Butler includes queer elements outside of "Bloodchild" as well, which is useful for additional context on how the author incorporates queerness into a family structure as a whole. She states that "Butler's exploration of queerness through a combination of human and extra-terrestrial characters creates some distance between her work and mainstream gay culture" (Bennett, 2019, p. 5). This is attributed to how Octavia Butler does not write queerness in a way that conforms to what reality

recognizes as queer. It is what is beyond sexuality and similar to what Amanda Thibodeau writes about as becoming a utopia of transcending past the binary of what constructs restrict us in queerness in our modern day. Jess S. Bennett writes that "Generally, Butler's works have a strong interest in queerness, providing an alternative to the heteronormative culture that proved dominant during her lifetime" (Bennett, 2019, p. 3). Octavia Butler presents a new future within other worlds that brings an openness that also does not stay among only human beings in the genre of science fiction. Jess S. Bennett's work recognizes that "Many of Butler's novels feature LGBT characters of diverse racial and ethnic backgrounds with same-sex attractions and experiences" (Bennett, 2019, p. 2). It was very intriguing to read this analysis in a peer-reviewed article, since the queerness in "Bloodchild," while not explicitly stated as queer, continues to remain prevalent in multiple readers' understanding of her work. An example of this is the casualness of Gan's oldest sister having feelings for T'Gatori. Relationship norms are present in "Bloodchild," though, unlike reality, they are nontraditional compared to gendered constructs.

A passage from Elyce Rae Helford's critique states: "T'Gatoi, ever the skillful manipulator, reminds Gan that he is asking her to beg for the lives of her children; however, his demand also reminds her that the Tlic are dependent on humans for their survival. Cooperation is the only way to ensure that humans do not become like the unthinking native animals that destroyed the eggs to protect their lives" (Helford, 1994, p. 268). Helford's work reflects the perspective of someone who is comparing the political alien-human relationship against what slavery has been in reality. Helford's analysis of T'Gatoi represents her as someone who does not care for humans and who manipulates Gan to make him comply. It would be unreasonable to say that T'Gatoi has not used manipulation on Gan or anyone else before in the world of "Bloodchild," though one could argue that her intentions towards the Terrans are significantly less malicious than other Tlic. Elyce Rae Helford's work provides a standpoint of how gender and race studies can deconstruct human biases. This is especially in reference to the focus the writer has on the species in the novel and the "inhumanness" we can place on them. Elyce Rae Helford provides a critique analysis of how power structures are placed in this society and compares it to the real world. I disagree with the perspectives they include in their critique. I don't believe that it would be fair to compare the norms in "Bloodchild" to those of normative morality in today's world. However, I do respect that others view "Bloodchild" with the perceptiveness to compare it with slavery and manipulative relationships. While Gan and T'Gatori's relationship is genuine, it leads to the question if other Tlic/Terran relationships face the same mutual respect. It is true that the Tlic may seem to indefinitely have the upper hand and most social power over humans, though "Bloodchild" has indicated that the Tlic have been progressing towards treating humans less like their breeding tools. It is what T'Gatori's work for the government is striving towards. The author themself confirms in the Afterword that "Bloodchild" is a genuine love story between two different species and not one of slavery. This leads the readers to question where we have to separate our moral stances on certain topics (away from the ones we hold for our reality) such as pre-established relationships, intimate

experiences when one is not ready, and the use of one's body given the different life circumstances these characters face in "Bloodchild." There is another critic whose writing addresses the Tlic to be malicious and ill-intentioned towards humans.

Sophia Booth Magnone, the writer of "How to Love Your Livestock: Negotiating Domestic Partnership in the Multispecies World of 'Bloodchild,'" writes that "The pen, the Preserve, and the cage all constitute particularly 'animalizing' modes of the Tlic management of their human guests. But the story's most viscerally affecting the mode of animalization is achieved through the grisly mechanics of interspecies reproduction, a process that seems to exemplify symbiosis in its most parasitic form" (Magnone, 2017, p. 116). Magnone provides a critique on the lack of freedom that humans have in the power-structured symbiosis with the alien species. They are describing that the symbiosis that the Tlic and Terran share in interspecies reproduction is "parasitic" and are alarmed by the treatment of humans, calling it "animalizing" (Magnone, 2017, p. 116). One of the lacks of freedom that Sophia Booth Magnone highlights is that humans do not have a choice of whether they are willing to bear offspring for the alien species. The second lack of freedom is that humans are treated as livestock and "animalized." This source provides details on the troubles in "Bloodchild" around the ethics of bearing children which are related to the topics covered in this paper with how human gender has less relevance to childbearing and it is the construct of how humans are treated to conceive. They continue their critique "stating that, by 'animalizing' its humans, 'Bloodchild' intervenes into the dominant species discourses of earthly modernity" (Magnone, 2017, p. 110). This passage is referring to the idea that the act of 'animalizing' humans creates a separation of what humanity is in the readers' reality.

Kristen Lillvis writes in "Mama's Baby, Papa's Slavery? The Problem and Promise of Mothering in Octavia E. Butler's 'Bloodchild'" that "Gan anticipates that his maternal influence will change the Terrans' relations with the Tlic, asserting that T'Gatoi will likely 'experiment' with showing prospective surrogates live births (perhaps the offspring he will carry) because of his suggestion (29). Gan's statements at the conclusion of 'Bloodchild' suggest that the power he derives from his parenthood not only changes his relationship with T'Gatoi but also affects the whole of Terran-Tlic" (Lillvis, 2014, p. 16). Gan's coming of age can bring liberation for Terran-Tlic. With his partner holding great government power around the union of both species and not only caring about him but respecting his humanness, he has opportunities to change what it means to give birth and have alien/human relationships. Gan is not hesitant to share with T'Gatoi when he realizes that he wants to bring change to what producing offspring looks like in society. While T'Gatoi is not on board with the idea, "Bloodchild" hints that T'Gatoi may eventually comply to "experiment" with some of his ideas (Lillvis, 2014, p. 16). Gan and T'Gatoi's societal circumstances lead readers to reflect on the ethics of their relationship forming and question the intimacy they share. While there is a mix of critique around the genuineness of Gan and T'Gatoi's union, Ayush Peddireddi published his thoughts in "The Pregnant Male Fallacy: An inspection of Octavia Butler's 'Bloodchild.'" He suggests that "despite Gan's misgivings, it is

readily apparent that T'Gatoi truly does care for Gan, and by extension his entire family. Although her family business is politics, she was never in any true obligation to care for Terrans and the Preserve- she seems to do so out of genuine care for the species" (Peddireddi, 2018). Gan does not outright agree to be her mate, which is reflected in this passage as "his misgivings," and the author notes that "T'Gatoi truly does care for Gan" which is a unique perspective considering how many critics believe her to be a manipulator. Ayush Peddireddi's thoughts in the quote "Although her family business is in politics" have a correlation to Kristen Lillvis' perspective of how Gan is approaching the relationship between them and his humanness in caretaking young. T'Gatoi's intentions for having a family are more obligatory than loving, which Tlic culture is represented within the Tlic/Terran symbiosis. Peddireddi writes, "she was never in any true obligation to care for Terrans and the Preserve." This would seem to indicate that in the Tlic culture, love, and intimacy are mutually exclusive from breeding. So it would seem that T'Gatoi has more caring towards the Terran people than most of her species. This work supports the idea that Gan and T'Gatoi do share a genuine love and intimacy between them considering they both share feelings for each other within the Tlic/Terran power structure where it is not obligatory to have them. This indicates that Gan and T'Gatoi truly want to be united and their union not only serves their societal rules to fulfill the symbiosis truce but also is their next step in relationship intimacy. The implications of sexuality, relationship norms, intimacy, and the complexity of power structures within relationships are other ways queerness is displayed in "Bloodchild."

The third theme of queerness represented in "Bloodchild" is the role of societal disability. Societal disability displayed in reality can revolve around "genetic selection." Dorothy E. Roberts' "Race, Gender, and Genetic Technologies: A New Reproductive Dystopia?" focuses on reproductive dystopia and its relation to societal disability. There is a passage that expresses, "While some women may use genetic selection in an upwardly mobile quest for the 'perfect child,' others want to prevent their children from suffering the pain, illness, and physical limitations that accompany disabilities or worry that they are not capable of dealing with disabilities' social consequences (Roberts, 2009). This revolves around the concept that instead of deconstructing ableism, preferring able-bodiedness in society, and accepting those with disabilities, we choose to annihilate or try to genetically select our offspring, which amounts to eugenics. While this may seem cruel, there are parents who choose to do this for health reasons if their child will struggle with a genetic condition or may experience "limitations" due to their disabilities. This relates to the Tlic and how the Tlic choose to breed with humans because their children have more of a guarantee to be stronger. In our world, this might be seen in IVF. This also relates to how eugenics plays a role in "controlling the biological makeup of the population" as Rose, the British sociologist discussed and was quoted in Dorothy E. Roberts' work (Roberts, 2009).

There was also a great societal disability around mating in "Bloodchild," especially in relation to the Tlic species outside of the Preserve. This represents the control of who does and does not get to mate. This also suggests who receives care and who does not. In our world, this might mirror the lack of

abortion rights. Many of the Tlic do not have the ability to mate with humans. Gan describes how the Tlic look at him when he travels outside the Preserve. This difference between the dystopian world of "Bloodchild" and reality, the world as we know it, is that the alien species uses humans to reproduce and, in return, grant them safety in the Preserve. This is part of the alliance between both species and T'Gatoi is an important figure in the novel as she was someone who worked closely with the Preserve as a Tlic government official. As a result, Terrans giving birth as a part of societal norms would indicate their priority to receive proper care.

While the relationship between the alien and human species is complex and not prominently gender structured, there is a strong influence of societal disability around birthing practices. One of the aspects of societal disability that significantly impacts the world of "Bloodchild" is the fact that the Tlic prefer to breed with human mates instead of animals. T'Gatori was being frank with Gan that "[Tlic] uses almost no host animals these days" (Butler, 2005, p. 46). She explains to Gan that using host animals was not successful and eggs that were implanted were killed by the animals that hosted them. T'Gatori continues saying that "because your people arrived, we are relearning what it means to be healthy, thriving people" (Butler, 2005, p. 46). T'Gatori represents that, at the end of the day, the Tlic need the Terran to birth more successful and healthy offspring. The result of not being born from a human is not as favorable, as Butler shows by describing another Tlic featured in this story named T'Khotgif Teh.

T'Khotgif Teh was sickly and did not make it in time to help her Terran (human race) mate give birth, which would have made his birthing process less painful. She is a side character in "Bloodchild," and her role in the short story is to unintentionally expose the horror that is alien childbirth (something that is meant to stay private). She was described by Gan's thoughts which were that "she was paler and smaller than T'Gatoi—probably born from the body of an animal. Tlic from Terran bodies were always larger as well as more numerous" (Butler, 2005, p. 36). Gan's internal observations represent how society, Tlic or Terran, notices the able-bodiedness of Tlic. While the fact that T'Khotgif Teh's health was not well is a part of the conflict in "Bloodchild," it also represents how Tlic as a species want to prevent other Tlic from having the same health conditions she does. While it is possible for the Tlic not to mate with humans, it is their preference as a species to have the best chance of genetic succession.

T'Gatoi's role in "Bloodchild" indicates the governmental power that is held on the alien planet as well. Gan notes on the second page of "Bloodchild" that he had been taught at a young age to be very respectful to her, as she was an important official who worked with Terrans (Butler, 2005, p. 2). Understanding her role in government, she was not only a Tlic who needed to mate, but she also had more privilege of having children. This was indicative of her status, it was obvious that she had priority to have a human partner, while other Tlic did not. The lack of availability of Terran to the Tlic was a societal issue that wasn't reflected in a scene directly, but through Gan's internal narrative. The passage begins, "T'Gatoi was hounded on the outside. Her people wanted more of us made available. Only she and her political faction stood between us and the

hordes who did not understand why there was a Preserve—why any Terran could not be courted, paid, drafted, in some way made available to them" (Butler, 2005, p. 17). This quote indicates that there is a societal disability of who is allowed to have a family. What follows is a description that a part of T'Gatoi's responsibility is to address the past social order of "breaking up Terran families" to fulfill the needs of the Tlic, and handle the "joining of families" (Butler, 2005, p. 17). This indicates that there had been a history of Terrans being treated like breeding objects that were only used to serve Tlic. Now there was progress in more ethical approaches for Tlic and Terran to have partnerships with the priority to breed. "Bloodchild" expresses the complexity of genuine intimacy in relationships, especially regarding conceiving children and how this is intertwined with ethics with conception, medical availability that relates to the greater issue of societal disability occurring in the alien planet.

"Bloodchild" represents a queerness that transcends past modern-day social constructs of queerness. This queerness reflects the significance of gender and sex, gender constructs, sexuality, intimacy, and traditional norms around bodies in relation to interpersonal dynamics as well as focuses on societal disabilities around conception and pregnancy and how that is reflected in gendered/gender absent relational dynamics. "Bloodchild" is a beautiful and complex queer love story. But to appreciate this ground-breaking work, you must come with an open mind and open heart. It's important not to judge a society so unlike our own with a moral compass they would not even know existed.

Acknowledgements

Growing up with sitcom writer parents, I had been surrounded by words and reading for as long as I could remember. Utilizing words is my main form of self-expression. Naturally, I've been asked countless times if I wanted to grow up and follow in my parent's footsteps to become a writer as well. In a way, I feel like I have fulfilled an aspiration I didn't even know I had and can become another writer in our family. I'm extremely grateful and thrilled to share this piece! Thank you again to Splice for your support and guidance these past 15 months.

References

Amanda Thibodeau. "Alien Bodies and a Queer Future: Sexual Revision in Octavia Butler's 'Bloodchild' and James Tiptree, Jr.'s 'With Delicate Mad Hands.'" *Science Fiction Studies*, vol. 39, no. 2, 2012, pp. 262–82. *JSTOR*, https://doi.org/10.5621/sciefictstud.39.2.0262. Accessed 22 Nov. 2023.

Bennett, J. S. (2019, December). *Queer families in octavia butler's science fiction*. Jewlscholar MTSU. Retrieved November 21, 2023, from https://jewlscholar.mtsu.edu/server/api/core/bitstreams/f00ff2a1-8539-4c7e-9660-768191afd8c1/content

Butler, O. E. (2005). *Bloodchild and other stories* [PDF]. Seven Stories Press.

Helford, Elyce Rae. "'Would You Really Rather Die than Bear My Young?': The Construction of Gender, Race, and Species in Octavia E. Butler's 'Bloodchild.'" *African American Review*, vol. 28, no. 2, 1994, pp. 259–71. *JSTOR*, https://doi.org/10.2307/3041998. Accessed 22 Nov. 2023.

Kilgore, D. W. D. (2008). Queering the Coming Race?: A Utopian Historical Imperative. In W. G. PEARSON, V. HOLLINGR, & J. GORDON (Eds.), *Queer Universes: Sexualities in Science Fiction* (1st ed., Vol. 37, pp. 233–251). Liverpool University Press. http://www.jstor.org/stable/j.ctt5vjcss.17

Lillvis, Kristen. "Mama's Baby, Papa's Slavery? The Problem and Promise of Mothering in Octavia E. Butler's 'Bloodchild.'" *MELUS*, vol. 39, no. 4, 2014, pp. 7–22. *JSTOR*, http://www.jstor.org/stable/24569929. Accessed 22 Nov. 2023.

Magnone, Sophia Booth. "How to Love Your Livestock: Negotiating Domestic Partnership in the Multispecies World of 'Bloodchild.'" *Palimpsest (Albany, N.Y.)*, vol. 6, no. 2, 2017, pp. 106–28, https://doi.org/10.1353/pal.2017.0016.

Peddireddi, A. (2018, July 31). *The pregnant male fallacy: An inspection of octavia butler's bloodchild*. Medium. Retrieved November 21, 2023, from https://medium.com/@apedd34/the-pregnant-male-fallacy-a-critical-analysis-of-octavia-butlers-bloodchild-a21834f4711a

Roberts, D. E. (2009). *Race, gender, and genetic technologies: A new reproductive dystopia?* [PDF].

employed to undermine the repatriation argument. Authors Kwame Anthony Appiah and JH Merryman (2006) suggest that objects have a "contribution to the culture of the world" (122). Appiah and Merryman argue that limiting access to cultural artifacts would deprive the world (museums) of these cultural objects and limit collective understanding of our shared heritage (122).

Despite the philosophical and legal challenges that complicate the repatriation of cultural objects, I challenge these controversies by defending repatriation for historical injustices that were committed in the past. Cultural descendants are entitled to repatriation when they demand that their cultural patrimony be returned. Although I discuss repatriation generally, I primarily focus on the return of cultural artifacts from museums. Museums have a responsibility to return cultural objects to their rightful owners when they have requested for their return. I present my argument through three sections. My first section will address power dynamics and the preservation of cultural integrity. When cultural artifacts are held by museums instead of placed in the context of their origins or suspected origins, they might lose their cultural and spiritual value. In conjunction with the preservation of cultural integrity, I argue that unfair power dynamics have historically perpetuated the looting and coercive transaction of cultural artifacts. This section defends cultures seeking the return of their cultural patrimony from museums. My last section will counter the three objections that I have mentioned. I break down the idea of shared cultural heritage and argue that it is not a substantive enough argument to defend museums' housing of controversial artifacts. In doing so, I hope to alleviate and counter some of the arguments circulating within current literature on the complications of cultural repatriation.

Modern Implications and Relevance

Instances of cultural trauma can produce generational repercussions that consciously or unconsciously influence the trajectory of a culture's wellbeing and sense of identity. Cultural objects possess the testimonies of generational members who have helped shape the vivid ideas and mentalities that give rise to the very ideas of self and community. Objects tell stories of the past and often hold practical value for cultures, nourishing the relationship between people and the way they interpret the world. James Cuno (2001) describes cultural artifacts or 'property' as not something that is "owned by people" but rather something "of them" (85). Cultural property extends beyond just ownership and superficial possession, instead serving collective identity. Cultures deprived of such understandings through their cultural artifacts may also be denied their right to connect with their past, limiting their understandings of the present. Cultural repatriation has the potential to mend some of these wounds sustained through the theft of cultural heritage.

As an attempt to revive traditional values that were erased by colonialism, military occupation, and other instances of suppression, many cultures in fact request the return of their cultural artifacts. Working through postcolonial trauma often involves the reconditioning of key cultural artifacts, which allows people to reimagine the cultural and spiritual aspects of their identity that were unjustly taken (Simpson, 2009). Many living indigenous tribes across North

America and Australia have extensively sought out the repatriation of their cultural artifacts. Progressive efforts within the United States even led to the establishment of the Native American Graves and Repatriation Act in 1990 (Matthes, 2017). Other groups have not been as successful in their effort to regain their cultural objects. The Metropolitan Museum of Art and the British Museum hold an abundance of cultural artifacts acquired through questionable processes. The Elgin Marbles are one of the most prominent controversies on the subject of cultural repatriation. For decades the Greek government has requested for their return from the British museum, a mission in which they've had little success despite historical contexts that point to unjust acquisition (Merryman, 1985). If cultural objects were acquired through just means, rather than through exploitation or coercion, some historians, philosophers, and anthropologists would still debate repatriation (Matthes, 2017). This addresses these controversies and argues in favor of cultural repatriation from museums.

Power Dynamics & Cultural Integrity

One way to remedy the cultural traumas inflicted by the illegitimate profiteering and use of cultural artifacts is to give them back. Author Karin Björnberg (2014) expresses this type of repatriation as a form of corrective justice in which the return of items that were acquired as a result of unfair or harmful practices can offset some of the damages done in the past (461). Generally, the most convincing arguments for cultural repatriation are based on reasoning that concerns the historical injustices which allowed for unjust transactions to occur. These arguments are generally uncontroversial in the sense that normative rules generally urge something to be returned if it was stolen or unjustly acquired (Björnberg, 2014). However, it is important to also consider historical scenarios in which a culture agreed to give away their goods. Deceivingly fair agreements may conceal the true power dynamics at play, which may have less overtly allowed for unfair transactions but have been equally as harmful. Appropriation of cultural artifacts may also be equally harmful considering that the integrity of an object is often dependent on the context in which it sits and can become damaged when placed in the wrong hands.

Power Dynamics

It is certainly not uncommon for Western cultures to exert their political and social power onto non-dominant countries and cultures. Oftentimes these troubling power dynamics may lend themselves to unfair agreements that result in the appropriation of a culture's identity. European colonization at large is responsible for these unfair agreements, often leaving colonies depleted of their cultural bounty. One prominent example of this is when the British looted West Africa in 1897 for their Benin bronze (Nafziger & Nicgorski, 2009). Despite the challenges to disentangle the "ambiguities" of its heritage, the preface of the exhibition even dictates and acknowledges that the acquisition of the Benin Bronzes was "unjustifiable" (Nafziger & Nicgorski, p. 1). This unjustifiable acquisition entails the violent theft, the lack of mutual consent,

and the museum's continued disinclination towards restitution. This colonialist violence should have been enough reason for the British Museum to return the objects, but the largest collection of the bronzes remains in London.

This matter exemplifies the pervasive issue of power dynamics, and whose interests are really being served by artifact possession. The argument that is often brought up frequently, which I will discuss further in the last section of my paper, is this idea of shared cultural heritage. Regarding the Elgin Marbles, the British Museum asserts that they are "a part of the world's shared heritage" and extend beyond political borders (The British Museum). This argument ignores the role of power dynamics, especially during times of European colonization, between rich and poor nations. It is difficult to conclude that the cultural exchange between two nations or groups of people will always be equal. In the case of the Benin Bronzes, and many other artifacts acquired during colonization, all signs point to unequal transaction. To allow British possession would be to deprive both Greek and Beninese descendants the artistry and knowledge of their ancestors. Appiah (2006) argues that museums do not have a duty to return artifacts to the descendants of their original owners, as those descendants do not have an inherent entitlement to them (p.133). However, to do so would be "a fine gesture". In some ways, this statement reads as, "Unless you have tons of money or a rich person is kind enough to return a significant cultural artifact, don't expect to get it back." There is also the obvious likelihood that in the case that subaltern groups vouch to get their cultural artifacts back, they cannot allocate thousands of dollars to fly to London to do so. In that case, many cultural artifacts end up in museums such as the British Museum, rather than in the hands of the people from which the object descended from.

Cultural Integrity and Appropriation

If museums want to claim that they have legitimate interest in a cultural artifact, it is their duty to ensure that their interests in a cultural artifact and the interests of the object's cultural descendants are symmetrical. It should be standard practice that this type of stewardship exists, otherwise it would be to ignore the ethical and moral realities of possessing such a cultural artifact (Eaton & Gaskell, 2009). Interests become subverted or asymmetrical when the cultural integrity of an object is fractured. Western display of cultural artifacts tends to hegemonically define the value of objects according to Western perceptions of cultural worthiness and beauty. This practice exerts Western tastes and perceptions over cultural objects of which Westerners were never intended to hold possession. The cultural dogmas that Western museums have prescribed to these artifacts therefore become reinterpreted to misrepresent the cultures from which the artifacts descend. As a result, cultural descendants (often subaltern groups) do not have agency over their cultural heritage. This can become further problematic when claims defend a museum's right to display contested artifacts as necessary to preserve cultural heritage for people's enjoyment and understanding of the world (Merryman, 1985). I can go to the British Museum, for example, and be enamored and impressed by the artistry and craftsmanship of a cultural object. However, I will only ever know the object by what appears to me aesthetically. Cultures requesting the return of

these artifacts may know these objects spiritually, connecting with them beyond this surface level. I would not value a ceremonial cultural artifact that belongs to an indigenous group the same way as would a member of this group.

Authors Eaton and Glaskell attribute these practices to long-term appropriation, which are manifested by this misrepresentation of cultural artifacts (Eaton & Glaskell, 2009). This misrepresentation is problematic because it continues hegemonic practices that allowed Western cultures to have possession of these objects in the first place. It should be the responsibility of museums to work through these power dynamics and confront the injustices that have led to the long-term misrepresentation and neglect of cultural grievances. This may include the involvement of subaltern and indigenous groups themselves in gauging where the responsibility of the museum lies (Eaton, A. W., & Gaskell, I. 2009). This responsibility may involve the repatriation of certain artifacts to cultures so that descendants might be reunited with their heritage. By accommodating those groups, Western museums can help correct historical and long-term injustices. This process would set a precedent for a future in which cultural descendants are able to see the repatriation of their artifacts (Björnberg, 2014).

Objections

The case for repatriation is often complicated and, in many cases, has become controversial. There are three scenarios to consider in my argument for cultural repatriation. These scenarios arise when there is (i) a lack of substantive evidence to prove unjust acquisition of cultural objects, (ii) a fragmented or unclear cultural lineage connects current cultural groups with their modern predecessors, or (iii) the concerns of the cultural artifacts' current possessors (often museums) outweigh those of the cultural descendants who are urging for their return (Matthes, 2018). I have found that it is often best to take repatriation claims on a case-by-case basis. Without this specificity, it becomes easy to take my argument as an objection to museums possessing any cultural artifacts, which is not my argument.

(i) The first point I would like to address is the lack of evidence that supports unjust acquisition. Considering that I am basing my argument on the fact that a historical injustice has occurred, it would be difficult to claim entitlement to repatriation without having evidence of unjust acquisition (Björnberg, 2014). This is not to say that a culture does not have entitlement to their cultural artifacts unless they have been historically oppressed. Rather, I claim that an argument must be substantiated by evidence that is based on the long-term consequences of cultural artifact appropriation. This claim may be better backed by evidence based on my cultural integrity argument. By this argument, one does not need to prove that there has been a historical injustice committed. The sheer fact that a cultural object housed in a museum is requested to be returned, particularly with the claim that its colonization has caused suffering, is successful in sidestepping the complications of proving a historical injustice has occurred. I would claim that we owe certain groups the acknowledgement, oftentimes through repatriation, that they were subjected to an objectionable system of exploitation or repression that still causes present-day consequences through structural injustices (Ypi, 2017).

It is also important to acknowledge that even when the historical evidence is clearly not in favor of museums, such as for the British Museum and the Elgin Marbles, Greece has still not had their patrimony returned. Despite signs of historic coercion and the fact that the Greeks were not even involved in the decision-making process which caused the deconstruction of the Pantheon, the British Museum has successfully held onto the marbles (Merryman, 1985). Though this is not necessarily a case in which historical justice has occurred, I cannot assume that every cultural group that is requesting their patrimony be returned has suffered a historical injustice. However, in the case of the Marbles, the object was transferred from one illegitimate owner to another (Björnberg, 2014). I have mentioned that transfer of cultural objects through means of coercion can constitute illegitimate acquisition. In certain historical cases, objects have been either surrendered or sold under the imminent threat of punishment (Björnberg, 2014). These scenarios show that the current ownership of such objects is fundamentally illegitimate and give their rightful cultural groups a well-grounded defense to repatriation.

(ii) There is a simple moral and legal duty that calls for victims of an injustice to be compensated for the injustices they have suffered (Thompson, 2001). However, injustices that were committed long ago can be difficult to remedy. Cases for repatriation require there to be a legitimate cultural group to whom the object should be reunited with. Cultural groups have often experienced radical or even gradual changes from the time that cultural injustices had occurred, making it difficult to claim who the legitimate descendants of a cultural group are. However, there are aspects of cultural continuity that can link present cultural groups to their ancestors. Whether this be linguistically, legally, culturally, or politically, people are connected to their past (Björnberg, 2014). Just as certain aspects of a culture can continue, the harm done to a particular culture can transfer. I do not mean to place cultural groups into perpetual victimhood, but part of breaking the cycle of harm is to allow cultural groups (often subaltern groups), to hold autonomy over their own patrimony. I also acknowledge that cultural continuity is not straightforward and is often tainted with problematic arguments pertaining to cultural essentialism.

To help remedy the perpetuation of harm, I argue that colonial possessors have a duty to return cultural objects to those who have been disenfranchised the most. These groups can be identified by tracing a generational chain of harms (Matthes, 2018). Additionally, it is also important to consider the socio-political circumstances that have prevented cultural groups from speaking out about the return of their cultural artifacts at an earlier time, or at all. It is important to recognize that part of the reason why Western museums are still in possession of certain objects is due to unjust power dynamics that reduce the voices of those who are requesting their return. As museums lay claim to being stewards of history, they must consider these ethical dilemmas in order to legitimately lay claim to a cultural artifact. There is no clear step-by-step set of standards applicable to all cases for repatriation, which complicates my defense for repatriation from museums.

(iii) Lastly, I argue that it is the identification of which party has the most legitimate interest in a cultural artifact which weighs the most heavily on the

dilemma of cultural repatriation. To narrow down these interests, I will only be comparing those of museums and those of the cultural descendants. In the case that a historical injustice has been committed, or long-term appropriation has occurred, I endorse the argument that the importance of a cultural object is determinative and sufficient in the repatriation of cultural patrimony to compensate for historical injustices and suffering (Harding, 1997). However, the discussion is more complex than this rule can cover, and it is necessary to recognize that museums have successfully established countervailing arguments that have allowed for many contested cultural artifacts to remain in their possession. One of the most well-documented and widely used arguments for museum possession is that it values humanity at large to keep certain artifacts under museum control (Matthes, 2018).

Museums often regard themselves as the trustees of cultural heritage and knowledge. Through repatriation, a museum loses its ownership and control over a cultural artifact, and hence over the artifact's fate. As museums have a duty to preserve these artifacts, they lose control of their ability to ensure their protection and maintenance. Museums feel as though they have a stake in the preservation of the cultural heritage of all mankind (Merryman, 1985). I distinguish that museums provide cultural educational resources that open minds to the cultural practices and beliefs associated with certain artifacts (Simpson, 2009). However, many of the collections that museums possess have only come into their possession through colonization or through other unjust practices (Simpson, 2009). The challenge lies in deciphering whether the cultural object in question is kept for the preservation of the cultural heritage of all mankind, or for only those who have the resources to go experience the object. For cultural descendants requesting the return of artifacts, being alienated from their heritage and a greater understanding of themselves has no value. I do not see the Benin Bronzes or the Elgin Marbles as my own cultural heritage. I admire these objects for the evident artistry and craftsmanship that it took to produce such great works of art. Museums do not preserve the cultural heritage of mankind, as this cultural heritage is only being preserved by those who can access it. This is not a commitment to preserving the culture of mankind, but rather a commitment to preserving colonialist power over culture.

Conclusion

There is a broader cultural standard that must be preserved and protected for all of mankind: the commitment to equity and justice. This can be furthered through the progressive stewardship of museums, which promotes an ethical distribution of knowledge. A successful stewardship would require the consideration of three components: the historical context of acquisition and evidence of unjust ownership, the cultural lineage and continuity of descendant communities, and the balance of interests between museums and cultural descendants. Museums must also evaluate their roles in preserving the cultural integrity of cultural objects, and to assess their relationships to historical power dynamics. When these factors are considered, it becomes very clear that cultural descendants are entitled to the repatriation of their artifacts However, my argument falters on the identification of tracing descendants and providing legal grounds, rather than normative grounds, to prove that one party has more

of an interest in a cultural object than another party. My paper is primarily concerned with repatriation in relation to historical injustices, unfair power dynamics, and the preservation of cultural integrity. These do not make up the only instances in which museums should be required to repatriate cultural artifacts, but are simply instances that I identify as being the most controversial and significant to my argument. In looking forward, repatriation of appropriated or unjustly acquired cultural artifacts will be the responsibility of museums to properly uphold.

Acknowledgements

References

Appiah, K. A. (2006). "Whose Culture is it, Anyway", *Cosmopolitanism* (1st ed.). W. W. Norton & Company, Inc., 115-135.

Björnberg, K. E. (2014). Historic injustices and the moral case for cultural repatriation. *Ethical Theory and Moral Practice*, *18*(3), 461–474. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10677-014-9530-z

Cuno, J. (2001)."Museums and the Acquisition of Antiquities", *Cardozo Arts & Entertainment Law Journal*, 19(1): 85

Eaton, A. W., & Gaskell, I. (2009). Do Subaltern Artifacts Belong in Art Museums? *The Ethics of Cultural Appropriation*, 235–267. https://doi.org/10.1002/9781444311099.ch10

Harding, Sarah (1997). "Justifying Repatriation of Native American Cultural Property," *Indiana Law Journal*: Vol. 72: Iss. 3, Article 4.

Matthes, E. H. (2018). *The Ethics of Cultural Heritage (Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy/Summer 2024 Edition)*. https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/sum2024/entries/ethics-cultural-heritage/

Matthes, E. H. (2017). Repatriation and the radical redistribution of art. *Ergo an Open Access Journal of Philosophy*, *4*(20201214). https://doi.org/10.3998/ergo.12405314.0004.032

Merryman, J. H. (1985). Thinking about the Elgin Marbles. *Michigan Law Review*, *83*(8), 1881–1923. https://doi.org/10.2307/1288954

Nafziger, J. A., & Nicgorski, A. M. (2009). Cultural Heritage Issues: the legacy of conquest, colonization and commerce. In *Brill | Nijhoff eBooks*. https://brill.com/content/books/9789004189928

Simpson, M. (2009). Museums and restorative justice: heritage, repatriation and cultural education. *Museum International*, *61*(1–2), 121–129. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-0033.2009.01669.x

Thompson, J. (2001). Historical injustice and reparation: Justifying claims of descendants. *Ethics*, *112*(1), 114–135. https://doi.org/10.1086/339139

Ypi, Lea (2017). Structural Injustice and the Place of Attachment. Journal of Practical Ethics (1):1-21.

Change (Or the Lack Thereof)

Eliana Wowak

Departments of English & Comparative Literature & French

There is a slight
stickiness
in the atmosphere
that, when persists for too long,
becomes suffocating.

It is always present —
lingering heavier in certain places
and slowly dissipating in others,
but it never fully resolves itself.

It has a specific scent
of lemon hand lotion,
worn dryer sheets,
and expired perfume.

Every window could be open,
yet no breeze could
wipe away its presence —
so, it continues to cling
like a stubborn adhesive
not yet ready to be dissolved.

But how can we blame it?

It is confused
and desperate to find
a way to belong.

Shouldn't we instead
blame the fingers
that pry and peel
at the residue it attempts
to leave behind —

For no good reason?

- Change (Or the Lack Thereof)

Acknowledgements

Back Issues of *Splice* are available via the SDSU Press online bookstore at Amazon.com.

Results

Check each product page for other buying options.

Splice, the Journal of Undergraduate Research in SDSU's College of Arts and Letters (Spring 2024, Volume 7)
by Editor-in-Chief Melanie Hussey
Paperback
$15⁹⁵ List: $16.95
You Earn: 16 pts
$3.99 delivery Thu, Jul 17
Or fastest delivery Wed, Jul 16
Add to cart

Splice, 6, Spring 2023, The Undergraduate Research Journal of the SDSU College of Arts and Letters
by Corina Enriquez & Cecilia Liefeld
Paperback
$12⁹⁵ List: $14.95
You Earn: 13 pts
$3.99 delivery Wed, Jul 16
Add to cart

Splice Volume 5, 2019, The Undergraduate Journal of the SDSU College of Arts and Letters
by Aliona Galkina, Calvin Forsythe, et al.
Paperback
$12⁹⁵
You Earn: 13 pts
$3.99 delivery Jul 17 - 18
Or fastest delivery Wed, Jul 16
Add to cart

See these volumes and other SDSU Press titles here, **https://amzn.to/3TZ3nZH** or use

SCAN ME

Splice

The Journal of Undergraduate Scholarship at SDSU College of Arts and Letters